LC 1213/01

House BILL NO. 647\_ 1 2 3

A BILL FOR AN ACT ENTITLED: "AN ACT TO ESTABLISH A 向 5 MANDATORY PRETRIAL REVIEW PAREL TO HEAR AND DETERMINE CLAIMS FOR MEDICAL LIABILITY: TO ESTABLISH RULES, FROCEDURES, AND б PACILITIES TO IMPLEMENT AND ACCOMPLISH THE POBPOSE OF THE 7 ACT: TO PROVIDE FOR A SCHIDULE OF COMPENSATION AND BENEFITS R FOR AWARDS: TO GUABANTEE THE FINANCIAL BESPONSIBILITY CF 9 HEALTH CARE PROVIDERS AND TO PROVIDE THE SOURCE FOR THE 10 FURDING OF THE ADMINISTRATION OF THE ACT AND THE PAYMENT CP 11 AWARDS: AND OTHERWISE AMENDING THE INSURANCE LAWS WITH 12 RESPECT TO SUCH PANEL: PROVIDING & DELAYED PPFECTIVE DATE." 13 14

15 BE IT EMACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HORTANA:

16 Section 1. Definitions. As used in this act, the17 following definitions apply:

18 (1) "Health care provider" means any physician
19 licensed to practice medicine in the state of Montana or a
20 hospital, hospital-related facility, or long-term care
21 facility.

(2) "Medical liability" means liability arising cut of
the injury or death of any person as the result of
negligence or breach of contract in the rendering of
professional services by a health care provider.

# INTRODUCED BILL

(3) "Professional liability insurer" means any company 1 2 authorized to do business in Montana or doing business in Bontana and offering policies of professional liability 3 insurance to bealth care providers and includes any а 5 insurance trust, joint underwriting association, mutual insurer, reciprocal insurer or any other entity or rerson 6 7 offering such liability coverage, including any state 8 insurance fund.

9 Section 2. Bstablishment of panel. 1 pretrial review
10 panel is created to review all medical liability claims,
11 except as provided in [section 5].

12 Section 3. Precondition to suit. No action for medical 13 liability against a health care provider may be commenced in 14 any court of this state before the claimant has filed his 15 claim with the secretary of the panel as herein provided and 16 a final decision on the claim is rendered by the panel, 17 unless otherwise provided herein.

18 Section 4. Tolling of statute of limitations. The 19 filing of the claim shall toll the applicable statute of 20 limitations to and including a period of 90 days following 21 the rendering of a final decision by the panel.

22 Section 5. Applicability of the act. The provisions of 23 this act are not applicable to any claim in which suit has 24 been filed in a district court of this state price to the 25 effective date of this act or if the claim is subject to a

LC 1213/01

-2-

HB147

1 valid arbitration agreement allowed by law.

Section 6. Creation of ranel — hearing ranels —
compensation — terms of service — method of selection. (1)
The pretrial review panel shall consist of 12 full-time
members.

6 (2) Six of the full-time members of the panel shall be
7 physicians licensed to practice in the state of Montana, and
8 six shall be attorneys licensed to practice in the state of
9 Montana.

10 (3) The panel is divided into two hearing panels, one
11 of which shall hear and determine each claim, and each one
12 of which shall be composed of three attorneys and three
13 physicians and chaired by an attorney.

14 (4) Full-time members of the panel are interchangeable
15 between the two hearing panels and shall be assigned to a
16 hearing panel on a claim-by-claim basis at the direction of
17 the secretary.

18 (5) At least two attorneys and two physicians shall be
19 necessary for a quorum for the transaction of any hearing or
20 the rendering of any decision required by this act to be
21 final.

22 (6) In a case involving a health care provider other
23 than a physician, a part-time panel member practicing the
24 same profession as involved in the claim shall sit on the
25 hearing panel in place of a physician. In any case involving

both a physician and a health care provider other than a
 physician, the representative of such other profession shall
 additionally sit on the hearing panel and shall be a
 part-time member.

5 (7) Each full-time member of the panel. except these 6 first appointed, shall hold office for 3 years and until his 7 successor is appointed and gualified. On or before January 1. 1978, and effective cp that date, the governor shall 8 9 appoint four members to a term of 1 year, four members to a 10 term of 2 years, and four members to a term of 3 years. Future appointments to fill expired terms shall be for a 11 12 period of 3 years.

13 (8) Appointment of attorney and physician members
14 shall be made by the governor from a list of three nominees
15 for each vacancy selected and nominated by the state bar of
16 Montana and the Montana medical association, respectively.

17 (9) The governor shall, with regard to any vacancy,
18 make his appointments from the lists as provided above
19 within 30 days following the day the position becomes
20 vacant.

21 Section 7. Removal of panel members — vacancies. (1)
22 Any member of the panel may be removed by the governor at
23 any time for incompetency, neglect of duty, misconduct in
24 office, or other good cause, which is to be stated in
25 writing in the order of removal.

- 3---

1 (2) In the case of a vacancy in the membership of the 2 panel, the governor shall appoint for the unexpired term 3 from nominees in the same manner as for original 4 appointments.

5 Section 8. Compensation of the panel and staff — 6 facilities for offices and hearings. (1) All full-time 7 members of the panel shall be paid a salary in the amount of 8 \$35 an hour, under guidelines promulgated by the secretary. 9 Part-time members shall be paid a salary equal to that 10 allowed to members of the Hontana legislature while the 11 legislature is in session.

12 (2) All members of the panel and its assistants are
13 entitled to receive their actual and necessary expenses
14 while traveling on the business of the panel. Expenses shall
15 be approved by the secretary of the panel before payment is
16 made.

17 (3) The panel shall appoint a secretary and may remove
18 such secretary. The secretary shall administer caths,
19 receive claims filed, promulgate forms required bereunder,
20 issue subpoenas in connection with the administration of
21 this act, and perform all other duties required to fairly
22 and effectively administer this act.

(4) The panel, subject to the approval of the
governor, may employ and fix the compensation of such
clerical and other assistants as it may consider necessary.

1 (5) The panel shall provide itself with adequate 2 offices in the city of Belena, in which the records shall be 3 kept and its official business be transacted. It shall also 4 provide the necessary office furniture, stationery, and 5 other supplies.

6 (6) Panel hearings shall be conducted in the county 7 where the injury allegedly occurred but may, within the 8 sound discretion of the hearing panel, be held in any other 9 county if the panel considers it necessary or advisable. The 10 county commissioners or other governing authority shall 11 provide, upon the request of the secretary of the panel, 12 suitable facilities for any such hearing.

13 Section 9. Notice — how served. Notice of all 14 hearings, orders, determinations, and proceedings of the 15 hearing panels required by this act to be served, shall be 16 given by certified mail, return receipt requested, at the 17 last known address of the person to be so served.

18 Section 10. Evidence to be considered. (1) Unless 19 directed otherwise by the hearing panel, the evidence to be 20 considered by a hearing panel must be submitted by the 21 respective parties in documentary form only. The evidence 22 may consist of medical charts, x-rays, laboratory tests, 23 depositions of witnesses, and any other form of evidence 24 allowable by the hearing panel.

25 (2) All parties shall be allowed to use any discovery

LC 1213/01

-5-

### LC 1213/01

1 procedure provided for by the Bontana rules of civil 2 procedure, and in the manner provided for therein. Depositions may be introduced into evidence without regard 3 a. to the availability of the witness to testify. Discovery as 5 to expert witnesses is not admissible unless such expert 6 witness was in practice in the same or a similar community 7 in the state of Montana, in the same profession, and at the 8 same time as the alleged incident occurred as the health 9 care provider whose standard of care is at issue.

10 (3) Any motion for relief arising out of the use of
11 such discovery procedures shall be decided by the chairman
12 of the hearing panel, who may in his discretion make
13 reasonable limitations on the extent and scope of discovery.

14 Section 11. Hearings and final determinations. (1) The 15 secretary shall, with the advice and cooperation of the parties and the bearing ranels, fix the date and time for 16 17 all hearings on claims before a hearing panel. A final 18 decision on each claim shall be made within 120 days of the 19 date the claim is filed with the secretary, unless for good 20 cause shown, upon order of the chairman of a hearing panel, 21 such time is extended.

(2) If a final decision on a claim is not made within
10 months of the date the claim is filed, the jurisdiction
of the panel on the subject matter shall terminate and the
parties may proceed in accordance with the law.

1 Section 12. Law and rules applicable -- powers of the 2 panel. (1) Except as provided in this act, the panel will be 3 bound by the common and statutory law and by the Sontana 11 rules of civil procedure but will conduct hearings and make 5 all determinations as in its judgment are best adapted to 6 ascertain and determine the rights of the parties 7 expeditionsly and accurately to carry out justly the spirit ß of this act.

9 (2) The panel may:

10 (a) adopt rules to carry out the provisions of this11 act;

12 (b) prescribe the means, methods, and practices
13 necessary to effectuate such provisions;

14 (c) approve settlement agreements on claims of medical15 liability;

16 (d) order physical examinations;

(e) apply to any district court baying requisite
jurisdiction to enforce the production and examination of
books, papers, and records; and

(f) exercise all other powers and duties conferred
upon the panel hereafter by law or provided in this act.

(3) The panel may, upon the application of either
party or upon its own motion, appoint a disinterested and
qualified physician or other professional person or expert
to make necessary professional or expert examination of the

-8-

LC 1213/01

-7-

claimant or relevant ewidentiary matter and to report in
 writing in respect thereto.

3 (4) The panel may subpoena any witness to testify 4 pursuant to the rules appropriate to civil actions with 5 respect to parties to a controversy and may apply to any 6 district court of this state for enforcement of such 7 subpoenas.

8 Section 13. Votes of hearing panel. A majority vote of 9 those present at a hearing panel is sufficient to make any 10 determination. The chairman of a hearing panel may vote only 11 to break a tie vote of the hearing panel.

12 Section 14. Compensation for medical liability. The 13 claim shall be heard as one for compensation for medical 14 liability. The hearing panel shall review the evidence 15 submitted and hear any testimony to be elicited with 16 reasonable dispatch and shall make one of the following 17 determinations, which determination shall be sent to the 18 parties:

19 (1) The evidence supports the conclusion that the 20 defendant or defendants failed to comply with the 21 appropriate standard of care as charged in the complaint and 22 that the conduct complained of was a substantial factor of 23 any resultant damage.

24 (2) The evidence supports the conclusion that the25 defendant or defendants failed to comply with the

appropriate standard of care as charged in the complaint but
 that the conduct complained of was not a substantial factor
 of any resultant damage.

4 (3) The evidence does not support the conclusion that 5 the defendant or defendants failed to meet the applicable 6 standard of care as charged in the complaint.

7 Section 15. Award schedule for medical liability. (1) 8 If the determination of the hearing panel is that the 9 evidence supports the conclusion that the defendant or 10 defendants failed to comply with the appropriate standard of care as charged in the complaint and that the conduct 11 12 complained of was a substantial factor of any resultant 13 damage, then the hearing papel shall make a final award 14 within the following limits as to the nature of the award 15 but without limit as to amount:

16 (a) For death of a winor without dependents, the 17 compensation recoverable shall be the reasonable value of 18 the minor's services to his parents or legal guardian, 19 during minority, less the reasonable cost of the maintenance of the minor, which compensation shall inure to the 20 21 exclusive benefit of the parent or quardian, plus any reasonable medical, hospital, funeral, burial, cr related 22 expense. The sole right to institute the claim or claims 23 24 provided for in this subsection is in the personal representative of the deceased, for the exclusive benefit 25

-9-

1 cf:

4

2 (i) such parent or parents or legal guardian; and
3 (ii) the persons incurring such medical, hospital,

funeral, burial, and related expense.

(b) For death of an adult without dependents, the 5 compensation recoverable shall be the reasonable value of 6 7 all hospital, medical, cr other related expense rlus the reasonable cost of funeral and burial, plus as amount which 8 9 the hearing panel may determine reasonable for the cost of 10 prosecuting the claim. The sole right to institute the claim 11 under this subsection is in the personal .representative of the deceased for the exclusive benefit of those incurring 12 13 such expense.

14 (c) For the death of a minor or adult with dependents, 15 the compensation recoverable may include the actual or 16 prespective less of earnings for the working life expectancy 17 of such deceased less the reasonable cost of the maintenance 18 of the deceased, plus the reasonable cost of the deceased's 19 medical, hospital, funeral, and burial expense, plus an amount the hearing panel may determine reasonable for the 20 21 cost of prosecuting such claim. The sole right to institute 22 the claim provided for in this subsection is in the personal 23 representative of the deceased dependents and for those 24 incurring such expense.

25

(d) For bodily injury to an adult or minor not

resulting in death, the hearing panel may allow for any 1 2 injury or damage, general or special, allowed by law, 3 including loss of earnings to be based on the work £1 expectancy of the claimant without regard to his injured 5 condition: the reasonable medical, hospital, and related expense, past, present, and future; and pain and suffering, 6 7 past, present, and future. Provided, however, that all я damages for pain and suffering must have a basis in the 9 evidence submitted to support the claim thereof, in a fair 10 and reasonable amount, free from sentiment and taking into 11 account the nature and extent of the injuries and the 12 suffering occasioned by them, the duration and prospective duration thereof, the age, health, habits, and condition of 13 the injured party before the injury as compared with his 14 15 condition in consequence thereof. Future pain and suffering may be awarded only to the extent that there is 16 17 requisite certainty or probability that such gain and suffering will result from the injury received based upon 18 the claimant's life expectancy in his injured condition. 19

20 (2) The compensation and benefits awarded by this act
21 shall be reduced by any collateral source of compensation
22 benefits as provided by law.

23 Section 16. Payment of awards. The hearing panel shall
 24 order all payments of future damages as provided by law.

25 Section 17. Award and taxing of costs. In all

-12-

proceedings before the hearing panels, the costs shall be awarded and taxed as provided by law in ordinary civil actions, with the exception that if, in the cpinich of the hearing panel, a claim for medical liability was filed without probable cause for the claimant to believe he was legally entitled to relief, then the cost shall include the cost of defense, including a reasonable attorney's fee.

8 Section 18. Claims not assignable — exempt from
9 creditors' claims. No claims for compensation under this act
10 may be assignable, and all compensation and claims therefor
11 shall be exempt from all claims of creditors, assignees, or
12 subrogees.

Section 19. Designation of parties -- joinder of 13 parties -- separate hearings. The person filing the claim is 14 the claimant, and the adverse party or parties is the 15 respondent or respondents. The rules for joinder of parties 16 are as otherwise allowed by law. The hearing panel may make 17 18 orders to prevent a party from being embarrassed, delayed, 19 or put to expense by the inclusion of farties against him 20 and may order separate hearings or make other orders to 21 prevent delay or prejudice.

Section 20. Filing and service of claims. All claims shall be filed on forms provided by the secretary. The claimant must attach to the forms the proposed complaint, which shall be prepared and served upon the health care providers named therein by the claimant, in the same manner
 and form provided by law for civil actions. The summens
 shall conform to the requirements of the panel. The
 secretary shall notify concerned health care providers.

5 Section 21. Additional pleadings. All health care 6 providers served with a proposed complaint shall, within 20 7 days from the date of service thereof, answer in the form 8 and manner provided by law for civil actions. Any health 9 care provider who fails to so answer is subject to liability 10 under the law without regard to the provisions of this act. 11 There may be no other pleadings.

12 Section 22. Attorney fees. The amount of attorney fees 13 to be paid shall be included in the record of the trial and shall be paid to the attorney by the respondent or his 14 insurer in addition to any award made to the claimant. If 15 16 the respondent is awarded attorney fees, the amount shall be 17 included in the record of the trial. The district court in 18 the county in which the claim is heard shall, at the request 19 of any party, determine the reasonableness of each party's attorney fees ordered paid by the other party. The court 20 21 shall take into consideration the following:

(1) the time and labor required, the novelty and
difficulty of the questions involved, and the skill
requisite to perform the legal services properly;

25 (2) the likelihood, if apparent to the client, that

-13-

- 14-

the acceptance of the particular employment would have
 precluded other employment by the attorney;

3 (3) the fee customarily charged in the locality for
4 similar legal services;

5 (4) the amount involved and the results obtained;

6 (5) the time limitations imposed by the client or by7 other circumstances;

8 (6) the nature and length of the professional9 relationship with the attorney and client; and

10 (7) the experience, reputation, and ability of the11 attorney performing the services.

12 Section 23. Proof of financial responsibility —
13 insurance, cash or surety bond. (1) Each health care
14 provider subject to the terms of this act shall, within 30
15 days after this act takes effect, file with the secretary,
16 in a manner prescribed thereby, proof of financial
17 responsibility.

18 (2) Each health care provider, excert as provided by 19 [section 24] shall acquire and maintain in force 20 professional liability insurance of not less than \$250,000 for each occurrence and \$500,000 in the aggregate for all 21 claims occurring in any one policy year or, as an 22 23 alternative, qualify as a self-insurer upon making proper application and being approved by the commissioner of 24 25 insurance.

1 (3) Self-insurance subject to approval by the 2 commissioner of insurance is effected by filing with the 3 commissioner in satisfactory form:

4 (a) a continued undertaking by the health care 5 provider to pay any award rendered under this act, except as 6 provided by [section 24], to the first \$250,000 for each 7 incident and to \$500,000 in the aggregate for all claims 8 occurring in any one year; and

9 (b) evidence that appropriate provision exists for
10 prompt and efficient administration of all claims; and

(c) evidence that reliable financial arrangements,
deposits, or commitments exist providing coverage
substantially equivalent to that afforded by a policy of
insurance required in subsection (2) of this section for the
payment of medical liability claims.

Section 24. Failure to provide proof of financial responsibility -- failure or refusal to accept panel determination. (1) A health care provider is subject to liability under the laws of this state with respect to a claim, without regard to the provisions of this act, except as provided in [section 26] if he fails or refuses to:

22 (a) provide proof of financial responsibility as23 provided in [section 23];

24 (b) pay the annual assessment provided for in [section

25 26], in a manner and amount fixed by the secretary; or

# STATE OF MONTANA

REQUEST NO. 357-77

# FISCAL NOTE

Form BD-15

In compliance with a written request received <u>February 3</u>, 19 77, there is hereby submitted a Fiscal Note to: <u>House Bill 647</u>, pursuant to Chapter 53, Laws of Montana, 1965 - Thirty-Ninth Legislative Assembly. Background information used in developing this Fiscal Note is available from the Office of Budget and Program Planning, to members

of the Legislature upon request.

# DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSED LEGISLATION:

House Bill 647 proposes to establish a mandatory pretrial review panel to hear and determine claims for medical liability, to establish rules, procedures and facilities to implement and accomplish the purpose of the act, to provide for a schedule of compensation and benefits for awards, to guarantee the financial responsibility of health care providers and to provide the source for the funding of the administration of the act and the payment of awards.

### ASSUMPTIONS:

1. Each six member review panel will hear approximately twenty medical malpractice claims per year.

- 2. The hearing on each claim will take approximately four days on the average.
- 3. Each panel member will spend approximately 640 hours per year hearing claims.
- 4. The twelve-man pretrial review panel will meet as a single group at least five days a year for initial discussions, rule-making, and general business meetings which adds an additional 480 man hours to its workload.
- 5. The full-time executive secretary would be classified at approximately Grade 17.
- 6. Two full-time legal secretaries would be required at approximately Grade 8 each.

## FISCAL IMPACT:

Revenue: Funding for the administration of this act is to be provided by an assessment to each health care provider.

Expenditure:		<u>FY 78</u>	<u>FY 79</u>
	Personal services	\$325,559	\$326,390
	Operating expenses	67,100	73,450
	Capital outlay	11,000	2,500
Additional cost	of proposed legislation	<u>\$403,659</u>	\$402,340

# TECHNICAL NOTE:

Medical malpractice review board is not attached to any state agency, nor does it appear to constitute the 20th department of state government under the Executive Reorganization Act.

L. atren

BUDGET DIRECTOR Office of Budget and Program Planning Date: 2-5-7

#### 45th Legislature

H8 0647/02

### Approved by Committee on Judiciary

 HOUSE all NO+ 647

 2
 INTRODUCED BY SCULLY

3

A BILL FOR AN ACT ENTITLED: MAN ACT TO ESTABLISH A 4 MANDATORY PRETRIAL REVIEW PANEL TO HEAR AND DETERMINE CLAIMS > 6 FOR REDICAL LIABILITY: TO ESTABLISH RULES, PROCEDURES, AND 1 FACILITIES TO IMPLEMENT AND ACCOMPLISH THE PURPOSE OF THE ACT: TH-PROVIDE-FOR-A-SCHEDULE-OF-COMPENSATION-AND-BENEFITS В FUR-AWARDS+-TO-GUARANTEE--THE--FINANCIAL--RESPONSIBILITY--OF 9 HEALTH--CARE--PROVIDERS TO REQUIRE PROFESSIONAL LIABILITY 10 INSURANCE FOR HEALTH CARE PROVIDERS: AND TO PROVIDE THE 11 SOURCE FOR THE FUNDING OF THE ADMINISTRATION OF THE ACT AND 12 Ъđ 'FHE-PAYHENT-BF-ANARDSt-AND-BTHERWISE-AMENDING-THE-INSURANCE LAWS--WETH--RESPECT--TH--SUCH--PANEL: PROVIDING & DELAYED 14 EFFECTIVE DATE." 15

15

173E IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF MONTANA:1dSection 1. Definitions. As used in this act, the

19 following definitions apply:

(1) "Health care provider" means any physician
 licensed to practice medicine in the state of Montana or a
 hospital, hospital-related facility, or long-term care
 facility.

24 {2} "Medical liability" means liability arising out of25 the injury or death of any person as the result of

negligence or breach of contract in the rendering of
 professional services by a health care provider.

3 (3) "Professional liability insurer" means any company 4 authorized to do business in Montana or doing business in 5 Montana and offering policies of professional liability insurance to health care providers and includes any 6 7 insurance trust, joint underwriting association, mutual insurer, reciprocal insurer or any other entity or person B 4 offering such liability coverage, including any state 10 insurance fund.

Section 2. Establishment of panel. A pretrial review
 panel is created to review all medical liability claims,
 except as provided in [section 5].

Section 3. Precondition to suit. No action for medical liability against a health care provider may be commenced in any court of this state before the claimant has filed his claim with the secretary of the panel as herein provided and a final decision on the claim is rendered by the panel, unless otherwise provided herein. Section 4. Tolling of statute of limitations. The

21 filing of the claim shall toll the applicable statute of 22 limitations to and including a period of 90 days following 23 the rendering of a final decision by the panel. 24 Section 5. Applicability of the act. The provisions of

25 this act are not applicable to any claim in which suit has

SECOND READING

HB 0647/02

-2-

### H8 0647/02

1	been filed in a district court of this state prior to the
2	effective date of this act or if the claim is subject to a
3	valid arbitration agreement allowed by law.
4	Section 6. Creation of panel hearing-panels
5	compensationtermsofservicemethod-of-selection=
6	<u>{1}-The-pretrial-review-panel-shall-consist-of-12full-time</u>
7	間e時ber3 w
8	<del>{2}Six-of-the-full-time-members-of-the-panel-shall-be</del>
3	physicians-licensed-to-practice-in-the-state-of-Montonay-and
10	sixsnall-be-attorneys-licensed-to-practice-in-the-state-of
11	Hontener
12	<del>(3)The-panel-is-divided-into-two-hearing-panalsyone</del>
13	ofwhichshall-hear-and-determine-each-claimy-and-each-one
14	of-which-shall-be-composedofthreeattorneysandthree
15	p <del>hysicians-and-chaired-by-an-attorney</del>
16	(4)Full-time-members-of-the-panel-are-interchangeable
17	betweenthetwohearing-panels-and-shall-be-assigned-to-a
18	hearing-panel-on-a-claim-by-claim-basis-atthe-direction-of
19	tne-secretary.
20	<del>(5)At-least-two-sttorneys-and-two-physicians-shall-be</del>
21	necessary-for-a-quorum-for-the-transaction-of-any-hearing-or
22	the-rendering-of-any-decision-required-bythisacttobe
23	findle
24	( <del>5]Inacase-involvi</del> ng-a-health-care-provider-other
25	thon-s-physiciony-s-part-time-ponsimemberpracticingthe
	-3- HB 647

1	sameprofessionasinvolved-in-the-claim-shall-sit-on-the
2	hearing-panel-in-place-of-a-physicianw-In-any-case-involving
3	both-a-physician-and-a-health-careproviderotherthana
4	physiciany-the-representative-of-such-other-profession-sholl
5	additionallysitonthehearingpanelandshallbe-a
6	part-time-member.
7	<del>(7)Each-full-time-member-of-the-panelyexceptthose</del>
8	f <del>irst-appointedy-shall-hold-office-for-3-yeors-and-until-his</del>
9	successoris-appointed-and-qualifiedsOn-or-before-January
10	<del>ly-1978y-and-effective-onthatdateythe</del> go <del>vernorshall</del>
11	<del>appointfour-members-to-a-term-of-l-yeary-four-members-to-a</del>
12	term-of-2-yearsy-and-four-members-toatermof3yearsy
13	<del>Futureappointmentstofillexpired-term3-shall-be-for-</del> a
14	<del>period-of-3-yesrs.</del>
15	<del>(8)Appointmentofattorneyandphysicianmembers</del>
16	<del>shallbe-made-by-the-governor-from-a-list-of-three-nominees</del>
17	for-each-vacancy-selected-and-nominated-by-the-state-barof
18	Hontana-and-the-Hontana-medical-associationy-respectively*
19	<del>{9}Thegovernarshallywith-regar</del> d-to- <del>any-vacancys</del>
20	moke-his-appointmentsfromthelistsosprovidedabove
21	within30daysfollowingthedaytheposition-becomes
22	vocente MEIHOD OF SELECIION HEARINGS. (1) THE PREIRIAL
23	REVIEW PANEL CONSISTS OF THREE PHYSICIANS LICENSED TO
24	PRACTICE IN MONTANA AND THREE ATTORNEYS LICENSED TO PRACTICE
25	IN. MONIANA.

-4-

1	(2) THE ATTORNEY MEMBERS SHALL BE APPOINTED BY THE
2	STATE_BAR_OF_MONTANA_ANO_IHE_PHYSICIAN_MEMBERS_BY_THE
٤	MUNIAVA_MEDICAL_ASSOCIATION.
4	(3) IHE IHREE ATTORNEY MEMBERS SHALL SELECT ONE OF
5	Ideir Number as Chairman of The Panel.
'n	(4) PANEL MEMBERS SHALL BE APPOINTED WITHIN 30 DAYS
7	ATTER RECEIPT BY THE RESPECTIVE ASSOCIATIONS OF A CLAIM FOR
đ	REVIEN PANEL MEMBERS SHALL SERVE UNTIL THE PANEL HAS
A	CUMMUNICATED_ITS_DETERMENATION_TO_THE_PARTIESINVOLVEDAND
10	APPROVED ANY SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT OR DETERMINED THAT
n	SETTLEMENT_DISCUSSIONS_HAVE_OR_SHOULD_BE_TERMINATED*
12	(5) <u>A PANEL MEMBER SHALL DISQUALIEX HIMSELE FROM</u>
13	CONSIDE BAILON OF ANY CASE IN WHICH THE MEMBER DETERMINES HIS
14	PRESENCE HOULD BE INAPPROPRIATE. THE SECRETARY MAY EXCUSE
15	AN APPOINTED PANELIST FROM SERVING.
16	(6) AT LEAST THO ATTORNEYS AND INC. PHYSICIANS ARE
17	NECESSARY EDR A QUORUM FOR HOLDING A HEARING OR RENDERING A
18	EINAL DECISION UNDER THIS ACT.
17	<u>(1) IN A CASE INVOLVING A HEALTH CARE PROVIDER OTHES</u>
20	Idan_a_PHYSICIANS_A_PANEL_MENBER_PBACTICING_INE_SAME
21	PROFESSION AS INVOLVED IN THE CLAIM SHALL SIT ON THE PANEL
22	IN PLACE OF A PHYSICIAN. IN A CASE INVOLVING A PHYSICIAN AND
23	AHEALTHCAREPROVIDEROTHERIHANAPHYSICIANA
24	KEPSESENTATIVE_PRACTICING_THE_SAME_PROFESSION_AS_THEHEALTH
25	CARE PROVIDER INVOLVED SHALL SIT ON THE PANEL IN ADDITION TO
	-5- HB 647

1	THE SIX REGULAR MEMBERS. SUCH ADDITIONAL MEMBER SHALL BE
2	APPOINTED BY THE PANEL HENBERS.
3	5ection-7wRemoval-of-panel-membersvacanciesw(1)
4	*ny-member-of-the-panel-may-be-removed-bythegovernor-at
5	anytimeforincompetencyy-neglect-of-dutyy-misconduct-in
6	officey-or-other-goodcauseywhichistobestatedin
7	writing-in-the-order-of-removalw
6	t²}Inthe-case-of-a-vocancy-in-the-membership-of-the
9	panely-the-governor-shall-appointfortheunexpiredterm
10	fromnomineesinthesomemannerasfororiginal
11	appointments.
12	Section 7. Compensation of the panel and staff
13	tacilities for offices and hearings. (1) All <del>full-time</del>
14	members of the panel shall be paid a salary in the amount of
15	\$35 an hour, under guidelines promulgated by the secretary.
16	Part-timemembersshall-bepaida-salary-equal-to-that
17	allowed-to-members-oftheKontanalegislaturewhilethe
ld	<del>legislature-is-in-session.</del>
19	(2) All members of the panel and its assistants are
20	entitled to receive their actual and nacessary expenses
21	while traveling on the business of the panel. Expenses shall
22	be approved by the secretary of the panel before payment is
23	made•
24	(3) The panel-shall-appoint <u>DIRECION_OF_IME_MONIANA</u>
25	MEDICAL ASSOCIATION SHALL APPOINT AND SET THE SALARY OF a

-6-

H3 647

secretary and may remove such secretary. The secretary
 shall administer oaths, receive claims filed, promulgate
 forms required hereunder, issue subpoenas in connection with
 the administration of this act, and perform all other duties
 required to fairly and effectively administer this act.

(4) The panely--subject--to--the-approval---of---the
 governory <u>SECRETARY</u> may employ and fix the compensation of
 such clerical and other assistants as it may consider
 necessary.

10 (5) The panel SECRETARY shall provide--itself-with 11 <u>OBTAIN\_ON\_BEHALE\_OF\_THE\_PRETRIAL\_REVIEN\_PANEL</u> adequate 12 offices in the city of Helena, in which the records shall be 13 kept and its official business be transacted—it AND shall 14 also provide the necessary office furniture, stationery, and 15 other supplies.

16 (6) Panel hearings shall be conducted in the county 17 where the injury allegedly occurred but may, within the 18 sound discretion of the hearing panel, be held in any other 19 county if the panel considers it necessary or advisable. The 20 county commissioners or other governing authority shall 21 provide, upon the request of the secretary of the panel, 22 suitable facilities for any such hearing.

Section 8. Notice -- how served. Notice of all
 hearings, orders, determinations, and proceedings of the
 hearing penels PANELs required by this act to be served,

-7-

H6 647

shall be given by certified mail, return receipt requested,
 at the last known address of the person to be so served.

Section 9. Evidence to be considered. (1) Unless directed otherwise by the hearing panel, the evidence to be considered by a hearing panel must be submitted by the respective parties in documentary form only. The evidence may consist of medical charts, x-rays, laboratory tests, depositions of witnesses, and any other form of evidence allowable by the hearing panel.

10 (2) All parties shall be allowed to use any discovery 11 procedure provided for by the Montana rules of civil procedure, and in the manner provided for therein. 12 Depositions way be introduced into evidence without regard 13 to the availability of the witness to testify. Discovery-as 14 to-expert-witnesses-is-not--admissible--unless--such--expert 15 witness--wes--in-prectice-in-the-some-or-s-similar-community 15 17 in-the-state-of-Montanay-in-the-same-professiony-and-at--the same--time--as--the--alleged-incident-occurred-as-the-health 18 19 cere-provider-whose-standard-of-care-is-at-issuer 20 (3) Any motion for relief arising out of the use of

21 such discovery procedures shall be decided by the chairman 22 of the hearing panel, who may in his discretion make 23 reasonable limitations on the extent and scope of discovery. 24 Section 10. Hearings and final determinations. (1) The 25 secretary shall, with the advice and cooperation of the

-8-

BS 647

HB 0647/02

H5 647

parties and the hearing panels PANEL, fix the date and time for all hearings on claims before a hearing panel. A final decision on each claim shall be made within 120 days of the date the claim is filed with the secretary, unless for good cause shown, upon order of the chairman of a hearing panel, such time is extended.

(2) If a final decision on a claim is not made within
 B 10 months of the date the claim is filed, the jurisdiction
 9 of the panel on the subject matter shall terminate and the
 10 parties may proceed in accordance with the law.

Section 11. Law and rules applicable - powers of the 11 panel. (1) Except as provided in this act, the panel will be 12 bound by the common and statutory law and by the Montana 13 rules of civil procedure but will SHALL conduct INFORMAL 14 hearings and make all determinations as in its judgment are 15 best adapted to ascertain and determine the rights of the 15 parties expeditiously and accurately to carry out justly the 17 spirit of this act. 10

19 (2) The panel SECRETARY. SUBJECT\_TO THE APPROVAL OF
20 INE SUPREME COURT: may:

(a) adopt rules to carry out the provisions of this
 act; ANQ

(b) prescribe the means, methods, and practices
 necessary to effectuate such provisions;

25 (3) THE PANEL MAY:

-9-

1 tc)[A] approve settlement agreements on claims of 2 medical liability;

3 (d)(b) order physical examinations;

4 (e)(<u>i</u>) apply to any district court having requisite
5 jurisdiction to enforce the production and examination of
books, papers, and records; and

7 (ff)(D) exercise all other powers and duties conferred
8 upon the panel hereafter by law or provided in this act.

9 (3)(4) The panel may, upon the application of either 10 party or upon its own motion, appoint a disinterested and 11 qualified physician or other professional person or expert 12 to make necessary professional or expert examination of the 13 claimant or relevant evidentiary matter and to report in 14 writing in respect thereto.

15 <u>(4)(5)</u> The panel may subpoend any witness to testify 16 pursuant to the rules appropriate to civil actions with 17 respect to carties to a controversy and may apply to any 18 district court of this state for enforcement of such 19 subpoends.

Section 12. Votes of hearing panel. A majority vote of
 those present at a hearing panel is sufficient to make any
 determination. The-chairman-of-s-hearing-panel-may-vote-only
 to-break-a-tic-vote-of-the-hearing-panel\*

24 Section 13. Compensation for medical liability. The 25 claim shall be heard as one for compensation for medical

-10-

#### HE 0647/02

liability. The hearing panel shall review the evidence
 submitted and hear any testimony to be elicited with
 reasonable dispatch and shall make one of the following
 determinations, which determination shall be sent to the
 parties:

6 (1) The evidence supports the conclusion that the 7 defendant--or-defendants RESPONDENT\_OR\_RESPONDENTS failed to comply with the appropriate standard of care as charged in 8 9 the complaint and that the conduct complained of was a substantial-factor PROXIMALE CAUSE of any resultant damage. 10 (2) The evidence supports the conclusion that the 11 12 defendant-or-defendants <u>RESPONDENT OR RESPONDENTS</u> failed to 13 comply with the appropriate standard of care as charged in 14 the complaint but that the conduct complained of was not a 15 substantial--factor PROXIMATE CAUSE of any resultant damage. 15 (3) The evidence does not support the conclusion that the defendant-or-defendants <u>RESPONDENT OR RESPONDENTS</u> failed 17 to meet the applicable standard of care as charged in the 18 compleint. 19

20 Section 14. Award schedule for medical liability. (1) 21 If the determination of the hearing panel is that the 22 evidence supports the conclusion that the defendant--or 23 defendants <u>RESPONDENT</u> OR <u>RESPONDENTS</u> failed to comply with 24 the appropriate standard of care as charged in the complaint 25 and that the conduct complained of was a substantial--factor

-11-

Hb 647

H5 0647/02

1	ofanyresultant <u>PROXIMATE CAUSE OF ANY</u> damage, then the
2	hearing panel <del>shall-make-a-final-award-within-thefollowing</del>
E	<del>limits-as-to-the-noture-of-the-award-but-without-limit-as-to</del>
4	anount: MAY_RECOMMEND_AN_AWARD_AND_APPROVE_SETTLEMENT
5	AGREEMENTS. ALL APPROVED SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS ARE FINAL AND
6	BINDING ON ALL PARTIES THERETO.
1	<del>(a)for-deathofm-minorwithoutdependentsythe</del>
8	compensationrecoverableshallbe-the-reasonable-value-of
9	the-minor*s-servicestohisparentsorlegalguardiany
10	during-minorityy-less-tne-reasonable-cost-of-the-maintenance
11	oftheminorywhichcompensationshallinuretothe
12	exclusive-benefit-oftheparentorguardianyplusany
13	reasonablemedicalyhospitalyfuneraly-burialy-or-related
14	expenses-The-sole-right-to-institutetheclaimorclaims
15	providedforinthissubsectionisinthepersonal
15	rspresentative-of-the-deceasedy-fortheexclusivebenefit
17	of+
18	(+)such-parent-or-parents-or-legal-quardiant-and
19	<del>{ii}-thepersonsincurringsuchmedicalyhospitaly</del>
20	funeraly-burisly-and-related-expenses
21	<del>{}}For-death-ofenadultwithoutdependentsythe</del>
22	compensationrecoverableshall-be-the-reasonable-value-of
23	all-ho <del>spitaly-medicaly-or-otherrelatedexpenseplusthe</del>
24	rensonablecost-of-funeral-and-burialy-plus-an-amount-which
25	the-hearing-panel-may-determine-reasonable-for-thecostof

-12- He 647

### H8 0647/02

1	prosecuting-the-claimfhe-sole-right-to-institute-the-claim
2	underthissubsection-is-in-the-personal-representative-of
٤	the-deceased-for-the-exclusive-benefitofthoseincurring
4	such-expenses
2	tel

>	<del>{c}~or-the-death-of-a-minor-or-adult-with-dependentsy</del>
ъ	thecompensationrecoverablemayincludetheactual-or
۲	prospective-loss-of-cornings-for-the-working-life-expectancy
ъ	of-such-deceased-less-the-reasonable-cost-of-the-maintenance
¥	of-the-decensedy-plus-the-reasonable-cost-of-thedeceased*s
10	medicslyhospitalyfuneralyandburialexpensey-plus-an
11	amount-the-hearing-panel-may-determinereasonableforthe
12	costof-prosecuting-such-claims-The-sole-right-to-institute
13	the-claim-provided-for-in-this-subsection-is-in-the-personal
14	representative-of-thedeceaseddependentsandforthose
15	incurring-such-expenses
15	<del>{s}Forbodilyinjurytoanadultorminornot</del>
17	resulting-in-deathy-the-hearingpanelmayallowforany
18	injuryordamagevgeneralorspecialyallowedby-lawy
19	inclusinglossofearningstobebasedonthework
20	expectancyoftheclaimantwithout-regard-to-his-injured
21	
	condition;-the-reasonablemedicalyhospitalyandrelated
22	condition;-the-reasonablemedicalyhospitalyandrelated expenseypasty-presenty-and-future;-and-pain-and-sufferingy
22	expensespasts-presents-and-futures-and-pain-and-sufferings
22 23	expenserpastr-presentr-and-futurer-and-pain-and-sufferingr pastr-presentrandfuturerProvidedrhoweverrthatall

1	andreasonableamounty-free-from-sentiment-and-taking-into
2	account-the-natureandextentoftheinjuriesendthe
3	sufferingoccasionedby-themy-the-duration-and-prospective
4	duration-thereofy-the-agey-healthy-habitsy-and-conditionof
5	theinjuredpartybeforethe-injury-as-compared-with-his
ò	conditioninconsequencethereof*futurepainand
7	suffering-may-be-awarded-only-to-the-extentthatthereis
B	requisitecertaintyorprobabilitythatsuchpainand
9	suffering-will-result-from-the-injuryreceivedbasedupon
10	the-claimant*s-life-expectancy-in-his-injured-conditions
11	<del>{2}Thecompensation-and-benefits-awar</del> de <del>d-by-this-act</del>
12	small-be-reduced-by-any-collateralsource-ofcompensation
13	benefits-as-provided-by-law-
14	Section-16=Paymentofawards=Thehearingpane}
15	shall-order-all-payments-of-future-damages-asprovidedby
16	<del>1</del> 0₩▼
17	Section-17Awardandtaxingofcosts1nall
13	proceedings-before-the-nearing-panelsy-thecostsshallbe
19	awardedandtaxedasprovidedbylaw-in-ordinary-civil
20	
	actionsy-with-the-exception-tnat-ify-in-the-opinionofthe
21	actionsy-with-the-exception-tnat-ify-in-tne-opinionofthe hearingpanelyaclaimformedicolliability-was-filed
21 22	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •
	hearingpanelyaclaimformedicalliability-was-filed
22	hearingpanelyaclaimformedicolliability-was-filed without-probable-cause-for-the-claimant-tobelievehewas

25 Section-18---Claims--not--assignable----exempt---from

-14-

-13-

creditors\*--claims\*---No--claims-for-compensation-under-this
 act-msy-he--assignable\*--and--all--compensation--snd--claims
 therefor--shall--be--exempt--from--all--claims-of-creditors\*
 assignees\*-or-subrogees\*

Section 15. Designation of parties -- joinder of 5 parties -- separate hearings. The person filing the claim is 6 7 the claimant, and the adverse party or parties is the respondent or respondents. The rules for joinder of parties 8 9 are as otherwise allowed by law. The hearing panel may make 10 orders to prevent a party from being embarrassed, delayed, 11 or put to expense by the inclusion of parties against him 12 and may order separate hearings or make other orders to 13 prevent delay or prejudice.

Section 16. Filing and service of claims. All claims 14 15 shall be filed on forms provided by the secretary. The 16 claimant must attach to the forms the proposed complaint, 17 which shall be prepared and served upon the health care 18 providers named therein by the claimant, in the same manner 19 and form provided by law for civil actions. The summons shall conform to the requirements of the panel. The 20 21 secretary shall notify--concerned--health--care--providers 22 PROVIDE ALL CONCERNED PARILES WITH COPIES OF THE PLEADINGS 23 AND OTHER DOCUMENTS FILED WITH THE SECRETARY AND PROVIDE THE RELEVANT PROFESSIONAL ASSOCIATIONS WITH COPIES OF CLAIMS 24 25 EILED.

Section 17. Additional pleadings. All health care 1 providers served with a proposed complaint shall, within 20 2 days from the date of service thereof, answer in the form a. and manner provided by law for civil actions. Any health 6 care provider who fails to so answer is subject to liability 5 under the law without regard to the provisions of this act. ъ 7 There may be no other pleadings. Section-22s--Attorney-feess---The--amount--of--attorney я ų fees-to-be-paid-shall-be-included-in-the-record-of-the-trial and--shall--be-paid-to-the-attorney-by-the-respondent-or-his 10 11 insurer-in-addition-to-any-award-made-to--the--claimantu--if the-respondent-is-awarded-attorney-feesy-the-amount-shall-be 12 13 ineluded--in-the-record-of-the-trialy--The-district-court-in the-county-in-which-the-claim-is-heard-shally-st-the-request 14 15 of-any-partyy-determine-the-reasonableness-of--each--party\*s attorney--fees--ordered--paid--by-the-other-partyw-The-court 16 17 shell-take-into-consideration-the-following: {}}--the-time--and--labor--requiredy--the--novelty--ond 18 difficulty---of---the--questions--involvedy--and--the--skill 17 requisite-to-perform-the-legal-services-properly; 20 21 f2+--tne-likelihoody-if-apparent-to--the--clienty--thet 22 the--acceptance--of--the--particular--employment--would-have 23 precluded-other-employment-by-the-attorney; t3)--the-fee-customarily-charged-in--the--locality--for 24 25 similar-legal-servicest

-16-

H5 647

#### H5 0647/02

ı	{+}the-smount-involved-and-the-results-obtsined;
2	{5}thetimelimitations-imposed-by-the-client-or-by
з	other-circumstances;
4	<del>{6}thenatureandlengthoftheprofessional</del>
5	relationship-with-the-attorney-and-clienty-and
ó	<del>{7}theexperienceyreputationy-andability-of-the</del>
1	ettorney-performing-the-services#
в	Section 18. Proofoffinancialresponsibility
9	insuranceycash-or-surety-bond <u>REQUIREMENT FOR INSURANCE OR</u>
10	<u>SELE-INSURANCE</u> . <del>{}}-Each-health-care-provider-subject-to-the</del>
11	terms-of-this-act-sholly-within-30-days-after-this-act-takes
12	<del>effecty-file-with-thesecretoryyina-monnerprescribed</del>
15	therebyy-proof-of-financial-responsibilityy
14	<del>{2}[1]</del> Each health care provider <del>y-except-as-provided</del>
15	<del>by[section24]</del> shall acquire and maintain in force
15	professional liability insurance of not less than \$250,000
17	for each occurrence and \$500,000 in the aggregate for all
18	claims occurring in any one policy year or, as an
14	alternative, qualify as a self-insurer upon making proper
20	application and being approved by the commissioner of
21	insurance.
22	to)[2] Self-insurance subject to approval by the
23	commissioner of insurance is effected by filing with the
24	commissioner in satisfactory form:
25	(a) a continued undertaking by the health care

1 provider to pay any award rendered under this act-except-as provided--by--fsection--241+ to the first \$250,000 for each 2 incident and to \$500,000 in the adgregate for all claims 3 occurring in any one year; and 4

5 (b) evidence that appropriate provision exists for prompt and efficient administration of all claims; and 6 7 (c) evidence that reliable financial arrangements,

8 deposits, or commitments exist providing coverage 9 substantially equivalent to that afforded by a policy of 10 insurance required in subsection (2) of this section for the 11 payment of medical liability claims.

12 Section 19. Failure to-provide--proof--of--financial 13 responsibility-----failure or refusal to accept panel 14 determination. (1) A health care provider is subject to 15 liability under the laws of this state with respect to a claim. without regard to the provisions of this acty-except 16

as-provided-in-[section-26] if he fails or refuses to: tat--provide--proof--of--financial--responsibility---as 18

19 provided-in-Esection-231t

17

tb)(A) pay the annual assessment provided for in 20 21 [section 2621], in a manner and amount fixed by the 22 secretary; or

te)(B) within 10 days of receipt of the final 23 determination of the panel, communicate in writing to the 24 secretary his acceptance of the final determination of the 25

-18-

-17-

#### H8 0647/02

1 panel.

(2) Any claimant who fails or refuses to, within 10
days of receipt of the final determination of the panel,
communicate in writing to the secretary his acceptance of
the determination of the panel may proceed with the claim as
otherwise allowed by the laws of this state, without regard
to the provisions of this act<del>y-except-as-provided-in</del>
<del>[section-26].</del>

9 Section-25---Bond-in-the-event-of-subsequent-suity--(1) 19 It-suit-in-a-court-of-competent-jurisdiction-is-available-to 11 any--party-under-the-terms-of-this-acty-the-party-may-pursue 12 the-claim-after-filing-of-the--complaint--only--upon--filing 13 bond--in--the--amount--of--\$2y000y--secured--by--cash-or-its 14 equivalenty-with-the-clerk-of-court-in-the--court--in--which 15 the-claim-is-filedy-payable-to-the-opposing-party-or-parties 16 for--costs--assessedy-including-witness-and-experts1-fee-and 17 any-other-costs-allowed-by-low-if-the--party--pursuing--the 18 claim-does-not-prevoil-in-the-final-judgment+

19(2)--The--court--mayy--upon--notion--of--either--of-the20partiesy-increase-the-amount-of--the-bond--required--to--be21filedw-Upon-motion-filed-by-the-claimant-and-a-determination22by--the--court--after-hearing-that-the-claimant-is-indigenty23the-court-may-reduce-the-amount-of-the-bond-so-required--but24mny--not--eliminate-the-requirement-therefory-If-the-bond-is25not-posted-within-30-days-of-the-filing-of-the-complaint--or

-19-

HB 647

1	thedeterminationofthecourt-as-to-s-larger-or-smaller
Z	bondy-whichever-is-latery-the-action-shall-be-dismissed-with
3	prejudice-to-the-claimant*
4	Section-26*Admissibility-of-determination-ofhearing
5	ponelwThedetermination-of-the-hearing-panel-required-by
6	fsection-14]-may-be-admitted-into-evidence-in-any-subsequent
7	trialsHoweverynospecificfindingoffactorany
8	determination-as-to-damages-may-be-admitted-into-evidence-at
9	tris]Porties-may,-in-the-opening-statement-or-argument-to
10	thecourt-or-juryy-comment-on-the-panel+s-conclusion-in-the
11	same-manner-as-any-other-evidence-introduced-attrial*The
12	numerical-vote-of-the-panel-is-admissiblev-Panel-members-may
13	notbecalled-to-testify-as-to-the-merits-of-the-cese**The
14	<del>jury-shall-beinstructedthatthedeterminationofthe</del>
15	hearingpanelrequiredby[section-14]-raises-a-rebuttal
16	presumptioninfavorafitsconclusionvwhichmaybe
17	controvertedbyotherevidencrydirector-indirecty-but
10	unless-so-controverted-the-jury-is-bound-tofindaccording
19	to-the-presumption.
20	Spetion-27wPayment-of-awards-and-funding-of-setw(1)
21	Theadministrationofthisactshallbe-funded-from-an
22	annual-assessmenty-which-shall-be-paid-by-eachhealthcore
23	provider
24	secretaryy-who-shallcollectandreceivethefundsfor
25	exclusiveuseforthepurposes-stated-in-this-acty-based

-20-

## H8 0647/02

HB 647

.

1	upon-the-experience-ratingoftheclassificationofthe
2	varioushealthcare-providersw-Surplus-fundsy-if-snyy-over
د	and-accve-the-amount-required-for-the-annualadministration
4	oftneactshall-be-retained-by-the-secretary-and-used-to
5	finance-the-administration-of-this-act-in-succeedingyearsy
5	inwnicneventthesecretaryshallreducetheannual
7	assessment-in-subsequent-yearsy-commensurate-with-the-proper
ч	administration-of-this-setw
Y	{2}Payment-of-all-awards-accepted-by-thepartiesas
19	providedin[section24]shollbe-from-the-professional
11	<del>liability-insurance-or-from-satisfaction-of-theundertaking</del>
12	providedforin-[section-23]v-To-the-extent-such-insurance
د ا	or-undertaking-is-insufficient-to-pay-the-full-amount-of-the
14	awardy-the-balanca-shall-be-paid-from-a-fund-established-for
15	sucn-seficienciesy-by-appropriation-from-the-general-fund-of
16	this-states
17	SECTION 20. PANEL DETERMINATION NOT ADMISSIBLE. THE
13	DETENDINATION OF THE HEARING PANEL IS NOT ADMISSIBLE AS
19	EVIDENCE_IN_ANY_ACTION_SUBSEQUENTLY_BROUGHT_IN_ANY_COURTOF
2ú	LAW. PANELISIS MAY NOT BE CALLED ID TESTIEY IN ANY ACTION
21	SUBSEQUENTLY BROUGHT IN ANY COURT OF LAN. AND PANELISTS AND
22	WIINESSES ARE IMMUNE FROM CIVIL LIABILITY FOR ALL
23	CUMMUNICATIONS, FIGDINGS, OPINIONS, AND CONCLUSIONS MADE IN
24	INE COURSE AND SCOPE OF THE DUITES PRESCRIBED BY THIS ACT.
25	NO STATEMENT MADE BY ANY PERSON DURING A HEARING BEFORE THE

-21-

1	PANEL MAY BE USED AS IMPEACHING EVIDENCE IN COURT.
2	SECTION 21. FUNDING. (1) THERE IS CREATED A PRETRIAL
3	REVIEW PANEL FUND TO BE COLLECTED BY THE SECRETARY FOR
4	EXCLUSIVE USE FOR THE PURPOSES STATED IN THIS ACT. THE FUND
5	AND ANY INCOME FROM IT SHALL BE HELD IN TRUST, DEPOSITED IN
6	AN ACCOUNT. INVESTED AND REINVESTED BY THE SECRETARY WITH
T	THE PRIOR APPROVAL OF THE DIRECTOR OF THE MONTANA MEDICAL
8	ASSOCIATION: AND MAY NOT BECOME A PART OF OR REVERT TO THE
9	GENERAL FUND OF THIS STATE: BUT SHALL BE OPEN TO INSPECTION
10	AND AUDITING BY THE LEGISLATIVE AUDITOR.
11	<u>[2] TO ESTABLISH THE FUND, AN ANNUAL SURCHARGE SHALL</u>
12	BE LEVIED ON ALL HEALTH CARE PROVIDERS. THE AMOUNI OF THE
13	ASSESSMENT SHALL BE SET BY THE SECRETARY, WHO SHALL ALLOCATE
14	A PROJECTED COST AMONG HEALTH CARE PROVIDERS ON A PER CAPITA
15	BASIS AND SUCH OTHER RELEVANT FACTORS AS THE SECRETARY
16	DESIGNATES BY RULE. SURPLUS FUNDS. IF ANY. OVER AND ABOVE
17	THE AMOUNT REQUIRED FOR THE ANNUAL ADMINISTRATION OF THIS
18	ACT SHALL BE RETAINED BY THE SECRETARY AND USED TO FINANCE
19	THE ADMINISTRATION OF THIS ACT IN SUCCEEDING YEARS, IN WHICH
20	EVENT THE SECRETARY SHALL REDUCE THE ANNUAL ASSESSMENT IN
21	SUBSEQUENT YEARS, COMMENSURATE NITH THE PROPER
22	ADMINISTRATION OF THIS ACT.
23	(3) THE ANNUAL SURCHARGE IS DUE AND PAYABLE ON THE
24	SAME DATE AS LICENSE FEES PAYABLE TO THE STATE DE MONTANA
25	ARE_DUE

#### HB 0647/02

Section 22. Conflict. The provisions of this act shall 1 2 govern if a conflict arises between this act and other provisions of the laws of Montana. 3 Section 23. Severability. If a part of this act is 4 5 invalid, all valid parts that are severable from the invalid part remain in effect. If a part of this act is invalid in 6 7 one or more of its applications, the part remains in effect 8 in all valid applications that are severable from the 9 invalid applications. Section 24. Effective date. This act is effective 10

11 January 1, 1978.

-End-

1	HOUSE BILL NO+ 647
2	INTRODUCED BY SCULLY
3	

A BILL FOR AN ACT ENTITLED: "AN ACT TO ESTABLISH A 4 MANDATORY PRETRIAL REVIEW PANEL TO HEAR AND DETERMINE CLAIMS 5 FOR MEDICAL LIABILITY; TO ESTABLISH RULES, PROCEDURES, AND 6 1 FACILITIES TO IMPLEMENT AND ACCOMPLISH THE PURPOSE OF THE ACT: TO-PROVIDE-FOR-A-SCHEDULE-OF-COMPENSATION-AND-BENEFITS 8 9 FUR-AWARDS1-TB-GUARANTEE--THE--FINANCIAL--RESPONSIBILITY--OF 10 HEALTH--CARE--PROVIDERS TO REQUIRE PROFESSIONAL LIABILITY 11 INSURANCE FOR HEALTH CARE PROVIDERS: AND TO PROVIDE THE 12 SOURCE FOR THE FUNDING OF THE ADMINISTRATION OF THE ACT AND 13 THE-PAYMENT-BE-AWARDS+-AND-UTHERWISE-AMENDING-THE--INSURANCE 14 LAWS--WITH--RESPECT--TO--SUCH--PANEL; PROVIDING & DELAYED 15 EFFECTIVE DATE."

16

17 SE IT EVACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF MONTANA:
18 Section 1. Definitions. As used in this act, the
19 following definitions apply:

(1) "Health care provider" means any physician
licensed to practice medicine in the state of Montana or a
hospital, hospital-related facility, or long-term care
facility.

(2) "Medical liability" means liability arising out of
 the injury or death of any person as the result of

negligence or breach of contract in the rendering of
 professional services by a health care provider.

З (3) "Professional liability insurer" means any company 4 authorized to do business in Montana or doing business in 5 Montana and offering policies of professional liability 6 insurance to health care providers and includes any 7 insurance trust, joint underwriting association, mutual insurer, reciprocal insurer or any other entity or person 8 9 offering such liability coverage, including any state 10 insurance fund.

Section 2. Establishment of panel. A pretrial review
 panel is created to review all medical liability claims,
 except as provided in [section 5].

Section 3. Precondition to suit. No action for medical liability against a health care provider may be commenced in any court of this state before the claimant has filed his claim with the secretary of the panel as herein provided and has a final decision on the claim is rendered by the panel, unless otherwise provided herein.

20 Section 4. Tolling of statute of limitations. The 21 filing of the claim shall toll the applicable statute of 22 limitations to and including a period of 90 days following 23 the rendering of a final decision by the panel.

24 Section 5. Applicability of the act. The provisions of 25 this act are not applicable to any claim in which suit has

-2-

THIRD READING

#### H8 0647/02

been filed in a district court of this state prior to the effective date of this act or if the claim is subject to a valid arbitration agreement allowed by law. Section 6. Creation of panel -- hearing-panels---compensation----terms--of--service---method-of-selectionw {1}-The-pretrial-review-penel-shall-consist-of-12--full-time members. (2)--Six-of-the-full-time-members-of-the-panel-shall-be physicians-licensed-to-practice-in-the-state-of-Hontanay-and six--shall-be-attorneys-licensed-to-practice-in-the-state-of Nontanav t3t--The-panel-is-divided-into-two-hearing-panelsy--one of--which--shall-hear-and-determine-each-claimy-and-each-one of-which-shall-be-composed-of--three--attorneys--and--three physicians-and-chaired-by-an-attorney. (4)--Full-time-members-of-the-panel-are-interchangeable between--the--two--hearing-panels-and-shall-be-assigned-to-a hearing-panel-on-a-claim-by-claim-basis-st--the-direction-of the-secretary.

1

2 3

4

5

6 7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15 16

17

18 19

(5)--At-least-two-attorneys-and-two-physicians-shall-be 20 21 necessary-for-a-quorum-for-the-transaction-of-any-hearing-or the-rendering-of-env-decision-required-by--this--act--to--be 22 23 final.

24 (6)--In--a--case-involving-a-health-care-provider-other than-s-physiciany-a-part-time-panel--member--practicing--the 25

-3-

HB 647

1	sameprofessionasinvolved-in-the-claim-shall-sit-on-the
2	hearing-panel-in-place-of-a-physicianu-In-any-case-involving
3	both-a-physicion-and-a-health-careproviderotherthana
4	physiciany-the-representative-of-such-other-profession-shall
5	additionallysitonthehearingpanelandshallbe-a
6	part-time-members
7	<del>{7}Each-full-time-member-of-the-panelyexceptthose</del>
8	first-appointedy-shall-hold-office-for-3-years-and-until-his
9	successoris-appointed-and-qualifiedsOn-or-before-January
10	1
11	appointfour-members-to-s-term-of-1-yeary-four-members-to-a
12	term-of-2-yearsy-and-four-members-toatermof3yearsy
13	Futureappointmentstofillexpired-terms-shall-be-for-a
14	period-of-3-years.
15	<del>(8)Appointmentofattorneyandphysicianmembers</del>
16	shallbe-mode-by-the-governor-from-a-list-of-three-nominees
17	for-each-vacancy-selected-and-nominated-by-the-state-barof
18	Hontans-and-the-Hontana-medical-associationy-respectively.
19	<del>{9}Thegovernorshallywith-regard-to-any-vacancyv</del>
20	make-his-appointmentsfromthelistsasprovidedabove
21	within30daysfollowingthedaytheposition-becomes
22	vacante METHOD OF SELECTION HEARINGS. (1) THE PRETRIAL
<b>2</b> 3	REVIEW PANEL CONSISTS OF THREE PHYSICIANS LICENSED TO
24	PRACTICE IN MONTANA AND THREE ATTORNEYS LICENSED TO PRACTICE
25	IN_MONTANA.

-- 4--

H8 0647/02

1	(2)THE_ATIORNEY_MEMBERS_SHALL_BE_APPOINTED_BYTHE
Z	STATE BAR OF MONTANA AND THE PHYSICIAN MEMBERS BY THE
3	MONTANA_MEDICAL_ASSOCIATION.
4	(3) THE THREE ATTORNEY MEMBERS SHALL SELECT ONE OF
5	INCHARTER AS CHAIRMAN OF THE PANEL.
6	[4] PANEL MEMBERS SHALL BE APPOINTED WITHIN 30 DAYS
1	AFTER RECEIPT BY THE RESPECTIVE ASSOCIATIONS OF A CLAIM FOR
ð	REVIEW. PANEL MEMBERS SHALL SERVE UNTIL THE PANEL HAS
9	COMMUNICATED ITS DETERMINATION TO THE PARTIES INVOLVED AND
10	APPROVEDANYSETTLEMENT_AGREEMENT_OR_DETERMINED_THAT
11	SETTLEMENT DISCUSSIONS HAVE OR SHOULD BE TERMINATED.
12	[5] A PANEL MEMBER SHALL DISQUALIEY HIMSELE FROM
13	CONSIDERATION OF ANY CASE IN WHICH THE MEMBER DETERMINES HIS
14	PRESENCE_WOULD_BE_INAPPROPRIATETHE_SECRETARY_MAY_EXCUSE
15	AN APPOINTED PANELIST FROM SERVING.
16	(6) AT LEAST THE ATTORNEYS AND THE PHYSICIANS ARE
17	NECESSARY FOR A QUORUM FOR HOLDING A HEARING OR BENDEBING A
18	EINAL DECISION UNDER THIS ACT.
19	(7) IN A CASE INVOLVING A HEALTH CARE PROVIDER DIHEB
20	IMAN_A_PHYSICIAN. A_PANEL_MEMBER_PRACTICING_IHE_SAME
21	PROCESSION AS INVOLVED IN THE CLAIN SHALL SIT ON THE PANEL
Z2	IN PLACE DE A PHYSICIAN. IN A CASE INVOLVING A PHYSICIAN AND
23	AHEALTHCAREPROVIDEROTHERTHANAPHYSICIANSA
24	REPRESENTATIVE_PRACTICING_THE_SAME_PROFESSION_AS_THEHEALTH
25	CARE PROVIDER INVOLVED SHALL SIT ON THE PANEL IN ADDITION TO
	-5- HB 647

L	IHESIXBEGULARMEMBERSSUCH_ADDITIONAL_MEMBER_SHALL_BE
2	APPOINTED BY THE PANEL MEMBERS.
3	5ection-7wRemoval-of-panel-membersVacanciesw(1)
4	*ny-member-of-the-panel-may-be-removed-bythegovernorat
5	anytimeforincompetencyy-neglect-of-dutyy-misconduct-in
6	officev-or-other-goodcauseywhichistobestatedin
7	writing-in-the-order-of-removal.
8	<del>{2}Inthe-case-of-a-vacancy-in-the-membership-of-the</del>
9	<del>panel,-the-governor-shall-appointfortheunexpired-term</del>
10	fromnomineesinthesomemannerasfororiginal
11	appointments.
12	Section 7. Compensation of the panel and staff
13	facilities for offices and hearings. (1) All <del>full-time</del>
14	members of the panel shall be paid a salary in the amount of
15	\$35 an nour, under guidelines promulgated by the secretary.
16	Part-timemembersshallbepaida-salary-equal-to-that
17	allowed-to-members-oftheKontanalegislaturewhilethe
15	<del>legislature-is-in-session</del> .
19	(2) All members of the panel and its assistants are
20	entitled to receive their actual and necessary expenses
21	while traveling on the business of the panel. Expenses shall
22	be approved by the secretary of the panel before payment is
23	made•
24	(3) The panel-shall-appoint <u>DIRECTOR_OF_IME_MONTANA</u>
25	MEDICAL_ASSOCIATION_SHALL_APPOINT AND SET THE SALABY OF a

-6-

HB 0647/02

. . -

secretary and may remove such secretary. The secretary
 shall administer oaths, receive claims filed, promulgate
 forms required hereunder, issue subpoenas in connection with
 the administration of this act, and perform all other duties
 required to fairly and effectively administer this act.

6 (4) The panely--subject--to--the-approval---of---the
7 governory SECRETARY may employ and fix the compensation of
8 such clerical and other assistants as it may consider
9 necessary.

10 (5) The panel <u>SECRETARY</u> shall provide--itself-with 11 <u>OBTAIN ON BEHALE. OF. THE PRETRIAL REVIEW PANEL</u> adequate 12 offices in the city of Helena, in which the records shall be 13 kept and its official business be transacted.-It <u>AND</u> shall 14 also provide the necessary office furniture, stationery, and 15 other supplies.

16 (6) Panel hearings shall be conducted in the county 17 where the injury allegedly occurred but may, within the 18 sound discretion of the hearing panel, be held in any other 19 county if the panel considers it necessary or advisable. The 20 county commissioners or other governing authority shall 21 provide, upon the request of the secretary of the panel, 22 suitable facilities for any such hearing.

Section 8. Notice -- how served. Notice of all
 hearings, orders, determinations, and proceedings of the
 hearing panels PANELs required by this act to be served.

~7-

HB 647

shall be given by certified mail, return receipt requested,
 at the last known address of the person to be so served.

3 Section 9. Evidence to be considered. (1) Unless 4 directed otherwise by the hearing panel, the evidence to be 5 considered by a hearing panel must be submitted by the 6 respective parties in documentary form only. The evidence 7 may consist of medical charts, x-rays, laboratory tests. 8 depositions of witnesses, and any other form of evidence 9 allowable by the hearing panel.

10 (2) All parties shall be allowed to use any discovery 11 procedure provided for by the Montana rules of civil 12 procedure, and in the manner provided for therein. 13 Depositions may be introduced into evidence without regard 14 to the availability of the witness to testify. Discovery as 15 to-expert-witnesses-is-not--admissible--unless--such--expert 16 witness--was--in-proctice-in-the-same-or-s-similar-community 17 in-the-state-of-Hontanay-in-the-same-professiony-ond-at--the 18 same--time--as--the--alleged-incident-occurred-as-the-health core-provider-whose-standard-of-care-is-at-issuew 19

20 .(3) Any motion for relief arising out of the use of
21 such discovery procedures shall be decided by the chairman
22 of the hearing panel, who may in his discretion make
23 reasonable limitations on the extent and scope of discovery.
24 Section 10. Hearings and final determinations. (1) The
25 secretary shall, with the advice and cooperation of the

-8-

HS 0647/02

. .

parties and the hearing panels PANEL, fix the date and time for all hearings on claims before a hearing panel. A final decision on each claim shall be made within 120 days of the date the claim is filed with the secretary, unless for good cause shown, upon order of the chairman of a hearing panel, such time is extended.

7 (2) If a final decision on a claim is not made within 8 10 months of the date the claim is filed, the jurisdiction 9 of the panel on the subject matter shall terminate and the 10 parties may proceed in accordance with the law.

Section 11. Law and rules applicable -- powers of the 11 panel. (1) Except as provided in this act, the panel will be 12 bound by the common and statutory law and by the Montana 13 rules of civil procedure but with SHALL conduct INFORMAL 14 hearings and make all determinations as in its judgment are 15 best adapted to ascertain and determine the rights of the 16 parties expeditiously and accurately to carry out justly the 17 spirit of this act. 18

 19
 (2) The ponel SECRETARY, SUBJECT TO THE APPROVAL DE

 20
 IHE SUPREME COURT, may:

21 (a) adopt rules to carry out the provisions of this
22 act; <u>AND</u>

(b) prescribe the means, methods, and practices
necessary to effectuate such provisions;

25 (3) THE PANEL HAY:

-9-

1 tct(A) approve settlement agreements on claims of 2 medical liability;

3 (d)(B) order physical examinations;

4 (e)(C) apply to any district court having requisite
5 jurisolction to enforce the production and examination of
books, papers, and records; and

7 (f)(D) exercise all other powers and duties conferred
8 upon the panel hereafter by law or provided in this act.

9 (3)(4) The panel may, upon the application of either 10 party or upon its own motion, appoint a disinterested and 11 qualified physician or other professional person or expert 12 to make necessary professional or expert examination of the 13 claimant or relevant evidentiary matter and to report in 14 writing in respect thereto.

15 (4)(5) The panel may subpoena any witness to testify 16 pursuant to the rules appropriate to civil actions with 17 respect to parties to a controversy and may apply to any 18 district court of this state for enforcement of such 19 subpoenas.

20 Section 12. Votes of hearing panel. A majority vote of 21 those present at a hearing panel is sufficient to make any 22 determination. The-chairman-of-a-hearing-panel-may-vote-only 23 to-break-a-tie-vote-of-the-hearing-panel.

24 Section 13. Compensation for medical liability. The 25 claim shall be heard as one for compensation for medical

HB 0647/02

-10-

#### HB 0647/02

liability. The hearing panel shall review the evidence
 submitted and hear any testimony to be elicited with
 reasonable dispatch and shall make one of the following
 determinations, which determination shall be sent to the
 parties:

6 (1) The evidence supports the conclusion that the 7 defendant--or-defendants <u>RESPONDENT\_OR\_RESPONDENTS</u> failed to comply with the appropriate standard of care as charged in ß Q the complaint and that the conduct complained of was a 10 substantial-factor PROXIMATE CAUSE of any resultant damage. 11 (2) The evidence supports the conclusion that the 12 defendant-or-defendants <u>RESPONDENT OR RESPONDENTS</u> failed to 13 comply with the appropriate standard of care as charged in 14 the complaint but that the conduct complained of was not a 15 substantial--factor PROXIMATE CAUSE of any resultant damage. 16 (3) The evidence does not support the conclusion that the defendant-or-defendants RESPONDENT OR RESPONDENTS failed 17 18 to meet the applicable standard of care as charged in the 19 complaint.

20 Section 14. Award schedule for medical liability. (1) 21 If the determination of the hearing panel is that the 22 evidence supports the conclusion that the defendant--or 23 defendents <u>RESPONDENT</u> <u>OR RESPONDENTS</u> failed to comply with 24 the appropriate standard of care as charged in the complaint 25 and that the conduct complained of was a <del>substantial--factor</del>

-11-

HB 647

of--eny--resultant <u>PRDXIMATE\_CAUSE\_OF\_ANY</u> damage, then the hearing panel shell-make-a-finel-award-within-the--following limits-as-to-the-nature-of-the-award-but-without-limit-as-to emount: <u>MAY\_RECOMMEND\_AN\_AWARD\_AND\_APPROVE\_SETTLEMENT</u>

5 AGREEMENTS. ALL APPROVED SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS ARE FINAL AND

#### 6 BINDING ON ALL PARTIES THERETO.

1

2

3

4

7 tat--for-death--of--a--minor--without--dependentsy--the 8 compensation--recoverable--shall--be-the-reasonable-value-of 9 the-minor\*s-services--to--his--parents--or--legal---guardiany 10 during-minority-less-the-reasonable-cost-of-the-maintenance 11 of---the--minory--which--compensation--shall--inure--to--the 12 exclusive-benefit-of--the--parent---or--quardiany--plus--any 13 reasonable--medicaly--hospitaly--funeraly-burialy-or-related 14 expenses-The-sole-right-to-institute--the--cloim--or--claims 15 provided---for---in--this--subsection--is--in--the--personat 16 representative-of-the-deceasedy-for--the--exclusive--benefit 17 of+ 18 (+)--such-parent-or-parents-or-legal-guardiant-and 19 fit-the-persons--incurring--such--medicaly--hospitaly 20 funeraly-burialy-and-related-expenses 21 {b}--For-depth-of--an--adult--without--dependentsy--the

21 (b)--for-depth-or-an--adutt--wrthodt--dependentsy--the
22 compensation---recoverable--shall-be-the-reasonable-value-of
23 all-hospitaly-medicaly-or-other--related--expense--plus--the
24 reasonable--cost-of-funeral-and-burialy-plus-an-amount-which
25 the-hearing-panel-may-determine-reasonable-for-the--cost--of

-12- HB 647

. .

#### H8 0647/02

prosecuting-the-claims-The-sole-right-to-institute-the-claim
 under-this--subsection-is-in-the-personal-representative-of
 the-deceased-for-the-exclusive-benefit--of--those--incurring
 such-expenses

.

5 fc}--For-the-death-of-a-minor-or-adult-with-dependentsy the--compensation--recoverable--may--include--the--actual-or 6 7 prospective-loss-of-earnings-for-the-working-life-expectancy 8 of-such-deceased-less-the-reasonable-cost-of-the-maintenance 9 of-the-deceasedy-plus-the-reasonable-cost-of-the--deceased\*s 10 medicaly--hospitaly--funeraly--and--burial--expenses-alus-an 11 amount-the-hearing-panel-may-determine--reasonable--for--the cost--of-prosecuting-such-claims-The-sole-right-to-institute 12 13 tne-claim-provided-for-in-this-subsection-is-in-the-personal representative-of-the--deceased--dependents--and--for--those 14 15 incurring-such-expenser td}--For--bodily--injury--to--an--adult--or--minor--not 16 17 resulting-in-deathy-the-hearing-panel--may--allow--for--any 18 injury--or--damagey--general--or--specialy--allowed--by-lawy 19 including--loss--of--earnings--to--be--based--on--the---work 20 expectancy--of--the--claimant--without-regard-to-his-injured 21 conditions-the-reasonable--medicaly--hospitaly--and--related 22 expenses--pasty-presenty-and-futures-and-pain-and-sufferingy 23 pasty-presenty--and--futurey--Providedy--howevery--that--all 24 demodes -- for--poin--and--suffering--must-have-a-basis-in-the 25 evidence-submitted-to-support-the-claim-thereofy-in--o--fair

HB 647

1	andreasonableamounty-free-from-sentiment-and-taking-into
2	account-the-nature-and-extent-of-theinjuries-and-the
3	sufferingaccasionedby-themw-the-duration-and-prospective
4	duration-thereofy-the-agey-healthy-habitsy-and-conditionof
5	theinjuredpartybeforethe-injury-ss-compared-with-his
6	conditioninconsequencethereofwFuturepainand
7	suffering-may-be-awarded-only-to-the-extentthatthereis
8	requisitecertaintyorprobabilitythatsuchpainand
9	suffering-will-result-from-the-injuryreceivedbasedupon
10	the-claimant*s-life-expectancy-in-his-injured-condition#
11	<del>{2}Thecompensation-and-benefits-awarded-by-this-act</del>
12	shall-be-reduced-by-any-collateralsourceofcompensation
13	benefits-as-provided-by-laww
14	Section-16PaymentofawardsThehearingpanel
15	shell-order-all-payments-of-future-damagesasprovidedby
16	tow
17	Section-17wAwardandtoxingofcostswInall
18	proceedings-before-the-hearing-panelsy-thecostsshallbe
19	awardedandtaxedasprovidedbytaw-in-ordinary-civit
zu	actionsv-with-the-exception-that-ify-in-the-opinionofthe
21	hearingpanelyaclaimformedicalliability-was-filed
22	without-probable-cause-for-the-claimant-tobelievehewas
23	tegaltyentitled-to-reliefy-then-the-cost-shall-include-the
24	cost-pf-defensey-including-a-reasonable-attorney*s-feew

25 Section-18----Claims--not--assignable-----exempt---from

-14-

H8 647

#### H8 0647/02

creditors\*--claims---No--claims-for-compensation-under-this
 act-may-be--assignabley--and--all--compensation--and--claims
 therefor--shall--be--exempt--fram-oll--claims-of-creditorsy
 assigneesy-or-subrogeesy

5 Section 15. Designation of parties -- joinder of 6 parties -- separate hearings. The person filing the claim is 7 the claimant, and the adverse party or parties is the 8 respondent or respondents. The rules for joinder of parties are as otherwise allowed by law. The hearing panel may make 9 10 orders to prevent a party from being embarrassed, delayed, 11 or put to expense by the inclusion of parties against him 12 and may order separate hearings or make other orders to 13 prevent delay or prejudice.

14 Section 16. Filing and service of claims. All claims shall be filed on forms provided by the secretary. The 15 16 claimant must attach to the forms the proposed complaint, 17 which shall be prepared and served upon the health care 18 providers named therein by the claimant, in the same manner 19 and form provided by law for civil actions. The summons 20 shall conform to the requirements of the panel. The 21 secretary shall notify-concerned-health-core-providers 22 PROVIDE ALL CONCERNED PARTIES WITH COPIES OF THE PLEADINGS 23 AND OTHER DOCUMENTS FILED WITH THE SECRETARY AND PROVIDE THE 24 RELEVANT PROFESSIONAL ASSOCIATIONS WITH CUPIES OF CLAIMS 25 EILED.

HB 0647/02

. .

Section 17. Additional pleadings. All health care providers served with a proposed complaint shall, within 20 days from the date of service thereof, answer in the form and manner provided by law for civil actions. Any health care provider who fails to so answer is subject to liability under the law without regard to the provisions of this act. There may be no other pleadings.

8 Section-22w--Attorney-feesw---The--amount--of--attorney 4 fees-to-be-paid-shall-be-included-in-the-record-of-the-trial 10 and--shall--be-paid-to-the-attorney-by-the-respondent-or-his 11 insurer-in-addition-to-any-award-made-to--the--claimant+--If the-respondent-is-awarded-attorney-feesy-the-amount-shall-be 12 13 included--in-the-record-of-the-trialy--The-district-court-in the-county-in-which-the-claim-is-heard-shally-at-the-request 14 15 of-any-partyy-determine-the-reasonableness-of--each--party\*s attorney-fees-ordered-paid-by-the-other-party-The-court 16 17 shall-take-into-consideration-the-following: {+}--the-time--and--labor--requiredy--the--novelty--and 18 difficulty---of----the--questions--involvedy--and--the--skill 19 20 requisite-to-perform-the-legal-services-properlyt 21 {2}--the-likelihoody-if-apparent-to--the---clienty--that 22 the--acceptance--of--the--particular--employment--would-have 23 precluded-other-employment-by-the-attorney; 24 (3)--the-fee-customarily-charged-in--the--locality--for 25 similar-legal-servicest

-16-

-15-

HB 647

#### HB 0647/02

11

•

Ł	{+}the-amount-involved-and-the-results-obtained;
z	<del>(5)thetimelimitations-imposed-by-the-client-or-by</del>
3	other-c <del>ircumstances</del> ;
4	<del>{6}thenatureondlengthoftheprofessional</del>
5	relationship-with-the-attorney-and-client;-ond
6	<del>{7}theexperienceyreputationyandability-of-th</del> e
7	attorney-performing-the-services.
8	Section 18. Proofoffinancialresponsibility
9	insurancecash-or-surety-bond <u>REQUIREMENT_FOR_INSURANCE_OR</u>
10	<u>SELE-INSURANCE</u> . <del>{!}</del> -Each-health-care-provider-subject-to-the
11	terms-of-this-act-shally-within-30-days-after-this-act-takes
12	effecty-file-with-thesecretoryyinamannerprescribed
13	therebys-proof-of-financial-responsibilitys
14	<del>{2}[1]</del> Each health care provider <del>, except as provided</del>
15	<del>by[section24]</del> shall acquire and maintain in force
15	professional liability insurance of not less than \$250,000
17	for each occurrence and \$500,000 in the aggregate for all
18	claims occurring in any one policy year or, as an
19	alternative, qualify as a self-insurer upon making proper
20	application and being approved by the commissioner of
21	insurance.
22	<del>[3][2]</del> Self-insurance subject to approval by the
23	commissioner of insurance is effected by filing with the
24	commissioner in satisfactory form:

25 (a) a continued undertaking by the health care

,

-17-

HB 647

provider to pay any award rendered under this act<del>y except as</del>
 provided--by--[section--24]v to the first \$250,000 for each
 incident and to \$500,000 in the aggregate for all claims
 occurring in any one year; and
 (b) evidence that appropriate provision exists for

prompt and efficient administration of all claims; and
(c) evidence that reliable financial arrangements,
deposits, or commitments exist providing coverage
substantially equivalent to that afforded by a policy of
insurance required in subsection (2) of this section for the

Section 19. Failure to--provide--proof--of--financial responsibility-----failure or refusal to accept panel determination. (1) A health care provider is subject to liability under the laws of this state with respect to a claim, without regard to the provisions of this act<del>y-except</del>

payment of medical liability claims.

17 as-provided-in-[section-26] if he fails or refuses to:

10 (b)(A) pay the annual assessment provided for in 21 [section 2621], in a manner and amount fixed by the 22 secretary; or

23 (c)(8) within 10 days of receipt of the final
24 determination of the panel, communicate in writing to the
25 secretary his acceptance of the final determination of the

-18-

### H8 0647/02

1 panel.

2 (2) Any claimant who fails or refuses to, within 10
3 days of receipt of the final determination of the panel,
4 communicate in writing to the secretary his acceptance of
5 the determination of the panel may proceed with the claim as
6 otherwise allowed by the laws of this state, without regard
7 to the provisions of this act<del>v-except-es-provided-in</del>
8 [section-26].

9 10 If-suit-in-s-court-of-competent-jurisdiction-is-available-to 11 any--party-under-the-terms-of-this-acty-the-party-may-pursue 12 the-claim-after-filing-of-the--complaint--only--upon--filing 13 bond--in--the--amount--of--\$2y000y--secured--by--cash-or-its 14 equivalenty-with-the-clerk-of-court-in-the-court--in--which 15 the-claim-is-filedy-payable-to-the-opposing-party-or-parties 16 for--costs--assessedy-including-witness-and-experts\*-fee-and any-other-costs-allowed-by-lows-if-the--party--purswing--the 17 18 elsim-does-not-prevail-in-the-final-judgments 19 t2}--The--court--mayy--upon--notion--of--either--of-the 20 partissy-increase-the-amount-of--the--bond--required--to--be 21 filed-Upon-motion-filed-by-the-claimant-and-a-determination

22 by--the--court--ofter-hearing-that-the-claimant-is-indigenty
23 the-court-may-reduce-the-amount-of-the-bond-so-required--but
24 may--not--climinate-the-requirement-therefory-if-the-bond-is
25 not-posted-within-30-days-of-the-filing-of-the-complaint--or

-19-

HB 647

25

1 the--determination--of--the--court-as-to-a-larger-or-smaller 2 bondy-whichever-is-latery-the-action-shall-be-dismissed-with 3 prejudice-to-the-claimant\* 4 Section-26----Admissibility-of-determination-of--hearing 5 ponelu---The--determination-of-the-hearing-panel-required-by 6 Fsection-14]-may-be-admitted-into-evidence-in-any-subsequent 7 8 determination-as-to-damages-may-be-admitted-into-evidence-at 9 trisls--Parties-mayy-in-the-opening-statement-or-argument-to 10 the--court-or--juryy-comment-on-the-panel\*s-conclusion-in-the 11 same-manner-as-env-other-evidence-introduced-st--trials--The 12 numerical-vote-of-the-panel-is-admissibles-Panel-members-may 13 not--be--called-to-testify-as-to-the-merits-of-the-cases-The 14 ivry-shall-be---instructed--that--the--determination--of--the 15 hearing--ponel--required--by--fsection-141-raises-a-rebuttal 16 presumption--in--favor--of--its--conclusiony--which--woy--be 17 controverted--by--other--evidencey--direct--or-indirecty-but 18 unless-so-controverted-the-jury-is-bound-to--find--according 19 to-the-oresumptions 20 21 The--administration--of--this--act--shall--be-funded-from-an 22 annual-assessmenty-which-shall-be-paid-by-each--health--core 23 providers--The--amount--of--assessment--shall--be-set-by-the 24 secretaryy-who-shall--collect--and--receive--the--funds--for

exclusive--use--for--the--purposes-stated-in-this-acty-based

-20-

1	upon-the-experience-rating-oftheclassificationofthe
2	varioushealthcare-providerss-Surplus-fundsy-if-anyy-over
3	and-above-the-amount-required-for-the-annualadministration
4	oftheactshall-be-retained-by-the-secretary-and-used-to
5	finance-the-administration-of-this-act-in-succeedingyearsy
6	inwhicheventthesecretaryshallreducetheannual
7	essessment-in-subsequent-yearsy-commensurate-with-the-proper
đ	administration-of-this-act.

9 t2)--Payment-of-all-awards-accepted-by-the--parties--as provided--in--[section--24]--shell--be-from-the-professional 10 listificy-insurance-or-from-satisfaction-of-the--undertaking 11 provided--for---in-[section-23]+-To-the-extent-such-insurance 12 or-undertaking-is-insufficient-to-pay-the-full-amount-of-the 13 awordy-the-balance-shall-be-paid-from-a-fund-established-for 14 sucn-seficienciesy-by-appropriation-from-the-general-fund-of 15 15 this-states

SECTION 20. PANEL DETERMINATION NOT ADMISSIBLE. THE 17 DETERMINATION OF THE HEARING PANEL IS NOT ADMISSIBLE AS 13 EVIDENCE IN ANY ACTION SUBSEQUENTLY BROUGHT IN ANY COURT OF 19 LAN. PANELISTS MAY NOT BE CALLED TO LESTIFY IN ANY ACTION 20 SUBSEQUENTLY BROUGHT IN ANY COURT OF LAW, AND PANELISIS AND 21 HIINESSES ARE IMMUNE FROM CIVIL LIABILITY FOR ALL 22 COMMUNICATIONS. FINDINGS. OPINIONS. AND CONCLUSIONS MADE IN 23 THE COURSE AND SCOPE OF THE DUTIES PRESCRIBED BY THIS ACT. 24 NO STATEMENT MADE BY ANY PERSON DURING & HEARING BEFORE THE 25

НВ	0647/02

1	PANEL MAY BE USED AS IMPEACHING EVIDENCE IN COURT.
2	SECTION 21. FUNDING. (1) THERE IS CREATED A PREIRIAL
3	REVIEW PANEL FUND TO BE COLLECTED BY THE SECRETARY FOR
4	EXCLUSIVE USE FOR THE PURPOSES STATED IN THIS ACT. THE FUND
5	AND ANY INCOME FROM IT SHALL BE HELD IN TRUST. DEPOSITED IN
6	AN ACCOUNT. INVESTED AND REINVESTED BY THE SECRETARY WITH
7	THE PRIOR APPROVAL OF THE DIRECTOR OF THE MONTANA MEDICAL
8	ASSOCIATION: AND MAY NOT BECOME A PART OF OR REVERT TO THE
9	GENERAL FUND OF THIS STATE, BUT SHALL BE OPEN TO INSPECTION
10	AND AUDITING BY THE LEGISLATIVE AUDITOR.
11	(2) TO ESTABLISH THE FUND+ AN ANNUAL SURCHARGE SHALL
12	BE LEVIED ON ALL HEALTH CARE PROVIDERS. THE AMOUNT OF THE
13	ASSESSMENT SHALL BE SET BY THE SECRETARY. WHO SHALL ALLOCATE
14	A PROJECTED COST AMONG HEALTH CARE PROVIDERS ON A PER CAPITA
15	BASIS AND SUCH OTHER RELEVANT FACTORS AS THE SECRETARY
16	DESIGNATES BY RULE. SURPLUS FUNDS. IF ANY. DVER AND ABOVE
17	THE AMOUNT REQUIRED FOR THE ANNUAL ADMINISTRATION OF THIS
18	ACT SHALL BE RETAINED BY THE SECRETARY AND USED TO FINANCE
19	THE ADMINISTRATION OF THIS ACT IN SUCCEEDING YEARS. IN WHICH
20	EVENT THE SECRETARY SHALL REDUCE THE ANNUAL ASSESSMENT IN
21	SUBSEQUENT YEARS. COMMENSURATE MITH THE PROPER
22	ADMINISTRATION OF THIS ACT.
23	(3) THE ANNUAL SURCHARGE IS DUE AND PAYABLE ON THE
24	SAME DATE AS LICENSE FEES PAYABLE TO THE STATE OF MONTANA
25	ARE_DUE.

-22-

HB 647

1

.

Section 22. Conflict. The provisions of this act shall
 govern if a conflict arises between this act and other
 provisions of the laws of Montana.

4 Section 23. Severability. If a part of this act is 5 invalid, all valid parts that are severable from the invalid 6 part remain in effect. If a part of this act is invalid in 7 one or more of its applications, the part remains in effect 8 in all valid applications that are severable from the 9 invalid applications.

Section 24. Effective date. This act is effective
 January 1, 1978.

~End-

April 2, 1977

# STANDING COMMITTEE REPORT Senate Committee on Judiciary

That House Bill No. 647 be amended as follows:

1. Amend title, lines 5 through 12.
Following: "PANEL"
Strike: lines 5 through 12 in their entirety
Insert: "FOR MEDICAL MALPRACTICE CLAIMS"

2. Amend title, line 14.
Following: "PROVIDING"
Strike: " A DELAYED"
Insert: "AN IMMEDIATE"

3. Amend page 1, line 18, through page 23, line 11. Following: line 17 Strike: all of the bill following the enacting clause Insert: (see attached)

"Section 1. Short title. This act may be cited as the "Montana Medical Malpractice Panel Act".

Section 2. Purpose. The purpose of this act is to prevent where possible the filing in court of actions against health care providers and their employees for professional liability in situations where the facts do not permit at least a reasonable inference of malpractice and to make possible the fair and equitable disposition of such claims against health care providers as are or reasonably may be well founded.

Section 3. Definitions. As used in this act, the following definitions apply:

(1) "Health care provider" means a physician licensed to practice medicine in Montana or a hospital, nospital-related facility, or long-term care facility.

(2) "Malpractice claim" means any claim or potential claim against a health care provider for medical treatment, lack of medical treatment, or other alleged departure from accepted standards of health care which proximately results in damage to the patient, whether the patient's claim or potential claim sounds in tort or contract, and includes but is not limited to allegations of battery or wrongful death.

(3) "Panel" means the Montana medical malpractice panel provided for in [section 4].

Section 4. Montana medical maluractice panel. (1) The Montana medical malpractice panel is created. The panel is attached to the Montana subreme court for administrative purposes only, except that 82A-108(2) does not apply. The panel shall review all malpractice claims or potential claims against health care providers covered by this act, except those claims subject to a valid arbitration agreement allowed by law or upon which suit has been filed prior to the effective date of this act. April 2, 1977 Page 2 House Bill No. 647

(2) Those eligible to sit on the panel are health care providers licensed pursuant to Montana law and residing in Montana and the members of the state bar of Montana.

(3) Claimants shall submit a case for the consideration of the panel prior to filing a complaint in any district court or other court sitting in Montana by addressing an application, in writing, signed by the patient or his attorney, to the director of the panel.

(4) The director of the panel shall be appointed by the executive director of the Montana medical association, subject to the approval of the chief justice of the Montana supreme court. The director shall serve at the pleasure of, and the director's salary shall be set by, the executive director of the Montana medical association, subject to the approval of the chief justice.

Section 5. Compensation of the panel and staff -facilities for offices and hearings. (1) All members of the panel shall be paid a salary in the amount of \$40 an hour, under ouidelines promulgated by the Montana supreme court.

(2) All members of the panel, the director, and his staff are entitled to travel expenses incurred while on the business of the panel, as provided in 59-538, 59-539, and 59-801, but such expenses shall be approved by the director before payment is made.

(3) The panel may provide for the administration of oaths, the receipt of claims filed, the promulgation of forms required by this act, the issuance of subpoenas in

connection with the administration of this act, and the performance of all other acts required to fairly and effectively administer this act.

(4) The director, subject to the approval of the chief justice, may employ and fix the compensation for clerical and other assistants as he considers necessary.

(5) The panel shall maintain adequate offices, in which its records shall be kept and its official business transacted.

(5) Panel hearings may be held in any county the panel considers necessary or advisable. The county commissioners or other governing authority shall provide, upon request of the director of the panel, suitable facilities for any such hearing.

Section 6. Funding of act. (1) There is created a pretrial review fund to be administered by the director exclusively for the purposes stated in this act. The fund and any income from it shall be held in trust, deposited in an account, and invested and reinvested by the director with the prior approval of the director of the Montana medical association. The fund may not become a part of or revert to the general fund of this state but shall be open to auditing by the legislative auditor.

(2) To create the fund, an annual surcharge shall be levied on all health care providers. The amount of the assessment shall be set by the director, who shall allocate a projected cost among health care providers on a per capita April 2, 1977 Page 3 House Bill No. 647

> basis. The director may provide a different allocation upon approval by the supreme court. Surplus funds, if any, over and above the amount required for the annual administration of the act shall be retained by the director and used to finance the administration of this act in succeeding years, in which event the director shall reduce the annual assessment in subsequent years, commensurate with the proper administration of this act.

> (3) The annual surcharge for 1977 shall be paid on or before September 1, 1977, and annually thereafter on or before the date physicians' annual registration fees are due under 66-1042. The director has the same powers and duties in connection with the collection of and failure to pay the annual surcharge as the department of professional and occupational licensing has under 66-1042 in connection with physicians' annual registration fees.

> section 7. Panel decision required -- application. (1) No malpractice claim may be filed in any court against a health care provider before an application is made to the panel and its decision is rendered.

(2) The application shall contain the following:

(a) a statement in reasonable detail of the elements of the health care provider's conduct which are believed to constitute a malpractice claim, the dates the conduct occurred, and the names and addresses of all physicians and hospitals having contact with the claimant and all witnesses. Any amendments to the application must be filed not less than 14 days prior to the hearing date.

(b) a statement authorizing the panel to obtain access to all medical and hospital records and information pertaining to the claim and, for the purposes of its consideration of this matter only, waiving any privilege as to the contents of those records. Nothing in that statement

may in any way be construed as waiving that privilege for any other purpose or in any other context, in or out of court.

Section 8. Application procedure. (1) Upon receipt of an application for review, the director or his delegate shall cause to be served a true copy of the application on the health care providers involved. Service shall be effected pursuant to the Montana rules of civil procedure. If a health care provider involved chooses to retain legal counsel, his attorney shall informally enter his appearance with the director.

health care provider shall answer the The (2)review and shall submit a statement application tor authorizing the panel to inspect all medical and hospital and information pertaining to the application and. records for the purposes of such inspection only. waiving any privilege as to the contents of those records. Nothing in the statement waives that privilege for any other purpose.

(3) In instances where applications are received employing a theory of respondeat superior or some other derivative theory of recovery, the director shall forward the application to the state professional societies, associations, or licensing boards of both the individual April 2, 1977 Page 4 House Bill No. 647

health care provider whose alleged malpractice caused the application to be filed and the health? provider named a respondent as employer, master, or principal.

(4) The panel director shall cooperate fully with the claimant in retaining a physician qualified in the field of medicine involved, who will consult with the claimant upon payment of a reasonable fee by the claimant.

Section 9. Panel selection. (1) Application for review shall be promptly transmitted by the director to the directors of the health care provider's state professional society or association and the state bar, which shall each select three panelists within 30 days from the date of transmittal of the application.

(2) If no state professional society or association exists or if the nealth care provider does not belong to such a society or association, the director shall transmit the application to the health care provider's state licensing board, which shall in turn select three persons from the health care provider's profession, and where applicable, to persons specializing in the same field or discipline as the health care provider.

(3) Whenever there are multiple defendants, the case against each health care provider may be reviewed by a separate panel, or at the discretion of the panel initially appointed or by stipulation of the parties, a single combined panel may review all the claims against all parties defendant.

(4) Inree banel members from the health care provider's profession and three panel members from the state bar shall sit in review of each case.

(5) In those cases where the theory of respondent superior or some other derivative theory of recovery is employed, two of the panel members shall be chosen from the individual health care provider's profession and one panel member shall be chosen from the profession of the health care provider named a respondent as employer, master, or principal.

(6) Any member shall disqualify himself from consideration of any case in which, by virtue of his circumstances, he feels his presence on the panel would be inappropriate, considering the purpose of the panel. The director may excuse a proposed panelist from serving.

(/) Whenever a party makes and files an affidavit that a panel member selected pursuant to this section cannot, according to the belief of the party making the affidavit, sit in review of the application with impartiality, that panel member may proceed no further. Another panel member must be selected by the health care provider's professional association, state licensing board, or the state bar, as the case may be. A party may not disqualify more than three panel members in this manner in any single malpractice claim, and the affidavit must be filed at least 20 days prior to the date of hearing. April 2, 1977 Page 5 House Bill No. 647

> Section 10. Time and place of hearing. A date, time, and place for hearing shall be fixed by the director subject to [section 5(6) of this act], and prompt notice thereof shall be given to the parties involved, the attorneys, and the members of the panel. In no instance may the date set be more than 120 days after the transmittal by the director of the application for review unless the panel finds good cause exists for extending the period.

> Section 11. Hearing procedures. (1) At the time set for hearing, the claimant submitting the case for review shall be present and shall make a brief introduction of his case, including a resume of the facts constituting the alleged professional malpractice which he is prepared to prove. The health care provider against whom the claim is brought and his attorney may be present and may make an introductory statement of his case.

> (2) Both parties may call witnesses to testify before the panel, which witnesses shall be sworn. Medical texts, journals, studies, and other documentary evidence relied upon by either party may be offered and admitted if relevant. Written statements of facts by treating health care providers may be reviewed.

> (3) The hearing will be informal, and no official transcript may be made.

> (4) At the conclusion of the hearing, the banel may take the case under advisement or may request that additional facts, records, witnesses, or other information be obtained and presented to it at a supplemental hearing, which shall be set for a date and time certain, not longer than 30 days from the date of the original hearing unless the attorney bringing the matter for review consents in writing to a longer period.

> (5) Any supplemental hearing shall be held in the same manner as the original hearing, and the parties concerned and their attorneys may be present.

(6) No panel member may be called to testify in any proceeding concerning the deliberations, discussions, decisions, and internal proceedings of the panel.

(7) No statement made by any person during a hearing before the panel may be used as impeaching evidence in court.

(8) At least 10 days prior to the hearing, the director shall furnish to each panel member copies of all claims, briefs, medical records, and other documents the

director considers necessary.

section 12. Panel deliberations and decisions. (1) At or prior to the time set for the hearing, the attorney members of the panel shall select a chairman who shall be an attorney and who shall preside over the panel deliberations. The deliberations of the panel are confidential. Upon consideration of all the relevant material, the panel shall decide:

(a) whether there is substantial evidence that the acts complained of occurred and that they constitute malpractice; and

April 2, 1977 Page 6 House Bill No. 647

(b) whether there is a reasonable medical probability that the patient was injured thereby.

(2) All votes of the panel on the questions for discussion shall be by secret ballot. The decision shall be by a majority vote of those voting members of the panel who sat on the entire case. The decision shall be communicated in writing to the parties and attorneys concerned, and a copy thereof shall be retained in the permanent files of the panel.

(3) The decision shall in every case be signed for the panel by the chairman and shall contain only the conclusions reached by a majority of its members and shall list the number of members, if any, dissenting therefrom. The majority may briefly explain the reasoning and the basis for their decision, and the dissenters may likewise explain the reason for disagreement.

(4) The report of the medical review panel is not admissible as evidence in any action subsequently brought in any court of law. The copy of the report shall be sent to the health care provider's professional licensing board.

(5) Panelists and witnesses are absolutely immune from civil liability for all communications, findings, opinions, and conclusions made in the course and scope of the duties prescribed by this act.

(6) The panel's decision is without administrative or judicial authority and is not binding upon any party. The panel may recommend an award, approve settlement agreements, and discuss the same, all in a manner not inconsistent with this section, and all such approved settlement agreements are binding on the parties.

Section 13. Director -- rules of procedure. The director, in consultation with the state bar of Montana and subject to approval of the supreme court, is authorized to adopt and publish rules of procedure necessary to implement and carry out the duties of the medical review panel. No rules may be adopted, however, which require a party to make a monetary payment as a condition to bringing a malpractice claim before the medical review panel.

Section 14. Tolling of the statute of limitations. The cunning of the applicable limitation period in a malpractice claim is tolled upon receipt by the director of the application for review and does not begin again until 30 days after the panel's final decision is entered in the permanent files of the panel and a copy is served upon the cumplainant and his attorney by certified mail.

Section 15. Maintenance of records. The director shall maintain records of all proceedings before the panel which must include the nature of the act or omissions complained of, a brief summary of the evidence expressed, the decision

of the panel, and any majority or dissenting opinions filed. Any records which may identify any party to the proceedings may of be made public and are not subject to subpoena, but are to be used solely for the purpose of compiling statistical data and facilitating ongoing studies of medical malpractice in Montana. April 2, 1977 Page 7 House Bill No. 647

Section 16. Saving clause. This act does not apply to acts of malpractice occurring prior to its effective date.

Section 17. Severability. If a part of this act is invalid, all valid parts that are severable from the invalid part remain in effect. If a part of this act is invalid in one or more of its applications, the part remains in effect in all valid applications that are severable from the invalid applications.

Section 18. Effective date. This act is effective upon its passage and approval. "

H8 0647/03

1	HOUSE BILL ND. 647
2	INTRODUCED BY SCULLY
3	
4	A BILL FOR AN ACT ENTITLED: "AN ACT TO ESTABLISH A
5	NANDATORY PRETRIAL REVIEW PANEL <del>TO-HEAR-AND-DETERMINE-ELAINS</del>
6	F <del>ORMEDICALLIABILITY:-TO-ESTABLISH-RULES;-PROCEOURES;-AND</del>
1	FACILITIES-TO-IMPLEMENT-AND-ACCOMPLISH-THEPURPOSEOFTHE
8	*&T+T8-PR8 <del>VIDE-F8R-&amp;-S&amp;HEDULE-8F-&amp;8MPENS&amp;TI8N-&amp;ND-BENEFITS</del>
9	<del>FBR-ANARDS+-T8-GUARANTEETHEFINANCIALRESPONSIDILITYOF</del>
10	HEALTHEAREPROVIDERS <u>TO-REQUIRE-PROFESSIONAL-LIABILITY</u>
11	<u>INSURANCE-FOR-HEALTH-CAREPROVIDERST</u> ANDTOPROVIDETHE
12	SOURCEFOR-THE-FUNDING-OF-THE-ADMINISTRATION-OF-THE-ACT-AND
13	THE-PAYNENT-OF-AWARDSt-AND-OTHERWISE-AMENDING-THEINSURANCE
14	LAWSWITHRESPECTTOSUCHPANEL FOR MEDICAL MALPRACTICE
15	<u>CLAIMS;</u> PROVIDING A-DELAYED AN IMMEDIATE EFFECTIVE DATE."
16	
17	BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF MONTANA:
18	Refer to Third Reading Bill
19	(Strike everything after enacting clause and insert:)
20	Section 1. Short title. This act may be cited as the

21 "Montana Medical Halpractice Panel Act".

Section 2. Purpose. The purpose of this act is to 22 prevent where possible the filing in court of actions 23 against health care providers and their employees for 24 professional liability in situations where the facts do not 25

1 permit at least a reasonable inference of maloractice and to 2 make possible the fair and equitable disposition of such 3 claims against health care providers as are or reasonably 4 may be well founded.

Section 3. Definitions. As used in this act. the 5 following definitions apply: 6

7 (1) "Health care provider" means a physician licensed 8 to practice medicine in Montana or a hospital, 9 hospital-related facility, or long-term care facility.

10 (2) "Malpractice claim" means any claim or potential 11 claim against a health care provider for medical treatment, 12 lack of medical treatment, or other alleged departure from 13 accepted standards of health care which proximately results 14 in damage to the patient, whether the patient's claim or 15 potential claim sounds in tort or contract, and includes but is not limited to allegations of battery or wrongful death. 16 17 (3) "Panel" means the Montana medical malpractice 18 panel provided for in [section 4].

19 Section 4. Montana medical malpractice panel. (1) The 20 Montana medical malpractice panel is created. The panel is 21 attached to the Montana supreme court for administrative 22 purposes only, except that 82A-108(2) does not apply. The 23 panel shall review all malpractice claims or potential 24 claims against health care providers covered by this act, 25 except those claims subject to a valid arbitration agreement

## REFERENCE BILL

-2-

HB 647

allowed by law or upon which suit has been filed prior to
 the effective date of this act.

3 (2) Those eligible to sit on the panel are health care
4 providers licensed pursuant to Montana law and residing in
5 Montana and the members of the state bar of Montana.

6 (3) Claimants shall submit a case for the 7 consideration of the panel prior to filing a complaint in 8 any district court or other court sitting in Montana by 9 addressing an application, in writing, signed by the patient 10 or his attorney, to the director of the panel.

11 (4) The director of the panel shall be appointed by 12 the executive director of the Montana medical association, 13 subject to the approval of the chief justice of the Montana 14 supreme court. The director shall serve at the pleasure of, 15 and the director's salary shall be set by, the executive 16 director of the Montana medical association, subject to the 17 approval of the chief justice.

Section 5. Compensation of the panel and staff -facilities for offices and hearings. (1) All members of the panel shall be paid a salary in the amount of \$40 an hour; under quidelines promulgated by the Montana supreme court.

(2) All members of the panel, the director, and his
staff are entitled to travel expenses incurred while on the
business of the panel, as provided in 59-538, 59-539, and
59-801, 'but such expenses shall be approved by the director

-3-

1 before payment is made.

2 (3) The panel may provide for the administration of 3 oaths, the receipt of claims filed, the promulgation of forms required by this act, the issuance of subpoenas in 4 5 connection with the administration of this act, and the performance of all other acts required to fairly and 5 effectively administer this act. 7 (4) The director, subject to the approval of the chief в 9 justice, may employ and fix the compensation for clerical 10 and other assistants as he considers necessary. 11 (5) The panel shall maintain adequate offices, in which its records shall be kept and its official business 12 13 transacted. (6) Panel hearings may be held in any county the panel 14 considers necessary or advisable. The county commissioners 15 16 or other governing authority shall provide, upon request of 17 the director of the panel, suitable facilities for any such 18 hearing. Section 6. Funding of act. (1) There is created a 19 20 pretrial review fund to be administered by the director 21 exclusively for the purposes stated in this act. The fund

22 and any income from it shall be held in trust, deposited in

23 an account, and invested and reinvested by the director with

24 the prior approval of the director of the Montana medical

25 association. The fund may not become a part of or revert to

-4--

the general fund of this state but shall be open to auditing
 by the legislative auditor.

(2) To create the fund, an annual surcharge shall be 3 levied on all health care providers. The amount of the 4 assessment shall be set by the director, who shall allocate 5 a projected cost among health care providers on a per capita 6 basis. The director may provide a different allocation upon 1 8 approval by the supreme court. Surplus funds, if any, over and above the amount required for the annual administration 9 of the act shall be retained by the director and used to 10 11 finance the administration of this act in succeeding years, in which event the director shall reduce the annual 12 assessment in subsequent years, commensurate with the proper 13 14 administration of this act.

15 (3) The annual surcharge for 1977 shall be paid on or before September 1, 1977, and annually thereafter on or 16 before the date physicians' annual registration fees are due 17 under 66-1042. The director has the same powers and duties 18 in connection with the collection of and failure to pay the 19 annual surcharge as the department of professional and 20 occupational licensing has under 66-1042 in connection with 21 physicians! annual registration fees. 22

Section 7. Panel decision required -- application. (1)
 No malpractice claim may be filed in any court against a
 health care provider before an application is made to the

-5-

HB 647

1 panel and its decision is rendered.

2 (2) The application shall contain the following: 3 (a) a statement in reasonable detail of the elements 4 of the health care provider's conduct which are believed to constitute a malpractice claim, the dates the conduct 5 6 occurred, and the names and addresses of all physicians and 7 hospitals having contact with the claimant and all я witnesses. Any amendments to the application must be filed not less than 14 days prior to the hearing date. 9

10 (b) a statement authorizing the panel to obtain access 11 all medical and hospital records and information to 12 pertaining to the claim and, for the purposes of its consideration of this matter only, waiving any privilege as 13 14 to the contents of those records. Nothing in that statement 15 may in any way be construed as waiving that privilege for 16 any other purpose or in any other context, in or out of 17 court.

18 Section 8. Application procedure. (1) Upon receipt of 19 an application for review, the director or his delegate 20 shall cause to be served a true copy of the application on 21 the health care providers involved. Service shall be 22 effected pursuant to the Montana rules of civil procedure. 23 If a health care provider involved chooses to retain legal counsel, his attorney shall informally enter his appearance 24 25 with the director.

HB 0647/03

1

-6-

1 (2) The health care provider shall answer the 2 application for review and shall submit a statement 3 authorizing the panel to inspect all medical and hospital 4 records and information pertaining to the application and. 5 for the purposes of such inspection only, waiving any privilege as to the contents of those records. Nothing in 6 7 the statement waives that privilege for any other purpose. 8 (3) In instances where applications are received 9 employing a theory of respondeat superior or some other 10 derivative theory of recovery, the director shall forward the application to the state professional societies, 11 12 associations, or licensing boards of both the individual 13 health care provider whose alleged malpractice caused the 14 application to be filed and the health care provider named a 15 respondent as employer, master, or principal.

16 (4) The panel director shall cooperate fully with the 17 claimant in retaining a physician qualified in the field of 18 medicine involved, who will consult with the claimant upon 19 payment of a reasonable fee by the claimant.

20 Section 9. Panel selection. (1) Application for review 21 shall be promptly transmitted by the director to the 22 directors of the health care provider's state professional 23 society or association and the state bar, which shall each 24 select three panelists within 30 days from the date of 25 transmittal of the application.

1 (2) If no state professional society or association 2 exists or if the health care provider does not belong to 3 such a society or association, the director shall transmit the application to the health care provider's state 4 licensing board, which shall in turn select three persons 5 from the health care provider's profession, and where 6 applicable, to persons specializing in the same field or 7 8 discipline as the health care provider. 9 (3) Whenever there are multiple defendants, the case 10 against each health care provider may be reviewed by a 11 separate panel, or at the discretion of the panel initially 14 appointed of by stipulation of the parties, a single 13 combined panel may review all the claims against all parties defendant. 14 15 (4) Three panel members from the health care 16 provider's profession and three panel members from the state 17 bar shall sit in review of each case. 18 (5) In those cases where the theory of respondeat 19 superior or some other derivative theory of recovery is 20 employed, two of the panel members shall be chosen from the

- individual health care provider's profession and one panel
  member shall be chosen from the profession of the health
  care provider named a respondent as employer, master, or
- 24 principal.
- 25 (6) Any member shall disqualify himself from

-8-

HB 647

consideration of any case in which, by virtue of his
 circumstances, he feels his presence on the panel would be
 inappropriate, considering the purpose of the panel. The
 director may excuse a proposed panelist from serving.

5 (7) Whenever a party makes and files an affidavit that a panel member selected pursuant to this section cannot. 6 7 according to the belief of the party making the affidavit, sit in review of the application with impartiality, that 8 9 panel member may proceed no further. Another panel member 10 must be selected by the health care provider's professional 11 association, state licensing board, or the state bar, as the 12 case may be. A party may not disqualify more than three 13 panel members in this manner in any single malpractice claim, and the affidavit must be filed at least 20 days 14 15 prior to the date of hearing.

16 Section 10. Time and place of hearing. A date, time. 17 and place for hearing shall be fixed by the director subject 18 to [section 5(6) of this act], and prompt notice thereof 19 shall be given to the parties involved, the attorneys, and 20 the members of the panel. In no instance may the date set be 21 more than 120 days after the transmittal by the director of 22 the application for review unless the panel finds good cause exists for extending the period. 23

24 Section 11. Hearing procedures. (1) At the time set 25 for hearing, the claimant submitting the case for review 1 shall be present and shall make a brief introduction of his
2 case, including a resume of the facts constituting the
3 alleged professional malpractice which he is prepared to
4 prove. The health care provider against whom the claim is
5 brought and his attorney may be present and may make an
6 introductory statement of his case.

7 (2) Both parties may call witnesses to testify before 8 the panel, which witnesses shall be sworn. Medical texts, 9 journals, studies, and other documentary evidence relied 10 upon by either party may be offered and admitted if 11 relevant. Written statements of facts by treating health 12 care providers may be reviewed.

13 (3) The hearing will be informal, and no official14 transcript may be made.

(4) At the conclusion of the hearing, the panel may 15 16 take the case under advisement or may request that 17 additional facts, records, witnesses, or other information 18 be obtained and presented to it at a supplemental hearing. 19 which shall be set for a date and time certain, not longer 20 than 30 days from the date of the original hearing unless 21 the attorney bringing the matter for review consents in writing to a longer period. 22

(5) Any supplemental hearing shall be held in the same
manner as the original hearing, and the parties concerned
and their attorneys may be present.

-10-

-9-

1 (6) No panel member may be called to testify in any 2 proceeding concerning the deliberations, discussions, 3 decisions, and internal proceedings of the panel.

4 (7) No statement made by any person during a hearing
5 before the panel may be used as impeaching evidence in
6 court.

7 (8) At least 10 days prior to the hearing, the
 8 director shall furnish to each panel member copies of all
 9 claims, briefs, medical records, and other documents the
 10 director considers necessary.

Section 12. Panel deliberations and decisions. (1) At or prior to the time set for the hearing, the attorney members of the panel shall select a chairman who shall be an attorney and who shall preside over the panel deliberations. The deliberations of the panel are confidential. Upon consideration of all the relevant material, the panel shall decide:

18 (a) whether there is substantial evidence that the
19 acts complained of occurred and that they constitute
20 malpractice; and

(b) whether there is a reasonable medical probabilitythat the patient was injured thereby.

(2) All votes of the panel on the questions for
discussion shall be by secret ballot. The decision shall be
by a majority vote of those voting members of the panel who

-11- НВ 647

sat on the entire case. The decision shall be communicated
 in writing to the parties and attorneys concerned, and a
 copy thereof shall be retained in the permanent files of the
 panel.

5 (3) The decision shall in every case be signed for the 6 panel by the chairman and shall contain only the conclusions 7 reached by a majority of its members and shall list the 8 number of members, if any, dissenting therefrom. The 9 majority may briefly explain the reasoning and the basis for 10 their decision, and the dissenters may likewise explain the 11 reason for disagreement.

1.2 (4) The report of the medical review panel is not 13 admissible as evidence in any action subsequently brought in 14 any court of law. The copy of the report shall be sent to 15 the health care provider's professional licensing board.

16 (5) Panelists and witnesses are absolutely immune from
17 civil liability for all communications, findings, opinions,
18 and conclusions made in the course and scope of the duties
19 prescribed by this act.

(6) The panel's decision is without administrative or
judicial authority and is not binding upon any party. The
panel may recommend an award, approve settlement agreements,
and discuss the same, all in a manner not inconsistent with
this section, and all such approved settlement agreements

-12-

25 are binding on the parties.

Section 13. Director -- rules of procedure. The 1 director. in consultation with the state bar of Montana and 2 subject to approval of the supreme court, is authorized to 3 adopt and publish rules of procedure necessary to implement 4 and carry out the duties of the medical review panel. No 5 rules may be adopted, however, which require a party to make 6 7 a monetary payment as a condition to bringing a maloractice 8 claim before the medical review panel.

9 Section 14. Tolling of the statute of limitations. The 10 running of the applicable limitation period in a malpractice 11 claim is tolled upon receipt by the director of the 12 application for review and does not begin again until 30 13 days after the panel's final decision is entered in the 14 permanent files of the panel and a copy is served upon the 15 complainant and his attorney by certified mail.

16 Section 15. Naintenance of records. The director shall maintain records of all proceedings before the panel which 17 must include the nature of the act or omissions complained 16 19 of, a brief summary of the evidence expressed, the decision 20 of the panel, and any majority or dissenting opinions filed. 21 Any records which may identify any party to the proceedings may not be made public and are not subject to subpoena, but 22 23 are to be used solely for the purpose of compiling 24 statistical data and facilitating ongoing studies of medical 25 malpractice in Montana.

HB 0647/03

1Section 16. Saving clause. This act does not apply to2acts of malpractice occurring prior to its effective date.

3 Section 17. Severability. If a part of this act is 4 invalid, all valid parts that are severable from the invalid 5 part remain in effect. If a part of this act is invalid in 6 one or more of its applications, the part remains in effect 7 in all valid applications that are severable from the 8 invalid applications.

9 Section 18. Effective date. This act is effective upon

its passage and approval.

10

-End-