

STATE LAW LIBRARY OF MONTANA

Joseph P. Mazurek Justice Building
215 North Sanders Street
PO Box 203004
Helena, MT 59620-3004



Website: courts.mt.gov/library
Email: mtlawlibrary@mt.gov
Phone: 406-444-3660
Fax: 406-444-3603

Montana Rules of Court

Title: Rules for the Disqualification and Substitution of Judges

Date of Last Amendment to these Rules: 01JUL2015

Administrative File Number for these Rules: AF 07-0289

Most, but not all, Montana Rules of Court are kept in Administrative Files (AF) by the Clerk of the Montana Supreme Court. If you are interested in the history or amendments made to court rules, you can reference the above file number and contact the Clerk's office at (406) 444-3858, or via mail at Justice Building, 215 N. Sanders, Room 323, P.O. Box 203003, Helena, Montana 59620-3003.

The rules provided on our website are for state courts in Montana. Please note that Montana courts may have their own local rules about procedure. You will need to research and apply those rules in certain circumstances. If you are in federal court, you will need to research and apply federal rules.

RULES FOR THE DISQUALIFICATION AND SUBSTITUTION OF JUDGES

Codified at Title 3, Ch. 1, Part 8, of the Montana Code Annotated

3-1-803. Disqualification of judges—all courts.

DISQUALIFICATION OF JUDGES

This section shall, in its application, apply to all courts listed in section 3-1-101 except a court of impeachment in the state senate.

Any justice, judge, justice of the peace, municipal court judge or city court judge must not sit or act in any action or proceeding:

1. To which he is a party, or in which he is interested.
2. When he is related to either party or any attorney or member of a firm of attorneys of record for a party by consanguinity or affinity within the third degree, computed according to the rules of law;
3. When he has been attorney or counsel in the action or proceeding for any party or when sitting in a case on appeal he as a judge in the lower court rendered or made the judgment, order, or decision appealed from.

3-1-804. Substitution of district judges.

SUBSTITUTION OF DISTRICT JUDGES

This section applies to judges presiding in district courts. It does not apply to any judge sitting as a water court judge, to a workers' compensation court judge, or to a judge supervising the distribution of water under 85-2-406, including supervising water commissioners under Title 85, chapter 5, part 1.

(1) Each adverse party is entitled to one substitution of a district judge.

(a) In a civil action other than those noted in subsection (1)(c), a motion for substitution by the party filing the action must be filed within 30 calendar days after the first summons is served or an adverse party has appeared. A motion for substitution by the party served must be filed within 30 calendar days after service has been completed in compliance with M. R. Civ. P. 4.

(b) In a criminal action, a motion for substitution by the prosecution or the defendant must be filed within 10 calendar days after the defendant's arraignment.

(c) A motion for substitution may not be filed in the following cases: a child abuse or neglect proceeding under Title 41, chapter 3; a youth court action proceeding under Title 41, chapter 5; or a mental health commitment proceeding under Title 53, chapter 21, part 1.

(2) (a) When an initial pleading is filed, the clerk of court shall stamp the name of the district judge to whom the case is assigned on the face of the original and all copies of that document.

(b) A motion for substitution of district judge must be made by filing a written motion with the clerk as follows:

The undersigned hereby moves for substitution of District Judge _____ in this case.

The moving party shall serve copies of the motion for substitution upon all other parties to the proceeding. The clerk shall immediately notify the district judge of the motion and, if there has already been a substitution, the first district judge to whom the case was assigned.

(3) In civil cases, the motion for substitution is not effective for any purpose unless the filing fee for a motion for substitution required by 25-1-201 is paid to the clerk of the district court.

In criminal cases, the motion for substitution is effective upon filing, except as otherwise provided herein for a motion filed by a defendant who is not represented by a public defender, as defined by 47-1-103.

In criminal cases filed by the county attorney, the county attorney shall pay the substitution motion fee required by 25-1-201 within 30 days of receipt of a claim from the clerk of district court. In criminal cases filed by the attorney general, the attorney general shall pay the substitution motion fee required by 25-1-201 within 30 days of receipt of a claim from the clerk of district court.

In criminal cases where the motion is filed by or on behalf of an indigent defendant, as defined by 47-1-103, represented by a public defender, as defined by 47-1-103, the office of public defender, as defined by 47-1-103, shall pay the substitution motion fee within 30 days of receipt of a claim from the clerk of district court. In criminal cases where the motion is filed by or on behalf of a defendant who is not represented by a public defender, as defined by 47-1-103, the motion for substitution is not effective for any purpose unless the substitution motion fee required by 25-1-201 is paid to the clerk of the district court except as waived pursuant to 25-10-404.

The substitution motion filing fee required by 25-1-201 is not a district court expense within the meaning of 3-5-901.

(4) Any motion for substitution that is not timely filed is void. The district judge for whom substitution is sought has jurisdiction to determine timeliness, and if the motion for substitution is untimely, shall enter an order denying the motion.

(5) After a timely motion has been filed, the substituted district judge does not have the power to act on the merits of the case or to decide legal issues in the case, except as provided in subsection (10).

(6) The first district judge who has been substituted or disqualified for cause has the duty of calling in all subsequent district judges. In a multijudge district, all other district judges in that district must be called before a district judge from another district is called.

(7) When a new district judge has accepted jurisdiction, the clerk of court shall provide a copy of the assumption of jurisdiction to the first district judge to whom the case was assigned and to each attorney or party of record. A certificate of service must be attached to the assumption of jurisdiction form in the court file.

(8) If the presiding judge in any action recuses himself or herself or if a new district judge assumes jurisdiction in any action, the right to move for substitution of a district judge is reinstated, except as to parties who have previously obtained a substitution. The time periods run anew from the date of service of notice or other document identifying the new district judge.

(9) No party who is joined or intervenes has any right of substitution after the time has run as to the original parties to proceed.

(10) A district judge who has previously been substituted from the case may agree to set the calendar, draw a jury, and conduct all routine matters including arraignments, preliminary pretrial conferences in civil cases, and other matters that do not address the merits of the case, if authorized by the presiding district judge.

(11) When a new trial is ordered by the district court, each adverse party shall be entitled to one motion for substitution of district judge. The motion must be filed, with the required filing fee, within 20 calendar days after the district court has ordered a new trial.

(12) When a judgment or order is reversed or modified on appeal and the cause is remanded to the district court for a new trial, or when a summary judgment or judgment of dismissal is reversed and the cause remanded, each adverse party is entitled to one motion for substitution of district judge. The motion must be filed, with the required filing fee, within 20 calendar days after the remittitur from the supreme court has been filed with the district court. There is no other right of substitution in cases remanded by the supreme court.

In criminal cases, there is no right of substitution when the cause is remanded for sentencing.

3-1-805. Disqualification for cause.

DISQUALIFICATION FOR CAUSE

This section is limited in its application to judges presiding in district courts, justice of the peace courts, municipal courts, small claims courts, and city courts.

1. Whenever a party to any proceeding in any court shall file an affidavit alleging facts showing personal bias or prejudice of the presiding judge, such judge shall proceed no further in the cause. If the affidavit is filed against a district judge, the matter shall be referred to the Montana Supreme Court. If the affidavit is in compliance with subsections (a), (b), and (c) below, the Chief Justice shall assign a district judge to hear the matter. If the affidavit is filed against a judge of a municipal court, justice court, or city court, any district judge presiding in the district of the court involved may appoint either a justice of the peace, a municipal judge or a city court judge, to hear any such proceeding.

(a) The affidavit for disqualification must be filed more than thirty (30) days before the date set for hearing or trial.

(b) The affidavit shall be accompanied by a certificate of counsel of record that the affidavit has been made in good faith. An affidavit will be deemed not to have been made in good faith if it is based solely on rulings in the case which can be addressed in an appeal from the final judgment.

(c) Any affidavit which is not in proper form and which does not allege facts showing personal bias or prejudice may be set aside as void.

(d) The judge appointed to preside at a disqualification proceeding may assess attorneys fees, costs and damages against any party or his attorney who files such disqualification without reasonable cause and thereby hinders, delays or takes unconscionable advantage of any other party, or the court.