FILED

09/27/2024

Sara Calkins
CLERK

Montana Water Court STATE OF MONTANA By: Regina Certalic 41S-0803-R-2024 Stern, Anika

2.00

Montana Water Court PO Box 1389 Bozeman, MT 59771-1389 1-800-624-3270 (406) 586-4364 watercourt@mt.gov

IN THE WATER COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA LOWER MISSOURI DIVISION JUDITH RIVER BASIN (41S) PRELIMINARY DECREE

CLAIMANTS: Carla J. Dennison; Harland R. Dennison

CASE 41S-0803-R-2024 41S 30131139 41S 30131140 41S 30131142

NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER'S REPORT

This Master's Report was filed with the Montana Water Court on the above-stamped date. Please review this report carefully.

You may file a written objection to this Master's Report within **10 days** of the stamped date if you disagree or find errors with the Master's findings of fact, conclusions of law, or recommendations. Rule 23, W.R.Adj.R. If the Master's Report was mailed to you, the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure allow an additional 3 days be added to the 10-day objection period. Rule 6(d), M.R.Civ.P. If you file an objection, you must serve a copy of the objection to all parties on the service list found at the end of the Master's Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the service list must be filed with the Water Court.

If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master's Report.

MASTER'S REPORT

FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. Carla J. Dennison and Harland R. Dennison are the record owners of claims 41S 30131139, 41S 30131140, and 41S 30131142.
- 2. Claims 41S 30131139, 41S 30131140, and 41S 30131142 were decreed with DNRC issue remarks:
 - THIS CLAIM NUMBER WAS NOT INCLUDED IN THE BASIN 41S DECREE ISSUED 05/17/1984.
 - NO TYPE OF HISTORICAL RIGHT WAS CLAIMED. DOCUMENTATION TO SUPPORT THE TYPE OF HISTORICAL RIGHT WAS NOT SUBMITTED WITH THIS CLAIM.

By statute, the Water Court is required to resolve all issue remarks decreed on claims.

- 3. The first-listed issue remark on the claims is a notice-type remark and does not require further proceedings.
- 4. The second-listed issue remark refers to the July 1, 2019 Statement of Claim forms and the type of historical right being left blank:

13.	TYPE OF HISTORIC RIGHT:	O Decreed O Filed Appropriation O Use	Date of first use: 1902
		Attach copies of the decree, record of filing, or proof of use right.	

5. An Order was issued setting a deadline for Claimants Carla J. Dennison and Harland R. Dennison to address the issue remark. The Order indicated that if nothing were filed by the deadline, this Water Master would proceed based on the record.

PRINCIPLES AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. The Water Court is required to address all issue remarks decreed on a claim as well as any objections the claim receives. Sections 85-2-233, 85-2-247, and 85-2-248, MCA.
- 2. A properly filed Statement of Claim for an existing water right is prima facie proof of its content. Section 85-2-227, MCA. This prima facie validity may be overcome by evidence showing that one or more elements of the claim are incorrect. This standard of proof applies to objectors or claimants objecting to their own water right claims. Rule 19, W.R.Adj.R., *Nelson v. Brooks*, 2014 MT 120; 375 Mont.86, 95; 329 P.3d 558, 564. Existence of an issue remark alone does not overcome the prima facie claim.

- 3. Statement of claim forms included a blank to list whether a claim was a use, filed, or decreed right. In the present case, the claimant indicated the claims were based on a 1902 land patent, suggesting the claims are use rights.
- 4. The remarks decreed on claims 41S 30131139, 41S 30131140, and 41S 30131142 indicating they were not included in the 1984 decrees are notice-type issue remarks and have served their purpose. As no objections were filed, no further proceedings are required because of the remarks.

RECOMMENDATIONS

- 1. The type of historical right for claims 41S 30131139, 41S 30131140, and 41S 30131142 should be "use."
- 2. The issue remarks should be removed from claims 41S 30131139, 41S 30131140, and 41S 30131142.

Abstracts are attached for review.

ELECTRONICALLY SIGNED AND DATED BELOW.

Service via USPS Mail:

Carla J. Dennison Harland R. Dennison PO Box 679 Lewistown, MT 59457-0679

POST DECREE

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

JUDITH RIVER

BASIN 41S

Water Right Number: 41S 30131139 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

Version: 2 -- POST DECREE

Status: ACTIVE

Owners: CARLA J DENNISON

PO BOX 827

LEWISTOWN, MT 59457

HARLAND R DENNISON

PO BOX 827

LEWISTOWN, MT 59457

*Priority Date: DECEMBER 31, 1902

Type of Historical Right: USE

Purpose (Use): STOCK

*Flow Rate: A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED BECAUSE THIS USE CONSISTS

OF STOCK DRINKING DIRECTLY FROM THE SOURCE, OR FROM A DITCH SYSTEM. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY

TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.

*Volume: THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR

STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND

HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.

Source Name: UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF CASTLE CREEK

Source Type: SURFACE WATER

*Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

<u>ID</u> <u>Govt Lot</u> <u>Qtr Sec</u> <u>Sec</u> <u>Twp</u> <u>Rge</u> <u>County</u> 1 SENW 7 14N 19E FERGUS

Period of Diversion: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

Diversion Means: LIVESTOCK DIRECT FROM SOURCE

Period of Use: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

*Place of Use:

IDAcresGovt LotQtr SecSecTwpRgeCounty1SENW714N19EFERGUS

POST DECREE

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

JUDITH RIVER

BASIN 41S

Water Right Number: 41S 30131140 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

Version: 2 -- POST DECREE

Status: ACTIVE

Owners: CARLA J DENNISON

PO BOX 827

LEWISTOWN, MT 59457

HARLAND R DENNISON

PO BOX 827

LEWISTOWN, MT 59457

*Priority Date: DECEMBER 31, 1902

Type of Historical Right: USE

Purpose (Use): STOCK

*Flow Rate: A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED BECAUSE THIS USE CONSISTS

OF STOCK DRINKING DIRECTLY FROM THE SOURCE, OR FROM A DITCH SYSTEM. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY

TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.

*Volume: THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR

STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND

HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.

Source Name: UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF CASTLE CREEK

Source Type: SURFACE WATER

*Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

<u>ID</u> <u>Govt Lot</u> <u>Qtr Sec</u> <u>Sec</u> <u>Twp</u> <u>Rge</u> <u>County</u> 1 S2S2SWNW 7 14N 19E FERGUS

Period of Diversion: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

Diversion Means: LIVESTOCK DIRECT FROM SOURCE

Period of Use: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

*Place of Use:

IDAcresGovt LotQtr SecSecTwpRgeCounty1S2S2SWNW714N19EFERGUS

POST DECREE

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

JUDITH RIVER

BASIN 41S

Water Right Number: 41S 30131142 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

Version: 2 -- POST DECREE

Status: ACTIVE

Owners: CARLA J DENNISON

PO BOX 827

LEWISTOWN, MT 59457

HARLAND R DENNISON

PO BOX 827

LEWISTOWN, MT 59457

*Priority Date: DECEMBER 31, 1902

Type of Historical Right: USE

Purpose (Use): STOCK

*Flow Rate: A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED BECAUSE THIS USE CONSISTS

OF STOCK DRINKING DIRECTLY FROM THE SOURCE, OR FROM A DITCH SYSTEM. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY

TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.

*Volume: THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR

STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND

HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.

Source Name: UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF CASTLE CREEK

Source Type: SURFACE WATER

*Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

<u>ID</u> <u>Govt Lot</u> <u>Qtr Sec</u> <u>Sec</u> <u>Twp</u> <u>Rge</u> <u>County</u> 1 N2SWNW 7 14N 19E FERGUS

Period of Diversion: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

Diversion Means: LIVESTOCK DIRECT FROM SOURCE

Period of Use: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

*Place of Use:

<u>ID</u> <u>Acres Govt Lot Qtr Sec Sec Twp Rge County</u>

1 N2SWNW 7 14N 19E FERGUS