Montana Water Court PO Box 1389 Bozeman, MT 59771-1389 (406) 586-4364 1-800-624-3270 watercourt@mt.gov FILE D 02/20/2025 Sara Calkins CLERK Montana Water Court STATE OF MONTANA By: Elizabeth Draper 40S-0016-1-2024 Nordlund, Julia 9.00

IN THE WATER COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA LOWER MISSOURI DIVISION MISSOURI RIVER BELOW FORT PECK DAM BASIN 40S

* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *

CLAIMANTS: David A. Panasuk; Linda M. Panasuk; Timothy Panasuck CASE 40S-0016-I-2024 40S 30134016 40S 30134017 40S 30134024 40S 30134026 40S 30134026 40S 30134027 40S 30134030 40S 30134034 40S 30134035

NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER'S REPORT

This Master's Report was filed with the Montana Water Court on the above stamped date. <u>Please review this report carefully.</u>

You may file a written objection to this Master's Report within **10 days** of the stamped date if you disagree or find errors with the Master's findings of fact, conclusions of law, or recommendations. Rule 23, W.R.Adj.R. If the Master's Report was mailed to you, the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure allow an additional 3 days be added to the 10-day objection period. Rule 6(d), M.R.Civ.P. If you file an objection, you must serve a copy of the objection to all parties on the service list found at the end of the Master's Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the service list must be filed with the Water Court.

If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master's Report.

MASTER'S REPORT

Claims 40S 30134016, 40S 30134017, 40S 30134024, 40S 30134026, 40S

30134027, 40S 30134030, 40S 30134034, and 40S 30134035 are owned by David, Timothy, and Linda Panasuk. The claims were decreed DNRC issue remarks. No objections, counterobjections, or NOIAs were filed on these claims. The claims were consolidated into Water Court Case 40S-0016-I-2024.

FINDINGS OF FACT

1. DNRC Water Resource Specialist Ryan Hartwell filed two Memorandum including his review of DNRC issue remarks.

2. On January 17, 2025, Mr. Hartwell filed a Memorandum of the claims in this case. The Memorandum recommended the disposition of issue remarks on the some of the claims as follows:

40S 30134016

RECOMMENDATION:

With the email delivered to the DNRC outlining the claimant's intent with the means, the D50 issue remark can be resolved. It is the DNRC's recommendation to remove the D50 remark from Claim 40S 30134016 and modify the means of diversion from livestock direct from source to well. See marked up Review Abstract 40S 30134016.

40S 30134017

RECOMMENDATION:

With the email delivered to the DNRC outlining the claimant's intent with the means, the D50 issue remark can be resolved. It is the DNRC's recommendation to remove the D50 remark from Claim 40S 30134017 and

modify means of diversion from livestock direct from source to undeveloped spring. See marked up Review Abstract 405 30134017.

On February 12, 2025, Mr. Hartwell emailed the Court and stated that he made a

mistake on his recommendation for claim 40S 30134017 and that it should remain

livestock direct from source.

40S 30134024

RECOMMENDATION:

With the email delivered to the DNRC outlining the two different wells, the D91 issue remark can be resolved. It is the DNRC's recommendation to remove the D91 remark from Claim 40S 30134024 and any duplicate right wording in the Related Rights tab. See marked up Review Abstract 40S 30134024.

40S 30134026

RECOMMENDATION:

At this time, Ownership Update form has not been received by the DNRC Glasgow regional office. Until the paperwork is received that fills the requirements of an Ownership Update, it is DNRC's recommendation that the O55 remark stays on until the ownership issue is resolved. The O55 remark should be edited to remove Robert E. Mattingley's name. See marked up Review Abstract 40S 30134026.

On January 21, 2025, counsel for Claimants filed a Status Report which stated there was a delay in obtaining signatures from her clients. In previous correspondence with DNRC, it appears that Claimants were in agreement with each of the recommendations from Mr. Hartwell. On Claim 40S 30134026 Claimants state, "Linda Panasuk should not be on this water right. We will send you the water right update." The Court does not require an ownership update form to remove a Claimant from the abstract. The statements from Claimant's counsel are sufficient for the Court to proceed with these recommendations.

40S 30134027

RECOMMENDATION:

With the email delivered to the DNRC outlining the Claimants' intent with the means of diversion, the D50 issue remark can be resolved. It is the DNRC's recommendation to remove the D50 remark from Claim 40S 30134027 and modify means of diversion from livestock direct from source to developed spring. See marked up Review Abstract 40S 30134027.

40S 30134030

RECOMMENDATION:

With the email delivered to the DNRC outlining the Claimants' intent with the means of diversion, the D50 issue remark can be resolved. It is the DNRC's recommendation to remove the D50 remark from Claim 40S 30134030 and modify means of diversion from livestock direct from source to developed spring. See marked up Review Abstract 40S 30134030.

40S 30134034

RECOMMENDATION:

With the email delivered to the DNRC outlining the Claimants' intent with the means, the D50 issue remark can be resolved. It is the DNRC's recommendation to remove the D50 remark from Claim 40S 30134034 and modify means of diversion from livestock direct from source to pipeline. See marked up Review Abstract 40S 30134034.

40S 30134035

RECOMMENDATION:

With the email delivered to the DNRC outlining the two different wells, the D91 issue remark can be resolved. It is the DNRC's recommendation to remove the D91 remark from claim 40S 30134035 and any duplicate right wording in the Related Rights tab. See marked up Review Abstract 40S 30134035. A withdraw form is being filled out by the claimant's representative and eventually will be submitted to the Water Court. When the withdraw form is received by the Water Court it is DNRC's recommendation to withdraw Claim 40S 30134035.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Montana Water Court has the authority to resolve issue remarks when the claim file and information available to the Court provide a sufficient basis to do so. Section 85-2-248(3), MCA.

2. A properly filed Statement of Claim for Existing Water Right is prima facie proof of its content. Section 85-2-227, MCA. This prima facie proof may be contradicted and overcome by other evidence that proves, by a preponderance of the evidence, that an element of the prima facie claim is incorrect. This is the burden of proof for every assertion that a claim is incorrect. Rule 19, W.R.Adj.R.

3. The degree or weight of evidence needed to contradict or overcome the prima facie proof statute is a preponderance of the evidence. *Burkhartsmeyer et al. v. Burkhartsmeyer et al.*, Case 40G-2, (MT Water Court Memorandum Opinion and Order Adopting Master's Report, Mar. 11, 1997). The Montana Supreme Court has defined preponderance as "a relatively modest standard that the statutory criteria are 'more probable than not' to have been met." *Hohenlohe v. State*, 2010 MT 203 ¶ 33, 357 Mont. 438, 240 P.3d 628.

4. The Montana Water Court is permitted to use information submitted by the Department of Natural Resources and Conservation, the statement of claim, information from approved compacts, and any other data obtained by the Court to evaluate water right claims. Section 85-2-231(2), MCA.

5. The issues raised by issue remarks must be resolved as part of the adjudication process pursuant to Section 85-2-248, MCA.

6. When resolving issue remarks, the Montana Water Court must weigh the information resulting in the issue remark and the issue remark against the claimed water right. Section 85-2-247(2), MCA.

7. The above changes resolve all issue remarks on these claims.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The changes recommended above should be adopted. Post Decree Abstracts of Water Rights Claims are served with the Report to confirm that the recommendations have been made in the state's centralized water right record system.

ELECTRONICALLY SIGNED AND DATED BELOW.

Service Via Electronic Mail:

Renee L. Coppock Crowley Fleck PLLP PO Box 2529 Billings, MT 59103-2529 (406) 252-3441 rcoppock@crowleyfleck.com **skhan@crowleyfleck.com**

\UUDHLNSRV-DATA\ShareJUDGALH2OSRV (Datavol)\Share\WC-BASIN FOLDERS\40S ILT\40S Cases\40S-0016-I-2024\UN 40S-16 MR DNRC memo 2.10.25 vh for ld.doex

POST DECREE ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM MISSOURI RIVER, BELOW FORT PECK DAM BASIN 40S 30134016 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

Water Right Number:	40S 30134	016 STA	TEMENT C	OF CLA	IM		
	Version:	Version: 2 POST DECREE					
		Status:	ACTIVE				
Owners:	322 US HIG	TIMOTHY PANASUK 322 US HIGHWAY 2 BAINVILLE, MT 59212-9615					
Priority Date:	JULY 31, 19	JULY 31, 1940					
Type of Historical Right:	USE						
Purpose (Use):	STOCK						
*Flow Rate:	20.00 GPM						
*Volume:	THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.						
Source Name:	GROUNDWATER						
Source Type:	GROUNDWATER						
Point of Diversion and Mean	s of Diversion:						
<u>ID</u>	Govt Lot		<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	County
1		NE	ENENW	11	27N	59E	ROOSEVELT
Period of Diversion:	JANUARY 1	TO DECE	EMBER 31				
Diversion Means:	WELL						
Period of Use:	JANUARY 1	TO DECE	EMBER 31				
Place of Use:							
ID Acre 1	es <u>Govt Lot</u>		<u>Qtr Sec</u> ENENW	<u>Sec</u> 11	<u>Twp</u> 27N	<u>Rge</u> 59E	<u>County</u> ROOSEVELT

Water Right Number:		40S 301340	017 STA	TEMENT (OF CLA	IM		
		Version:	2 POS	T DECREE				
			Status:	ACTIVE				
Owners:		TIMOTHY PANASUK 322 US HIGHWAY 2 BAINVILLE, MT 59212-9615						
Priority Date:		DECEMBER	R 31, 1908					
Type of Historical Right	:	USE						
Purpose (Use):		STOCK						
Flow Rate:		9.00 GPM						
*Volume:		THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.						
*Source Name:		SPRING, UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF RED BANK CREEK						
Source Type:		GROUNDWATER						
Point of Diversion and M	Jeans	of Diversion:						
ID		Govt Lot		<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	County
1				ESWNE	32	28N	59E	ROOSEVELT
Period of Diversion:		JANUARY 1		-				
Diversion Means:		LIVESTOCK	DIRECT	FROM SO	URCE			
Period of Use:		JANUARY 1	TO DECE	EMBER 31				
Place of Use:								
<u>ID</u> 1	<u>Acres</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>		<u>Qtr Sec</u> ESWNE	<u>Sec</u> 32	<u>Twp</u> 28N	<u>Rge</u> 59E	<u>County</u> ROOSEVELT

			BA	451IN 4	05				
Water Right Number:	40	S 30134024	STATEM	ENT O	F CLA	IM			
	Ve	rsion: 2	POST DE	CREE					
		Stat	us: AC	TIVE					
Owners:	322	DAVID A PANASUK 322 US HWY 2 BAINVILLE, MT 59212-9615							
	32	LINDA M PANASUK 322 US HWY 2 BAINVILLE, MT 59212-9615							
Priority Date:	DE	CEMBER 31,	1908						
Type of Historical Right	: US	USE							
Purpose (Use):	ST	STOCK							
Flow Rate:	9.0	9.00 GPM							
*Volume:	ST UN	THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.							
Source Name:	GF	GROUNDWATER							
Source Type:		GROUNDWATER							
*Point of Diversion and M	leans of I	Diversion:							
ID		Govt Lot	<u>Qtr S</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	County	
1			NESWI		3	27N	59E	ROOSEVELT	
Period of Diversion:		NUARY 1 TO	DECEMBE	ER 31					
Diversion Means:	WE	ELL							
Period of Use:	JA	NUARY 1 TO	DECEMBE	ER 31					
Place of Use:									
	<u>Acres</u>	Govt Lot	<u>Qtr S</u>		Sec	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>	
1			NESWI	NE	3	27N	59E	ROOSEVELT	

Water Right Number:	40S 30134	026 STA	ATEMENT (OF CLA	MM				
-	Version:	2 POS	T DECREE	Ē					
		Status:	ACTIVE						
0									
Owners:	DAVID A P 322 US HW								
		BAINVILLE, MT 59212-9615							
	ТІМОТНУ	TIMOTHY PANASUK							
		322 US HIGHWAY 2							
	BAINVILLE	, MT 5921	2-9615						
Priority Date:	MAY 25, 19	MAY 25, 1945							
Type of Historical Right:	USE	USE							
Purpose (Use):	STOCK	STOCK							
Flow Rate:	1.68 GPM	1.68 GPM							
*Volume:	THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.								
Source Name:	GROUNDV	GROUNDWATER							
Source Type:	GROL	GROUNDWATER							
*Point of Diversion and Mean	ns of Diversion	:							
ID	<u>Govt Lo</u>	t	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>		
1			W2	9	29N	59E	ROOSEVELT		
Period of Diversion:	JANUARY	1 TO DEC	EMBER 31						
Diversion Means:	WELL								
Period of Use:	JANUARY	1 TO DEC	EMBER 31						
*Place of Use:									
<u>ID</u> <u>Acr</u>	<u>es Govt Lo</u>	<u>t</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>		
1			W2	9	29N	59E	ROOSEVELT		

			DASIN	105					
Water Right Number:	40S 30 ⁻	134027 STAT	EMENT O	F CLA	М				
	Version:	2 POST	DECREE						
		Status:	ACTIVE						
Owners:	322 US	DAVID A PANASUK 322 US HWY 2 BAINVILLE, MT 59212-9615							
	322 US	LINDA M PANASUK 322 US HWY 2 BAINVILLE, MT 59212-9615							
Priority Date:	DECEM	BER 31, 1908							
Type of Historical Right:	USE	USE							
Purpose (Use):	STOCK	STOCK							
Flow Rate:	2.52 GP	2.52 GPM							
*Volume:	STOCK UNIT. A	THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.							
Source Name:	SPRING	SPRING, UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF HORSE TIED CREEK							
Source Type:	GR	GROUNDWATER							
Point of Diversion and M	leans of Divers	ion:							
ID t	<u>Govt</u>		Qtr Sec	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>		
1 Period of Diversion:		SE RY 1 TO DECE		3	27N	59E	ROOSEVELT		
Diversion Means:		OPED SPRING							
Period of Use:									
	JANUAF	RY 1 TO DECE	MBER 31						
*Place of Use:		-	o	G	Th.	n			
<u>ID</u> <u>A</u>	<u>Acres</u> <u>Govt</u>		<u>Qtr Sec</u> ENENE	<u>Sec</u> 3	<u>Twp</u> 27N	<u>Rge</u> 59E	<u>County</u> ROOSEVELT		
		01		0	<u>~</u> //N	00L			

Water Right Number:		40S 3013403	60 STA		OF CLA	IM			
		Version: 2	Version: 2 POST DECREE						
		S	Status:	ACTIVE					
Owners:		TIMOTHY PANASUK 322 US HIGHWAY 2 BAINVILLE, MT 59212-9615							
Priority Date:		DECEMBER	31, 1908	;					
Type of Historical Right	t:	USE							
Purpose (Use):		STOCK							
Flow Rate:		5.00 GPM							
*Volume:		THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.							
*Source Name:		SPRING, UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF LITTLE MUDDY CREEK							
Source Type:		GROUNDWATER							
Point of Diversion and M	Means	of Diversion:							
<u>ID</u> 1		<u>Govt Lot</u>	SV	<u>Qtr Sec</u> VSWSE	<u>Sec</u> 28	<u>Twp</u> 28N	<u>Rge</u> 59E	<u>County</u> ROOSEVELT	
Period of Diversion:		JANUARY 1	TO DECI	EMBER 31					
Diversion Means:		DEVELOPED	SPRING	G					
Period of Use:		JANUARY 1	TO DECI	EMBER 31					
Place of Use:									
ID	<u>Acres</u>	Govt Lot		<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>	
1			SV	VSWSE	28	28N	59E	ROOSEVELT	

Water Right Number:		40S 301340	34 STA		OF CLA	IM		
		Version: 2 POST DECREE						
			Status:	ACTIVE				
Owners:		TIMOTHY PANASUK 322 US HIGHWAY 2 BAINVILLE, MT 59212-9615						
Priority Date:		DECEMBER	31, 1908					
Type of Historical Right	t:	USE						
Purpose (Use):		STOCK						
Flow Rate:		2.52 GPM						
*Volume:		THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.						
*Source Name:		SPRING, UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF HORSE TIED CREEK						
Source Type:		GROUNDWATER						
Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:								
<u>ID</u> 1		<u>Govt Lot</u>		<u>Qtr Sec</u> VSWNE	<u>Sec</u> 2	<u>Twp</u> 27N	<u>Rge</u> 59E	<u>County</u> ROOSEVELT
Period of Diversion:		JANUARY 1	TO DEC	EMBER 31				
Diversion Means:		PIPELINE						
Period of Use:		JANUARY 1	TO DECI	EMBER 31				
Place of Use:								
ID	<u>Acres</u>	Govt Lot		<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	County
1			SV	VSWNE	2	27N	59E	ROOSEVELT

Water Right Number:

POST DECREE ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM MISSOURI RIVER, BELOW FORT PECK DAM BASIN 40S 40S 30134035 STATEMENT OF CLAIM Version: 2 -- POST DECREE Status: DISMISSED

Owners:	DAVID A PANASUK 322 US HWY 2 BAINVILLE, MT 59212-9615
	LINDA M PANASUK 322 US HWY 2 BAINVILLE, MT 59212-9615
Priority Date:	
Type of Historical Right:	
Purpose (Use):	STOCK
Flow Rate:	
Volume:	
Source Name:	GROUNDWATER
Source Type:	GROUNDWATER
Point of Diversion and Means	of Diversion:
Period of Use:	
Place of Use:	

Remarks:

THIS CLAIM WAS DISMISSED BY ORDER OF THE WATER COURT.