Montana Water Court PO Box 1389 Bozeman, MT 59771-1389 (406) 586-4364 1-800-624-3270 watercourt@mt.gov FILEED 04/16/2025 Sara Calkins CLERK Montana Water Court STATE OF MONTANA By: D'Ann CIGLER 41H-0986-R-2024 Nordlund, Julia 4.00

IN THE WATER COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA UPPER MISSOURI DIVISION GALLATIN RIVER BASIN (41H) PRELIMINARY DECREE

* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *

CLAIMANTS: 4350 Spain Bridge LLC; The Ruh Family Trust; Edwin Marc Seifert

NOTICE OF INTENT TO APPEAR: Riverside Country Club

CASE 41H-0986-R-2024 41H 140912-00 41H 140913-00 41H 140915-00

NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER'S REPORT

This Master's Report was filed with the Montana Water Court on the above stamped date. <u>Please review this report carefully.</u>

You may file a written objection to this Master's Report within **10 days** of the stamped date if you disagree or find errors with the Master's findings of fact, conclusions of law, or recommendations. Rule 23, W.R.Adj.R. If the Master's Report was mailed to you, the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure allow an additional 3 days be added to the 10-day objection period. Rule 6(d), M.R.Civ.P. If you file an objection, you must serve a copy of the objection to all parties on the service list found at the end of the Master's Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the service list must be filed with the Water Court.

If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master's Report.

MASTER'S REPORT

FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Claims 41H 140912-00, 41H 140913-00 and 41H 140915-00 appeared in the Preliminary Decree for Basin 41H with Montana Department of Natural Resources and Conservation (DNRC) issue remarks. The claims received a notice of intent to appear from Riverside Country Club ("Riverside").

2. On February 20, 2025, Claimant 4350 Spain Bridge LLC ("Spain Bridge") filed a Notice of Filing Information to resolve the issue remarks to the claims.

3. The Order Consolidating this case dated December 23, 2024, stated Riverside would have 14 days to respond to Claimants' evidence. Riverside did not file a response to the Notice.

4. Claims 41H 140913-00 and 41H 140915-00 each have an issue remark stating they may be multiple uses of the same right.

5. Spain Bridge agrees with the remarks and requests multiple use information remarks be placed on each of the claims as well as changing the type of right on claim 41H 140915-00 to decreed to align with claim 41H 140913-00.

6. Claim 41H 140912-00 also has a notice-type issue remark regarding a modification to the ditch name. Spain Bridge has no objection to this and the remark can be removed.

7. The remaining issue remarks on claims 41H 140913-00 and 41H 140915-00 are regarding modifications made by DNRC or priority date predating the decree. The purpose of these remarks was to serve notice of the change to water users. The remarks have served their purpose and can be removed.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Montana Water Court has the authority to resolve issue remarks when the claim file and information available to the Court provide a sufficient basis to do so. Section 85-2-248(3), MCA.

2. A properly filed Statement of Claim for Existing Water Right is prima facie proof of its content. Section 85-2-227, MCA. This prima facie proof may be contradicted and overcome by other evidence that proves, by a preponderance of the evidence, that an element of the prima facie claim is incorrect. This is the burden of proof for every assertion that a claim is incorrect. Rule 19, W.R.Adj.R.

2

3. The degree or weight of evidence needed to contradict or overcome the prima facie proof statute is a preponderance of the evidence. *Burkhartsmeyer et al. v. Burkhartsmeyer et al.*, Case 40G-2, (MT Water Court Memorandum Opinion and Order Adopting Master's Report, Mar. 11, 1997). The Montana Supreme Court has defined preponderance as "a relatively modest standard that the statutory criteria are 'more probable than not' to have been met." *Hohenlohe v. State*, 2010 MT 203 ¶ 33, 357 Mont. 438, 240 P.3d 628.

4. The Montana Water Court is permitted to use information submitted by the Department of Natural Resources and Conservation, the statement of claim, information from approved compacts, and any other data obtained by the Court to evaluate water right claims. Section 85-2-231(2), MCA.

5. The issues raised by issue remarks must be resolved as part of the adjudication process pursuant to Section 85-2-248, MCA.

6. When resolving issue remarks, the Montana Water Court must weigh the information resulting in the issue remark and the issue remark against the claimed water right. Section 85-2-247(2), MCA.

7. For the above-mentioned reasons, the claims in this case should be modified as shown on the attached abstracts to resolve all issue remarks and to accurately reflect historical use.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Based upon the above Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, this Master recommends that the Court make the changes specified above to correct the Preliminary Decree for this Basin. Post Decree Abstracts of Water Right Claims are served with this Report to confirm that the recommended changes have been made in the state's centralized record system.

ELECTRONICALLY SIGNED AND DATED BELOW.

Service via USPS Mail:

Last Order 4350 Spain Bridge LLC PO Box 172750 Bozeman, MT 59715

The Ruh Family Trust 2778 Sartain St Bozeman, MT 59718

Service Via Electronic Mail:

Abigail R. Brown Attorney at Law Parsons Behle & Latimer 201. E. Broadway St. P.O. Box 104 Helena, MT 59624 Telephone: (406) 410-5050 AbbyBrown@parsonsbehle.com ecf@parsonsbehle.com (atty Seifert)

Benjamin S. Sudduth Sudduth Law, PLLC 1050 East Main Street, Suite 3B PO Box 507 Bozeman, MT 59771-0507 (406) 272-2390 benjamin@sudduthlaw.com (atty Riverside Country Club)

A. Suzanne Nellen Attorney at Law, PLLC PO Box 668 Sheridan, MT (406) 587-4427 nellen@nellenlaw.com kthomas@nellenlaw.com (atty Riverside Country Club)

Breeann M Johnson Esq Kirsa A. Shelkey, Esq Western Roots Law PLLC PO Box 7004 Bozeman, MT 59771 (406) 600-9389 Breeann (406) 599-2087 Kirsa johnson@westrootslaw.com shelkey@westrootslaw.com (atty 4350 Spain Bridge)

Notice: Service List Updated 4.10.25

\JUDHLNSRV-DATA\Share\JUDGALH2OSRV (Datavol)\Share\WC-BASIN FOLDERS\41H PD\41H Cases\41H-R986JN 41H-986 MR evid MU 4.10.25 VH.docx

POST DECREE ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

GALLATIN RIVER BASIN 41H

BASIN 41H										
Water Right Number:	41H 140912	2-00 STATEM	ENT OF C	LAIM						
	Version:	3 POST DEC	REE							
		Status: ACT	IVE							
Owners:	PO BOX 22	RC SEIFERT 2 , MT 59714-022	2							
	PO BOX 17	4350 SPAIN BRIDGE LLC PO BOX 172750 BOZEMAN, MT 59715								
	605 N 7TH /	RUH FAMILY TRUST, THE 605 N 7TH AVE APT 304 BOZEMAN, MT 59715-2878								
	-	TRANSFER PROCESSED TO ADD NEW OWNERS. THE WATER RIGHT WILL BE SPLIT INTO SEPARATE OWNERSHIPS AFTER FINAL DECREE.								
Priority Date:	JUNE 1, 186	8								
Type of Historical Right:	DECREED									
Purpose (Use):	IRRIGATIO	١								
Irrigation Type:	FLOOD									
Flow Rate:	1.75 CFS									
Volume:		VOLUME OF T ICAL AND BEN			T SHALL	NOT EXCEED THE AMOUNT PUT				
Climatic Area:	4 - MODER	ATELY LOW								
Maximum Acres:	259.00									
Source Name:	EAST GALL	ATIN RIVER								
Source Type:	SURFA	CE WATER								
Point of Diversion and M	eans of Diversion:									
<u>ID</u> 1	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr S</u> NWNEN		<u>Twp</u> 1S	<u>Rge</u> 5E	<u>County</u> GALLATIN				
Period of Diversion:	MAY 1 TO S	EPTEMBER 30								
Diversion Means:	HEADGATE									
Ditch Name:	ARNOLD DI	ТСН								
Period of Use:	MAY 1 TO S	EPTEMBER 30								
Place of Use:										
ID	amon Court Lat	Ot - 5	na Saa	Trum	Das	Country				

<u>ID</u>	<u>Acres</u> <u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1	34.00	NWNE	33	1N	5E	GALLATIN
2	40.00	SWNE	33	1N	5E	GALLATIN
3	40.00	SENE	33	1N	5E	GALLATIN
4	40.00	NENW	33	1N	5E	GALLATIN

5		40.00	SENW	33	1N	5E	GALLATIN
6		40.00	NESE	33	1N	5E	GALLATIN
7		20.00	E2NWSE	33	1N	5E	GALLATIN
8		5.00	S2SESW	28	1N	5E	GALLATIN
	Total:	259.00					

Remarks:

THE WATER RIGHTS FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE SUPPLEMENTAL WHICH MEANS THE RIGHTS HAVE OVERLAPPING PLACES OF USE. THE RIGHTS CAN BE COMBINED TO IRRIGATE ONLY OVERLAPPING PARCELS. EACH RIGHT IS LIMITED TO THE FLOW RATE AND PLACE OF USE OF THAT INDIVIDUAL RIGHT. THE SUM TOTAL VOLUME OF THESE WATER RIGHTS SHALL NOT EXCEED THE AMOUNT PUT TO HISTORICAL AND BENEFICIAL USE.

140912-00 140913-00

Diversion Means:

POST DECREE ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

GALLATIN RIVER BASIN 41H

BASIN 41H									
Water Right Number:	41H 14091	3-00 STA	TEMENT	OF CL	AIM				
	Version:	3 POST	DECRE	E					
		Status:	ACTIVE						
Owners:	EDWIN MA PO BOX 22 BELGRADE	2							
	4350 SPAIN BRIDGE LLC PO BOX 172750 BOZEMAN, MT 59715								
	RUH FAMILY TRUST, THE 605 N 7TH AVE APT 304 BOZEMAN, MT 59715-2878								
	TRANSFER INTO SEPA						IE WATER RIGHT WILL BE SPLIT EE.		
Priority Date:	JUNE 30, 1	864							
Type of Historical Right:	DECREED								
Purpose (Use):	IRRIGATIO	N							
Irrigation Type:	FLOOD								
Flow Rate:	1.48 CFS								
Volume:	THE TOTAL TO HISTOR					SHALL	NOT EXCEED THE AMOUNT PUT		
Climatic Area:	4 - MODER	ATELY LO	Ν						
Maximum Acres:	259.00								
Source Name:	EAST GALLATIN RIVER								
Source Type:	SURFA	CE WATE	R						
Point of Diversion and Means	s of Diversion:								
ID	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>.</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	County		
1			/NENE	15	1S	5E	GALLATIN		
Period of Diversion:	MAY 1 TO S	SEPTEMBE	R 30						

Ditch Name:	A	ARNOLD DITCH									
Period of Use:	Ν	MAY 1 TO SEPTEMBER 30									
Place of Use:											
ID	<u>Acres</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>				
1	34.00		NWNE	33	1N	5E	GALLATIN				
2	40.00		SWNE	33	1N	5E	GALLATIN				
3	40.00		SENE	33	1N	5E	GALLATIN				
4	40.00		NENW	33	1N	5E	GALLATIN				

HEADGATE

5		40.00	SENW	33	1N	5E	GALLATIN
6		40.00	NESE	33	1N	5E	GALLATIN
7		20.00	E2NWSE	33	1N	5E	GALLATIN
8		5.00	S2SESW	28	1N	5E	GALLATIN
	Total:	259.00					

Remarks:

THE WATER RIGHTS FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE SUPPLEMENTAL WHICH MEANS THE RIGHTS HAVE OVERLAPPING PLACES OF USE. THE RIGHTS CAN BE COMBINED TO IRRIGATE ONLY OVERLAPPING PARCELS. EACH RIGHT IS LIMITED TO THE FLOW RATE AND PLACE OF USE OF THAT INDIVIDUAL RIGHT. THE SUM TOTAL VOLUME OF THESE WATER RIGHTS SHALL NOT EXCEED THE AMOUNT PUT TO HISTORICAL AND BENEFICIAL USE.

140912-00 140913-00

THE WATER RIGHTS LISTED FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE MULTIPLE USES OF THE SAME RIGHT. THE USE OF THIS RIGHT FOR SEVERAL PURPOSES DOES NOT INCREASE THE EXTENT OF THE WATER RIGHT. RATHER IT DECREES THE RIGHT TO ALTERNATE AND EXCHANGE THE USE (PURPOSE) OF THE WATER IN ACCORD WITH HISTORICAL PRACTICES.

140913-00 140915-00

POST DECREE ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

GALLATIN RIVER

BASIN 41H

Water Right Number:	41H 14091	5-00 ST	ATEMENT	OF CL	AIM		
	Version:	3 POS	T DECREE				
		Status:	ACTIVE				
Owners:	4350 SPAII PO BOX 17 BOZEMAN	2750	-				
Priority Date:	JUNE 30, 1	864					
Type of Historical Right:	DECREED						
Purpose (Use):	STOCK						
Flow Rate:	OF STOCK	DRINKING	G DIRECTL	Y FRC	M THE	SOURC	BECAUSE THIS USE CONSISTS E, OR FROM A DITCH SYSTEM. UNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY
Volume:	STOCK WA	ATERING F MAL UNITS	PURPOSES SHALL BE	S AT TH E BASE	HE RATE	E OF 30 EASON	ONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL ABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND WATER SOURCE.
Source Name:	EAST GAL	LATIN RIV	ER				
Source Type:	SURF	ACE WATE	ER				
Point of Diversion and Mean	s of Diversion	:					
<u>ID</u> 1	<u>Govt Lo</u>	_	<u>Qtr Sec</u> WNENE	<u>Sec</u> 15	<u>Twp</u> 1S	<u>Rge</u> 5E	<u>County</u> GALLATIN
Period of Diversion:	JANUARY	1 TO DECI	EMBER 31				
Diversion Means:	DITCH						
Ditch Name:	ARNOLD D	ITCH					
Period of Use:	JANUARY	1 TO DECI	EMBER 31				
Place of Use:							
ID Acre	<u>s</u> <u>Govt Lo</u>	<u>t</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1				33 33	1N 1N	5E 5E	GALLATIN
2			NENW	১১	1N	5E	GALLATIN

Remarks:

THE WATER RIGHTS LISTED FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE MULTIPLE USES OF THE SAME RIGHT. THE USE OF THIS RIGHT FOR SEVERAL PURPOSES DOES NOT INCREASE THE EXTENT OF THE WATER RIGHT. RATHER IT DECREES THE RIGHT TO ALTERNATE AND EXCHANGE THE USE (PURPOSE) OF THE WATER IN ACCORD WITH HISTORICAL PRACTICES.

140913-00 140915-00