# MINUTES OF THE MEETING JUDICIARY COMMITTEE SOTH LEGISLATIVE SESSION HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

The meeting of the Judiciary Committee was called to order in room 312 D of the Capitol on January 23, 1987 at 8:00 a.m.by Chairman Earl Lory.

<u>ROLL CALL</u>: All members were present with the exception of Rep. Mercer and Rep. Miles who were excused.

### EXECUTIVE ACTION:

# ACTION ON HOUSE BILL NO. 79, (Exhibit A):

<u>REP. GOULD</u> moved <u>DO PASS</u> as amended. Question called and a voice vote was taken. All members voted <u>DO PASS</u> except for Rep. Cobb and Rep. Giacometto who opposed.

#### HOUSE BILL NO. 135:

<u>REP. ADDY</u> moved to table this bill. This motion <u>CARRIED</u> unanimously.

#### ACTION ON HOUSE BILL NO. 72:

<u>REP. BULGER</u> moves <u>DO</u> NOT PASS. <u>REP. GOULD</u> spoke to two judges on this bill and both judges agreed that if there is a six person jury and they vote four out of six you only have one over a simple majority, that makes it awfully easy. If these bills were amended to say that it would take five out of six then it probably would not be too bad of an idea. If the committee would go along with that, he would vote to pass the bill.

<u>REP. ADDY</u> stated that he does have that amendment penciled in on his copy. He proposes that an amendment be added.

<u>REP. BULGER</u> stated that statistically the chances of getting five out of six is somewhat similiar to getting eight out of twelve. But he does not object to putting an amendment on.

<u>CHAIRMAN LORY</u> asked Rep. Addy if he wanted to put an amendment onto this bill. Rep. Addy moved to amend Page One, line 19, strike: "2/3" and insert: "5 members".

<u>CHAIRMAN LORY</u> asks John MacMaster if this can be done. Mr. MacMaster stated that in all criminal actions, the verdict Page Two Judiciary Committee January 23, 1987

shall be unanimous. In all civil actions, 2/3 of the jury may render the verdict. We can not set a higher percentage. Rep. Addy <u>WITHDRAWS</u> the amendment.

<u>REP. BROWN</u> opposes the bill. He stated that the Federal Court has the ability to inpanel six jurors, in that case, all are required for a verdict.

<u>REP. MEYERS</u> hopes this bill can be fixed so it will pass. He feels the time spent by 12 jurors sometimes is too time consuming and costs too much money. Question was called for and a voice vote was taken. <u>TEN MEMBERS</u> voted <u>IN FAVOR</u> of the motion with <u>FOUR MEMBERS OPPOSING</u>. Motion was <u>PASSED</u>.

#### ACTION ON HOUSE BILL NO. 202:

REP. ADDY moves to table this bill.

<u>CHAIRMAN LORY</u> asked John MacMaster to clarify why this legislation is needed. Mr. MacMaster stated that there is already a clear confidentiality privilege in the code which does exactly what this bill does. Rep. Giacometto called the question. <u>ALL MEMBERS UNANIMOULSY VOTED TO TABLE THIS</u> <u>BILL</u>.

# ACTION ON HOUSE BILL NO. 123:

<u>REP. GIACOMETTO</u> moves <u>DO PASS</u>. A discussion on HB 123 followed.

REP. HANNAH opposes this bill.

<u>REP. ADDY</u> stated this is a departure from the way judges were elected in the past but this is only for parties who are able to pay for the judge's time anyway. This bill would free up the time for the best judges. He wishes more lawyers had experience in deciding cases rather than adjudicating cases.

<u>REP. EUDAILY</u> opposes the fact that lawyers will be chosen to act on cases as judges.

<u>REP. COBB</u> stated that cases can already go to binding arbitration and he has concerns with more cases going to these judges and more rulings that might effect other people besides the two parties. Right now the parties can go to binding arbitration to solve their problem without creating Page Three Judiciary Committee January 23, 1987

a lot of new rules and laws that might effect a lot of other people.

<u>REP. GIACOMETTO</u> felt a point that must be brought out is that these two people are going to choose this person to be judge so that no one is getting a bad deal. Both parties are happy with who they choose. It takes a lot of heat off the court system. He supports this bill.

REP. GOULD opposes the bill.

<u>REP. MEYERS</u> stated in criminal actions it is entirely working with specialists but what about civil actions?

REP. ADDY answered and stated in a binding precedent the only court that can decide a point of law that is binding upon district courts is the Supreme Court. District Judges can not bind other courts by their decision. If one of those two parties felt the decision was unfair, they could appeal it to the Supreme Court, just as they can right now. Question called for and a <u>VOICE VOTE</u> was taken. <u>SIX MEMBERS</u> voted IN FAVOR of the motion taken. Rep. Miles voted by proxy and voted aye. EIGHT MEMBERS voted to OPPOSE the motion. Rep. Mercer did not leave a proxy vote so the voting may result in a tie. Chairman Lory asked that the vote be held for the present time. All members agreed to hold the vote.

ADJOURNMENT: There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 11:15 a.m.

REP. EARL LORY, Charrman

DAILY ROLL CALL

.

JUDICIARY COMMITTEE

50th LEGISLATIVE SESSION -- 1987

	Da	te	- 23, 1987
NAME	PRESENT	ABSENT	EXCUSED
JOHN MERCER (R)		<u> </u>	~
LEO GIACOMETTO (R)			
BUDD GOULD (R)		<u> </u>	
AL MEYERS (R)			
JOHN COBB (R)			
ED GRADY (R)	V		
PAUL RAPP-SVRCEK (D)			
VERNON KELLER (R)			
RALPH EUDAILY (R)			
TOM BULGER (D)			
JOAN MILES (D)	Print		
FRITZ DAILY (D)		· K	
TOM HANNAH (R)		¥	
BILL STRIZICH (D) (			
PAULA DARKO (D)			
KELLY ADDY (D)			
DAVE BROWN (D)		LX .	
EARL LORY (R)			

# ANDING COMMITTEE DEDODT

÷

الرابي المراجع المتراد ومعقله

	🛏 president of the second s	an a	JANUARY 23,	87
	n an	ICIARY		19
Mr. Speaker: We, the com	mittee on			
report	NO. 72			
☐ do pass ₩3 do not pass	☐ be con ☐ be not d	curred in concurred in	☐ as amei ☐ stateme	nded Int of intent attached
				Chairman
*AN ACT AMENDING	; SECTION 3-1	5-106, MCA, TC	) AUTHORISE A T	RIAL
JUDGE TO PERMIT CIVIL ACTION."	THE IMPANELM	ent of a six-p	PERSON JURY IN	
			n sen for an anna 1999 ann an Arran an Arran an Arran an Arr Arran an Arran an Ar	
MA -				
reading c	color ()			

# STANDING COMMITTEE REPORT

ter for a for the second s		JANUARY 23, 19 87				
Mr. Speaker: We, the co	mmittee on AT					
Handrich (1999) Martin (1999) Martin (1999) Martin (1999)						
report <b>NOUSE BIL</b>						
₩ do pass ☐ do not pass	☐ be conc ☐ be not c	urred in oncurred in	★ as amende □ statement of	d of intent attached		
			and the hard of the			
				Chairman		
AMENDMENTS TO HB	79, INTRODUCE	d Copy, proposed	BY REP. ADDY			
1. Page 1, line	17.					
Strike: * an em Insert: "their	employment"	UI UIGAIIIZACIOI				
	and and a set of the spectrum of t			a digang ang pang kanya ng 1998 kang baharan sa sagawa na sagawa 1999 kang baharan ng kanya ng 1999 kanya ng kanya n		
a sense a sens A sense a sense A sense a sense	(a) A set of the se	က က က က က က က က က က က က က က က က က က က		ا من التي الأولى التي من التي الما التي الما المراجع التي الما المراجع التي الما المراجع التي الما المراجع الم المراجع المراجع المراجع المراجع المراجع		
	역 동안 유산한 이번 영상. 한 이번은 이번 이번 유산					
			이 같은 것이 많이 많다. (1946년 - 1947년 - 1947년 (1947년 - 1947년			
الم		ا ما با هو ا کې لوم د اند کې د ور د کې د کې د کې د د د مالو د ولو د کې د و و کې د کې د و کې د د و کې و د د د و و د کې د د کې کې کو کې د وې د کې د و و و و و و و و و و و و و و و و و و				
(동생은) 가려 가 있는 것이 있는 것이 가 있는 것이다. 동생 2011년 - 이 이 가 가 있는 것이 가 있는 것이 하는 것이다.						
			23년 1일만 2011년 - 1일은 1일은 1일			
	na se se angla se					
				مانية المراجع المراجع المراجع المراجع المراجع محكمة المراجع ا		
n an						
	an ang taon ng taon ng Taon ng taon ng	and a second sec	ار این در مسلو دهنا از معادی میرود در از مسلو دهنا از معادی	د. موجود می از مراجع می این از مراجع می این از مراجع می این از مراجع می این می این از مراجع می این می از می این مراجع می مراجع می این می از مراجع می این از مراجع می این از می از می از می از می از می این می از می از می از می		
		a series de la companya de la compa Na series de la companya de la company Na series de la companya de la compa				
			···			
PIRSTreadin	g copy ()		• •			
	color			مىنى ھىلى مەربىي ھىلى		
λ.			•			

EXHIBIT A DATE 1-23-87 DO PASS AS AMENDE THE #79 AMENDMENTS TO HE 79, INTRODUCED COPY, PROPOSED BY REP. ADDY.

1. Page 1, line 17.
Strike: " an employer, group, or organization"
Insert: "their employment"