Montana Water Court PO Box 1389 Bozeman, MT 59771-1389 1-800-624-3270 (406) 586-4364 watercourt@mt.gov FILED
02/18/2025
Sara Calkins
CLERK
Montana Water Court
STATE OF MONTANA
By: Regina Certalic
41S-0848-R-2024
Stern, Anika
5.00

IN THE WATER COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA LOWER MISSOURI DIVISION JUDITH RIVER BASIN (41S) PRELIMINARY DECREE

CLAIMANTS: Beverly J. Farr; Victor T. Farr

CASE 41S-0848-R-202441S 30131360
41S 30131364

NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER'S REPORT

This Master's Report was filed with the Montana Water Court on the above-stamped date. Please review this report carefully.

You may file a written objection to this Master's Report within **10 days** of the stamped date if you disagree or find errors with the Master's findings of fact, conclusions of law, or recommendations. Rule 23, W.R.Adj.R. If the Master's Report was mailed to you, the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure allow an additional 3 days be added to the 10-day objection period. Rule 6(d), M.R.Civ.P. If you file an objection, you must serve a copy of the objection to all parties on the service list found at the end of the Master's Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the service list must be filed with the Water Court.

If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master's Report.

MASTER'S REPORT

FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. Beverly J. Farr and Victor T. Farr (the Farrs) are the record owners of claims 41S 30131360 and 41S 30131364.
- 2. Claims 41S 30131360 and 41S 30131364 were decreed with DNRC issue remarks:

41S 30131360:

- THE MEANS OF DIVERSION APPEARS TO BE INCORRECT. THE MEANS OF DIVERSION APPEARS TO BE A PIPELINE .
- THIS CLAIM NUMBER WAS NOT INCLUDED IN THE BASIN 41S DECREE ISSUED 05/17/1984.

41S 30131364:

- A PORTION OF THE CLAIMED POINT OF DIVERSION AND PLACE OF USE DOES NOT MEET THE DEFINITION OF AN EXEMPT RIGHT UNDER 85-2-222, MCA, AND INVOLVES A DITCH
- THIS CLAIM APPEARS TO BE CLAIMING TWO SEPARATE SOURCES OF WATER. MORE THAN ONE WATER RIGHT MAY BE INVOLVED.
- THIS CLAIM NUMBER WAS NOT INCLUDED IN THE BASIN 41S DECREE ISSUED 05/17/1984.
- 3. The Farrs were ordered to meet with a DNRC employee to address the unresolved issue remarks. (Doc. 11.00).
- 4. DNRC Water Resource Specialist Carli Bluhm filed a Memorandum stating she spoke with "the claimant" it is unclear to whom Ms. Bluhm spoke. (Doc. 3.00). Ms. Bluhm indicated she reviewed the Judith Basin County Water Resources Survey and a 1979 aerial photo to prepare the Memorandum.
- 5. **41S 30131360:** Ms. Bluhm indicated that the means of diversion for claim 30131360 should be modified from spring box to pipeline.
 - 6. **41S 30131364:** Ms. Bluhm explained the following:

¹ "Doc." numerical references correlate to case file docket numbers in the Water Court's Full Court case management system.

The DNRC assumed the claimant was claiming a point of diversion that includes a man-made ditch, under 85-2-222, MCA, a ditch does not meet the definition of an exempt right. After speaking with the claimant, it was explained that it is not a manmade ditch, and didn't know what else to call the small stream. The DNRC determined the clarification from the claimant is enough to remove the issue remark and leave the right as is.

The claimant claimed an undeveloped spring as the source for stock direct from source. After the initial investigation, the DNRC found the claimant appears to be claiming 2 sources of water. After this investigation, the DNRC found that the spring feeds the unnamed tributary claimed. The DNRC concluded that removing the unnamed tributary of Cottonwood Creek and adding an informational remark should resolve the issue remark.

Ms. Bluhm recommended the following modifications be made to claim 41S 30131364 to address the issue remarks:

*Source Name: UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF COTTONWOOD CREEK

Source Type: SURFACE WATER

*Source Name: SPRING, UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF COTTONWOOD CREEK

Source Type: SURFACE WATER

THIS WATER RIGHT ALSO INCLUDES SURFACE WATER FROM AN UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF COTTONWOOD CREEK.

7. An Order was issued to determine if the Farrs agreed or disagreed with the recommendations made by Ms. Bluhm. (Doc. 4.00). The Order indicated that if nothing were filed by the deadline, this Water Master would conclude the Claimants agreed with the recommended modifications. The following language was included in the Order:

Failure to comply with the terms of this Order may result in sanctions, <u>up to and including entry of default and termination of a water right claim or dismissal of objections</u>. Rule 22, W.R.Adj.R.

Nothing was filed.

PRINCIPLES AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. The Water Court must address all issue remarks decreed on a claim. Section 85-2-248, MCA.
- 2. A properly filed Statement of Claim for an existing water right is prima facie proof of its content. Section 85-2-227, MCA. This prima facie validity may be overcome by evidence showing that one or more elements of the claim are incorrect. This standard of proof applies to objectors or claimants objecting to their own water right claims. Rule 19, W.R.Adj.R., *Nelson v. Brooks*, 2014 MT 120; 375 Mont.86, 95; 329 P.3d 558, 564.

3. The remark noting claims 41S 30131360 and 41S 30131364 were not included in the May 17, 1984 decree are notice remarks and do not require further action.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Claim 41S 30131360 should be modified as follows:

Diversion Means: SPRING BOX PIPELINE

Claim 41S 30131364 should be modified as follows:

*Source Name: UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF COTTONWOOD CREEK SURFACE WATER Source Type: *Source Name: SPRING, UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF COTTONWOOD CREEK SURFACE WATER Source Type: *Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion: Govt Lot Twp Rge 13N 18E *Source Name: SPRING UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF COTTONWOOD CREEK Period of Diversion: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31 Diversion Means: OTHER NWNE **FERGUS** 10 13N 18E *Source Name: SPRING UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF COTTONWOOD CREEK Period of Diversion: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31 Diversion Means: OTHER 10 13N 18E SENWNE **FERGUS** *Source Name: SPRING, UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF COTTONWOOD CREEK Period of Diversion: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31 Diversion Means: UNDEVELOPED SPRING

THE CLAIMED MEANS OF DIVERSION IS: "FROM SPRING AND THE STREAM THAT IS BELOW IT."

CMSI: THIS WATER RIGHT ALSO INCLUDES SURFACE WATER FROM AN UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF COTTONWOOD CREEK.

2. The issue remarks should be removed from claims 41S 30131360 and 41S 30131364.

Abstracts are attached for review.

ELECTRONICALLY SIGNED AND DATED BELOW.

Service via USPS Mail:

Beverly J. Farr Victor T. Farr 12096 Cottonwood Creek Rd Lewistown, MT 59457

\JUDHLNSRV-DATA\Share\JUDGALH2OSRV (Datavol)\Share\WC-BASIN FOLDERS\41S PD\Cases\848\41S-0848-R-2024 MR 2.11.25 rc.docx

POST DECREE

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

JUDITH RIVER

BASIN 41S

Water Right Number: 41S 30131360 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

Version: 2 -- POST DECREE

Status: ACTIVE

Owners: BEVERLY J FARR

12096 COTTONWOOD CREEK RD

LEWISTOWN, MT 59457

VICTOR T FARR

12096 COTTONWOOD CREEK RD

LEWISTOWN, MT 59457

*Priority Date: DECEMBER 31, 1945

Type of Historical Right: USE

Purpose (Use): DOMESTIC
Flow Rate: 4.00 GPM
Volume: 4.00 AC-FT

Households: 1

Maximum Acres: 1.00

Source Name: SPRING, UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF COTTONWOOD CREEK

Source Type: GROUNDWATER

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

<u>ID</u> <u>Govt Lot</u> <u>Qtr Sec</u> <u>Sec</u> <u>Twp</u> <u>Rge</u> <u>County</u> 1 SWNENESE 4 13N 18E FERGUS

Period of Diversion: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

Diversion Means: PIPELINE

Period of Use: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

*Place of Use:

IDAcresGovt LotQtr SecSecTwpRgeCounty11.00SWNWNWSE313N18EFERGUS

Total: 1.00

Remarks:

THE WATER RIGHTS LISTED FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE MULTIPLE USES OF THE SAME RIGHT. THE USE OF THIS RIGHT FOR SEVERAL PURPOSES DOES NOT INCREASE THE EXTENT OF THE WATER RIGHT. RATHER IT DECREES THE RIGHT TO ALTERNATE AND EXCHANGE THE USE (PURPOSE) OF THE WATER IN ACCORD WITH HISTORICAL PRACTICES.

30131360 30131361

POST DECREE

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

JUDITH RIVER

BASIN 41S

Water Right Number: 41S 30131364 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

> Version: 2 -- POST DECREE

> > **ACTIVE Status:**

BEVERLY J FARR Owners:

12096 COTTONWOOD CREEK RD

LEWISTOWN, MT 59457

VICTOR T FARR

12096 COTTONWOOD CREEK RD

LEWISTOWN, MT 59457

*Priority Date: **DECEMBER 31, 1945**

USE **Type of Historical Right:**

STOCK Purpose (Use):

*Flow Rate: A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED BECAUSE THIS USE CONSISTS

> OF STOCK DRINKING DIRECTLY FROM THE SOURCE, OR FROM A DITCH SYSTEM. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY

TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.

THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR *Volume:

> STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND

HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.

*Source Name: SPRING, UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF COTTONWOOD CREEK

Source Type: SURFACE WATER

THIS WATER RIGHT ALSO INCLUDES SURFACE WATER FROM AN UNNAMED

TRIBUTARY OF COTTONWOOD CREEK.

*Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

<u>ID</u>	Govt Lot	Qtr Sec	Sec	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	County		
1		SE	3	13N	18E	FERGUS		
Period of Diversion:	JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31							
Diversion Means:	OTHER							
2		NWNE	10	13N	18E	FERGUS		
Period of Diversion:	JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31							
Diversion Means:	OTHER							
3		SENWNE	10	13N	18E	FERGUS		
Period of Diversion:	JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31							
Diversion Means:	UNDEVELOPED SPRING							
Period of Use:	JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31							
*Place of Use:								

*Place of Use:

<u>ID</u>	Acres Govt Lot	Qtr Sec	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	County
1		SE	3	13N	18E	FERGUS
2		NWNE	10	13N	18E	FERGUS

3 SENWNE 10 13N 18E FERGUS