Montana Water Court PO Box 1389 Bozeman, MT 59771-1389 1-800-624-3270 (406) 586-4364 watercourt@mt.gov FILED 06/17/2025 Sara Calkins CLERK Montana Water Court STATE OF MONTANA By: D'Ann CIGLER 41S-1060-R-2025 Stern, Anika 6.00

### IN THE WATER COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA LOWER MISSOURI DIVISION JUDITH RIVER BASIN (41S) PRELIMINARY DECREE

CLAIMANT: Layton R. Perry

CASE 41S-1060-R-2025 41S 101890-00

**OBJECTOR:** Montana Attorney General

#### NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER'S REPORT

This Master's Report was filed with the Montana Water Court on the above stamped date. <u>Please review this report carefully.</u>

You may file a written objection to this Master's Report within **10 days** of the stamped date if you disagree or find errors with the Master's findings of fact, conclusion of law, or recommendations. Rule 23, W.R.Adj.R. If the Master's Report was mailed to you, the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure allow an additional 3 days be added to the 10-day objection period. Rule 6(d), M.R.Civ.P. If you file an objection, you must serve a copy of the objection to all parties on the service list found at the end of the Master's Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the service list must be filed with the Water Court.

If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master's Report.

#### **MASTER'S REPORT**

#### FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Layton R. Perry (Perry) is the record owner of irrigation claim 41S

101890-00.

2. In Case 41S-0857-R-2024, Perry was ordered to meet with a DNRC

employee to address the following issue remarks decreed on claim 41S 101890-00:

- FLOW RATE MAY REQUIRE MODIFICATION BASED ON RESOLUTION OF MAXIMUM ACRES ISSUE.
- THE JUDITH BASIN COUNTY WATER RESOURCES SURVEY (1963) APPEARS TO INDICATE 0.00 ACRES IRRIGATED.
- USDA AERIAL PHOTOGRAPH NO(S). 30045-179-106 , DATED 09/17/1979 , APPEARS TO INDICATE 0.00 ACRES IRRIGATED.

(Case 41S-0857-R-2024, Doc.<sup>1</sup> 1.00)

3. DNRC Water Resource Specialist Carli Bluhm filed a Memorandum stating she met with Perry. (Case 41S-0857-R-2024, Doc. 2.00). Ms. Bluhm indicated she reviewed the Judith Basin County Water Resource Survey field notes and aerial photos to prepare the Memorandum. Maps and proposed abstracts were attached to the Memorandum.

Ms. Bluhm indicated that she found no irrigation during her investigation, and she recommended claim 41S 101890-00 be dismissed.

4. On February 5, 2025, Perry filed a Notice of Disagreement with DNRC's recommendation to dismiss claim 41S 101890-00. (Case 41S-0857-R-2024, Doc. 8.00).

5. Claim 41S 101890-00 was reconsolidated into Case 41S-1060-R-2025, and the State of Montana was joined as a necessary party. (Case 41S-1060-R-2025, Doc. 1.00).

6. On May 22, 2025, Perry and the State of Montana filed a Stipulation & Agreement resolving the issue remarks. ("Stipulation") (Case 41S-1060-R-2025, Doc. 5.00). Based on the Stipulation, the following modifications should be made to the elements of claim 41S 101890-00:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> "Doc." numerical references correlate to case file docket numbers in the Water Court's Full Court case management system.

Flow Rate:		1.00-CFS 289.00 GPM							
Maximum Acres:		50 <del>.00</del> 17.00							
Place of Use:									
ID	Acre	s Govt Lot	Qtr Sec	Sec	Twp	Rge	County		
1	17.00 40.0	0	SESW	15	14N	13E	JUDITH BASIN		
2	10.0	0	NESWSW	45	<del>-14N</del>	<del>13E</del>	JUDITH BASIN		
	Total: 60.0	9 17.00							

#### PRINCIPLES AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Water Court is required to resolve the issues raised by each issue remark. Section 85-2-248, MCA.

2. A properly filed Statement of Claim for an existing water right is prima facie proof of its content. Section 85-2-227, MCA. This prima facie validity may be overcome by evidence showing that one or more elements of the claim are incorrect. This standard of proof applies to objectors or claimants objecting to their own water right claims. Rule 19, W.R.Adj.R., *Nelson v. Brooks*, 2014 MT 120; 375 Mont.86, 95; 329 P.3d 558, 564.

3. The Water Court is required to resolve all issue remarks before a final decree. §85-2-247, MCA. Under §-85-2-248(6), MCA, when an issue remark cannot be resolved through an informal meeting between the claimant and the DNRC, the Water Court must schedule proceedings to address and resolve the remark. These proceedings must include the DNRC. Section 85-2-248(7), MCA, requires joinder of the State of Montana, through the Attorney General, as a necessary party when the unresolved issues include nonperfection or abandonment.

4. Section 3-7-224, MCA the Water Court is directed to conduct hearings in the same manner as for other civil actions. The Water Court applies the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure (M.R.Civ.P.), the Montana Rules of Evidence (M.R.Evid.) and the Montana Uniform District Court Rules. This Master considers documents filed with the Court as "other paper" under M.R.Civ.P. Rule 11(b)(3) which certifies that to the best of the party's knowledge the factual contentions contained within the stipulation are supported by evidence.

3

Add to this rule the recognition that "the heart of a judicial process is the development of the truth through conflict between parties with adverse interests." *United States of America (USDI) –Bureau of Indian Affairs)-General Objection to Basin 42B and 42C Preliminary Decrees*, Case 42B-1, ¶ 3 at p. 14, (*Order Denying Motion* June 27, 2014). Considering these tenets, significant weight is given to the filings to establish the accurate historical use of the claim.

#### RECOMMENDATION

Claim 41S 101890-00 should be modified as shown in Finding of Fact No. 6.
An abstract is attached for review.

#### ELECTRONICALLY SIGNED AND DATED BELOW.

#### Service Via Electronic Mail:

DNRC Water Resources Lewistown Regional Office steven.hamilton@mt.gov brandon.Ahlgren@mt.gov

Montana DOJ Terisa Oomens, Agency Legal Counsel Agency Legal Services Bureau Terisa.Oomens@mt.gov kayla.churchill@mt.gov

Oliver J Urick Hubble Law Firm Pllp PO Box 556 Stanford, MT 59479 406-566-2500 W ourick@uricklawfirm.com

\JUDHLNSRV-DATA\Share\JUDGALH2OSRV (Datavol)\Share\WC-BASIN FOLDERS\41S PD\Cases\1060\41S-1060-R-2025 MR 5.27.25 rc.docx

## POST DECREE ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

# JUDITH RIVER

#### BASIN 41S

Water Right Number:	41S 101890-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM								
	Version: 4 POST DECREE								
		Status:	ACTIVE						
Owners:	LAYTON R PERRY 6726 ACKLEY LAKE RD HOBSON, MT 59452-8664								
Priority Date:	DECEMBER 31, 1908								
Type of Historical Right:	USE								
Purpose (Use):	IRRIGATION								
Irrigation Type:	SPRINKLER								
Flow Rate:	289.00 GPM								
*Volume:	THE TOTAL VOLUME OF THIS WATER RIGHT SHALL NOT EXCEED THE AMOUNT PUT TO HISTORICAL AND BENEFICIAL USE.								
Climatic Area:	3 - MODERATE								
Maximum Acres:	17.00								
Source Name:	SPRING, UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF JUDITH RIVER								
Source Type:	GROUNDWATER								
Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:									
ID	Govt Lo		<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>		
1		-	ESWSW	15	14N	13E	JUDITH BASIN		
Period of Diversion:	JUNE 1 TO OCTOBER 1								
<b>Diversion Means:</b>	PUMP								
Period of Use:	JUNE 1 TO OCTOBER 1								
Place of Use:									
<u>ID</u> <u>Acres</u>		<u>t</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	County		
1 17.00 Total: 17.00	_		SESW	15	14N	13E	JUDITH BASIN		

#### **Remarks:**

THE WATER RIGHTS FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE SUPPLEMENTAL WHICH MEANS THE RIGHTS HAVE OVERLAPPING PLACES OF USE. THE RIGHTS CAN BE COMBINED TO IRRIGATE ONLY OVERLAPPING PARCELS. EACH RIGHT IS LIMITED TO THE FLOW RATE AND PLACE OF USE OF THAT INDIVIDUAL RIGHT. THE SUM TOTAL VOLUME OF THESE WATER RIGHTS SHALL NOT EXCEED THE AMOUNT PUT TO HISTORICAL AND BENEFICIAL USE.

101889-00 101890-00

THE WATER RIGHTS LISTED FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE MULTIPLE USES OF THE SAME RIGHT. THE USE OF THIS RIGHT FOR SEVERAL PURPOSES DOES NOT INCREASE THE EXTENT OF THE WATER RIGHT. RATHER IT DECREES THE RIGHT TO ALTERNATE AND EXCHANGE THE USE (PURPOSE) OF THE WATER IN ACCORD WITH HISTORICAL PRACTICES.

101890-00 101891-00