FILE D 04/11/2025 Sara Calkins CLERK Montana Water Court STATE OF MONTANA By: <u>D'Ann CIGLER</u> 41S-0320-R-2024 Block, Nathaniel 9.00

Montana Water Court PO Box 1389 Bozeman, MT 59771-1389 1-800-624-3270 (406) 586-4364 watercourt@mt.gov

IN THE WATER COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA LOWER MISSOURI DIVISION JUDITH RIVER BASIN (41S) PRELIMINARY DECREE

CLAIMANT: Hughes & Sons Cattle Company

CASE 41S-0320-R-2024

41S 148544-00 41S 148579-00 41S 148580-00 41S 148582-00 41S 148583-00 41S 166795-00 41S 166796-00 41S 30131049 41S 30131054 41S 30131055

NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER'S REPORT

This Master's Report was filed with the Montana Water Court on the above stamped date. <u>Please review this report carefully.</u>

You may file a written objection to this Master's Report within **10 days** of the stamped date if you disagree or find errors with the Master's findings of fact, conclusions of law, or recommendations. Rule 23, W.R.Adj.R. If the Master's Report was mailed to you, the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure allow an additional 3 days be added to the 10-day objection period. Rule 6(d), M.R.Civ.P. If you file an objection, you must serve a copy of the objection to all parties on the service list found at the end of the Master's Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the service list must be filed with the Water Court.

If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master's Report.

MASTER'S REPORT

The above-captioned claims appeared in the Preliminary Decree for the Judith River (Basin 41S) with issue remarks.

The claims were consolidated into Case 41S-0320-R-2024 on March 25, 2024, and the claimants were ordered to work with the Department of Natural Resources and Conservation ("DNRC") to resolve the issue remarks on the claims. On June 28, 2024, the filed a Memo ("Memo") (Doc.¹ 2.00). On August 20, 2024, this Master issued an Order Setting Filing Deadline ordering the claimant to file documentation to state its position on the recommendations in the Memo.

On August 9, 2024, claimant filed a response to the Memo ("Response") (Doc. 5.00) and Order.

On September 13, 2024, this Court issued a second Order Setting Filing Deadline, ordering the claimant to file a sworn statement verifying claims 41S 30131049 and 41S 30131054 were true and correct to the best of their knowledge. On October 17, 2024, claimant Hughes & Sons Cattle Company filed documentation swearing the same (Doc. 8.00) (hereinafter, the Response and October 17, 2024, filing are collectively referred to as the "Responses").

FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Pursuant to the Memo and the Responses, claim 41S 148544-00 should be modified as follows:

*Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion: <u>ID</u> <u>Govt Lot</u> <u>Qtr Sec</u> <u>Twp</u> <u>Rge</u> <u>County</u> 1 SWSENW 25 14N 11E JUDITH BASIN Period of Diversion: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31 Diversion Means: LIVESTOCK DIRECT FROM SOURCE Dam

Pursuant to the Memo and the Responses, claims 41S 148579-00, 41S 148580-00,
41S 148582-00, and 41S 148583-00 should be dismissed.

^{1 &}quot;Doc." numerical references correlate to case file docket numbers in the Water Court's Full Court case management system.

3. Pursuant to the Memo and the Responses, claim 41S 166795-00 should be modified as follows:

Type of Historical Right: FILED USE

Place of U	se:						
ID	Acres	Govt Lot	Qtr Sec	Sec	Twp	Rge	County
1			SENW	24	11N 14N	14E	JUDITH BASIN

4. Pursuant to the Memo and the Responses, claim 41S 166796-00 should be modified as follows:

Type of Historical Right: FILED USE

5. Pursuant to the Memo, the issue remark stating that 'more than one water right may be involved' should be removed from claim 41S 30131055 without modification to the claim.

PRINCIPLES OF LAW

 The Montana Water Court has the authority to determine the extent of all water rights in the state as they existed prior to July 1, 1973. *Fellows v. Saylor*, 2016 MT 45, ¶ 25, 382 Mont. 298, 367 P.3d 732; §§ 85-2-233, -102(13), MCA.

2. A properly filed Statement of Claim for Existing Water Right is prima facie proof of its content. § 85-2-227, MCA. This prima facie proof may be contradicted and overcome by other evidence that proves, by a preponderance of the evidence, that the elements of the claim do not accurately reflect the beneficial use of the water right as it existed prior to July 1, 1973. This is the burden of proof for every assertion that a claim is incorrect. Rule 19, W.R.Adj.R.

3. The Water Court may use information submitted by the DNRC, the Statement of Claim, and any other data obtained by the Court to evaluate a water right. §§ 85-2-227, -231(2), MCA.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The claims should be modified as discussed above.

2. Modification or dismissal of the claims as described above resolves the substantive issue remarks on the modified or dismissed claims.

3

3. The October 17, 2024, filing resolves the remarks stating that the claim form was not signed or notarized on claims 41S 30131049 and 41S 30131054.

4. The remaining issue remarks should be removed from the claims as they do not require additional information or proceedings to resolve.

RECOMMENDATION

1. Upon review the record in this case, the claims should be modified as discussed above and the issue remarks should be removed from the claims as discussed above.

Post Decree Abstracts of Water Right Claims are attached to this Master's Report for review.

ELECTRONICALLY SIGNED AND DATED BELOW.

Service via USPS Mail:

Hughes & Sons Cattle Company PO Box 195 Stanford, MT 59479-0195

\JUDHLNSRV-DATA\Share\JUDGALH2OSRV (Datavol)\Share\WC-BASIN FOLDERS\41S PD\Cases\320\NB 41S-0320-R-2024 MR - Resolution of IRs 248 (NEW, multi claim, no modifications, remove issue remarks) 4-10-2025 rr.docx

JUDITH RIVER

Water Right Number:	4	11S 148544	-00	STATEMENT	OF CL/	AIM				
	V	Version: 4 POST DECREE								
		ł	Status	ACTIVE						
Owners:	F	HUGHES & SONS CATTLE COMPANY PO BOX 195 STANFORD, MT 59479-0195								
Priority Date:	J	JULY 10, 1904								
Type of Historical Right	t: F	FILED								
Purpose (Use):	5	STOCK								
*Flow Rate:	C	A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED FOR THIS USE FROM THIS ONSTREAM RESERVOIR. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.								
*Volume:	S	THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.								
Source Name:	J	JACKSON LAKE #1								
Source Type:		SURFACE WATER								
Point of Diversion and I	Means of	f Diversion:								
<u>ID</u>		<u>Govt Lot</u>		<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>		
1				SWSENW	25	14N	11E	JUDITH BASIN		
Period of Diversion:	-		TO D	ECEMBER 31						
Diversion Means:	_	DAM								
*Reservoir:	(ONSTREAM]	Reservoir Nam	e: JACK	(SON LA	KE #1			
		<u>Govt Lot</u>		<u>Qtr Sec</u> SWSENW	<u>Sec</u> 25	<u>Twp</u> 14N	<u>Rge</u> 11E	<u>County</u> JUDITH BASIN		
Diversion to	Reservo	ir: DIVERS	ION #	<i>‡</i> 1						
Period of Use:	J	JANUARY 1	TO D	ECEMBER 31						
*Place of Use:										
<u>ID</u> 1	<u>Acres</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>		<u>Qtr Sec</u> SWSENW	<u>Sec</u> 25	<u>Twp</u> 14N	<u>Rge</u> 11E	<u>County</u> JUDITH BASIN		

POST DECREE ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM JUDITH RIVER

BASIN 41S

Water Right Number:	41S 148579-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM
	Version: 4 POST DECREE
	Status: DISMISSED
Owners:	HUGHES & SONS CATTLE COMPANY PO BOX 195 STANFORD, MT 59479-0195
Priority Date:	
Type of Historical Right:	
Purpose (Use):	IRRIGATION
Flow Rate:	
Volume:	
Source Name:	SPRING, UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF SAGE CREEK
Source Type:	GROUNDWATER
Point of Diversion and Means	of Diversion:
Period of Use:	
Place of Use:	

Remarks:

JUDITH RIVER BASIN 41S

Water Right Number:	41S 148580-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM
	Version: 4 POST DECREE
	Status: DISMISSED
Owners:	HUGHES & SONS CATTLE COMPANY
	PO BOX 195
	STANFORD, MT 59479-0195
Priority Date:	
Type of Historical Right:	
Purpose (Use):	IRRIGATION
Flow Rate:	
Volume:	
Source Name:	SAGE CREEK
Source Type:	SURFACE WATER
Point of Diversion and Means	of Diversion:
Period of Use:	
Place of Use:	
Domonka	

Remarks:

POST DECREE ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM JUDITH RIVER

BASIN 41S

Water Right Number:	41S 148582-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM								
	Version:	4 POST	DECREE						
		Status:	DISMISSED						
Owners:	PO BOX 19	UGHES & SONS CATTLE COMPANY O BOX 195 TANFORD, MT 59479-0195							
Priority Date:									
Type of Historical Right:									
Purpose (Use):	IRRIGATION								
Flow Rate:									
Volume:									
Source Name:	UNNAMED	TRIBUTAR	Y OF SAGE CREEK						
Source Type:	GROU	NDWATER							
Point of Diversion and Means	of Diversion:								
Period of Use:									
Place of Use:									

Remarks:

POST DECREE ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM JUDITH RIVER

BASIN 41S

Water Right Number:	41S 14858	3-00 STA	TEMENT OF CLAIM
	Version:	4 POST	T DECREE
		Status:	DISMISSED
Owners:	HUGHES 8 PO BOX 19 STANFORI	95	TTLE COMPANY 9-0195
Priority Date:			
Type of Historical Right:			
Purpose (Use):	IRRIGATIO	N	
Flow Rate:			
Volume:			
Source Name:	SPRING, U	NNAMED 1	TRIBUTARY OF RUNNING WOLF CREEK
Source Type:	GROU	NDWATER	R
Point of Diversion and Means	of Diversion	:	
Period of Use:			
Place of Use:			

Remarks:

JUDITH RIVER

Water Right Number:	41S 1667	95-00	STATEMENT	OF CL	AIM					
	Version:	Version: 3 POST DECREE								
		Status: ACTIVE								
Owners:	PO BOX 1	HUGHES & SONS CATTLE COMPANY PO BOX 195 STANFORD, MT 59479-0195								
Priority Date:	MAY 6, 19	MAY 6, 1971								
Type of Historical Right	: USE	USE								
Purpose (Use):	STOCK	STOCK								
*Flow Rate:	ONSTRE/	A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED FOR THIS USE FROM THIS ONSTREAM RESERVOIR. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.								
*Volume:	STOCK W UNIT. AN	THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.								
Source Name:	UNNAME	UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF SAGE CREEK								
Source Type:	SUR	SURFACE WATER								
Point of Diversion and N	Jeans of Diversio	n:								
ID	<u>Govt L</u>	<u>ot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>			
1			NWSENW	24	14N	11E	JUDITH BASIN			
*Period of Diversion:			DECEMBER 31							
Diversion Means:			RECT FROM SO	URCE						
Reservoir:	ONSTRE/			~	_	_				
	<u>Govt L</u>	<u>ot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u> NWSENW	<u>Sec</u> 24	<u>Twp</u> 14N	<u>Rge</u> 11E	<u>County</u> JUDITH BASIN			
Diversion to	Reservoir: DIVE	RSION	N # 1							
Period of Use:	JANUARY	1 TO	DECEMBER 31							
Place of Use:										
<u>ID</u> 1	<u>Acres</u> <u>Govt L</u>	<u>ot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u> SENW	<u>Sec</u> 24	<u>Twp</u> 14N	<u>Rge</u> 11E	<u>County</u> JUDITH BASIN			

JUDITH RIVER

Water Right Number:	41S 16679	96-00	STATEMENT	OF CL	AIM					
	Version:	Version: 3 POST DECREE								
		Status: ACTIVE								
Owners:	PO BOX 1	HUGHES & SONS CATTLE COMPANY PO BOX 195 STANFORD, MT 59479-0195								
Priority Date:	MAY 6, 19	MAY 6, 1971								
Type of Historical Right	: USE									
Purpose (Use):	STOCK	STOCK								
*Flow Rate:	ONSTREA	A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED FOR THIS USE FROM THIS ONSTREAM RESERVOIR. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.								
*Volume:	STOCK W. UNIT. ANII	THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.								
Source Name:	UNNAMED	UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF RUNNING WOLF CREEK								
Source Type:	SURF	SURFACE WATER								
Point of Diversion and M	leans of Diversion	:								
ID	<u>Govt La</u>	<u>ot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	County			
1			NWNESE	28	15N	11E	JUDITH BASIN			
*Period of Diversion:		-	DECEMBER 31							
Diversion Means:			RECT FROM SO	URCE						
Reservoir:	ONSTREA			a	-	-	~			
	<u>Govt Lo</u>	<u>ot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u> NWNESE	<u>Sec</u> 28	<u>Twp</u> 15N	<u>Rge</u> 11E	<u>County</u> JUDITH BASIN			
Diversion to I	Reservoir: DIVE	RSION	l # 1							
Period of Use:	JANUARY	1 TO	DECEMBER 31							
Place of Use:										
<u>ID</u> 1	<u>Acres</u> <u>Govt Lo</u>	<u>ot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u> NWNESE	<u>Sec</u> 28	<u>Twp</u> 15N	<u>Rge</u> 11E	<u>County</u> JUDITH BASIN			

POST DECREE

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

JUDITH RIVER

Water Right Number:		41S 301310				IM					
		Version:	2 POS	ST DECREE							
			Status:	ACTIVE							
Owners:		HUGHES & S	SONS C	ATTLE CON	MPANY						
		PO BOX 195									
		STANFORD, MT 59479-0195									
*Priority Date:		DECEMBER	DECEMBER 31, 1917								
Type of Historical Right	t:	USE	USE								
Purpose (Use):		STOCK									
*Flow Rate:		A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED BECAUSE THIS USE CONSISTS OF STOCK DRINKING DIRECTLY FROM THE SOURCE, OR FROM A DITCH SYSTEM. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.									
*Volume:		THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.									
Source Name:		SPRING, UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF RUNNING WOLF CREEK									
Source Type:		SURFACE WATER									
Point of Diversion and N	Means	of Diversion:									
ID		<u>Govt Lot</u>		<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>			
1			SV	VNWSW	28	15N	11E	JUDITH BASIN			
Period of Diversion:		JANUARY 1	TO DEC	EMBER 31							
Diversion Means:		LIVESTOCK	DIRECT	FROM SO	URCE						
Period of Use:		JANUARY 1	TO DEC	EMBER 31							
Place of Use:											
ID	<u>Acres</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>		<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>			
1			SV	VNWSW	28	15N	11E	JUDITH BASIN			

POST DECREE

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

JUDITH RIVER

Water Right Number:	41S 3013	31054 STATEMENT	OF CLA	IM							
	Version:	2 POST DECRE	Ξ								
		Status: ACTIVE									
Owners:	PO BOX	HUGHES & SONS CATTLE COMPANY PO BOX 195 STANFORD, MT 59479-0195									
*Priority Date:	DECEMB	ER 31, 1904									
Type of Historical Right	: USE	USE									
Purpose (Use):	STOCK										
*Flow Rate:	OF STOC THE FLO	K DRINKING DIRECT	LY FRC	M THE S	SOURCE	BECAUSE THIS USE CONSISTS E, OR FROM A DITCH SYSTEM. JNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY					
*Volume:	STOCK V UNIT. AN	THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.									
Source Name:	UNNAME	UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF SAGE CREEK									
Source Type:	SUR	SURFACE WATER									
*Point of Diversion and N	leans of Diversio	n:									
ID	<u>Govt I</u>		<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>					
1 Deviad of Dimensions		SESESE	24	14N	11E	JUDITH BASIN					
Period of Diversion: Diversion Means:		(1 TO DECEMBER 31 CK DIRECT FROM SC									
2	LIVESTO	E2E2NE	25	14N	11E	JUDITH BASIN					
Period of Diversion:	JANUAR	1 TO DECEMBER 31		1411							
Diversion Means:		CK DIRECT FROM SC									
3		NENESE	25	14N	11E	JUDITH BASIN					
Period of Diversion:	JANUAR	1 TO DECEMBER 31	ļ								
Diversion Means:	LIVESTO	CK DIRECT FROM SC	URCE								
4		W2W2SW	19	14N	12E	JUDITH BASIN					
Period of Diversion:	JANUAR	1 TO DECEMBER 31									
Diversion Means:	LIVESTO	CK DIRECT FROM SC	OURCE								
Period of Use:	JANUAR	1 TO DECEMBER 31	l								
*Place of Use:											
	<u>Acres</u> <u>Govt I</u>	-	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>					
1		SESESE	24	14N	11E	JUDITH BASIN					
2 3		E2E2NE NENESE	25 25	14N 14N	11E 11E	JUDITH BASIN JUDITH BASIN					
3 4		W2W2SW	25 19	14N	12E	JUDITH BASIN					
			.0								

POST DECREE

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

JUDITH RIVER

Water Right Number:	41S 3013	1055	STATEMENT C	OF CLA	M					
	Version:	2 F	OST DECREE							
		Statu	s: ACTIVE							
Owners:	PO BOX 1	HUGHES & SONS CATTLE COMPANY PO BOX 195 STANFORD, MT 59479-0195								
*Priority Date:	DECEMBE	DECEMBER 31, 1904								
Type of Historical Right:	USE	USE								
Purpose (Use):	STOCK	STOCK								
*Flow Rate:	OF STOC	A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED BECAUSE THIS USE CONSISTS OF STOCK DRINKING DIRECTLY FROM THE SOURCE, OR FROM A DITCH SYSTEM. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.								
*Volume:	STOCK W UNIT. ANI	THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.								
Source Name:	UNNAME	UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF SAGE CREEK								
Source Type:	SURF	SURFACE WATER								
*Point of Diversion and M	eans of Diversion	ı:								
ID	<u>Govt L</u>	<u>ot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>			
1			SWSW	24	14N	11E	JUDITH BASIN			
Period of Diversion:			ECEMBER 31							
Diversion Means:	LIVESTO	K DIRE	ECT FROM SOU							
2			W2	25	14N	11E	JUDITH BASIN			
Period of Diversion:		-	ECEMBER 31							
Diversion Means:			ECT FROM SOU	JRCE						
Period of Use:	JANUARY	1 TO D	ECEMBER 31							
*Place of Use:										
	Acres <u>Govt L</u>	<u>ot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	Sec	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>			
1 2			SWSW W2	24 25	14N 14N	11E 11E	JUDITH BASIN JUDITH BASIN			
2			٧٧Z	20	14IN	11				