F I L E D

O5/13/2024

Sara Calkins
CLERK

CLERK
Montana Water Court
STATE OF MONTANA
By: D'Ann CIGLER
76D-0590-R-2024

Stradley, Anna

2.00

Montana Water Court PO Box 1389 Bozeman, MT 59771-1389 (406) 586-4364 1-800-624-3270 watercourt@mt.gov

# IN THE WATER COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA CLARK FORK DIVISION KOOTENAI RIVER BASIN (76D) PRELIMINARY DECREE

\* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \*

CLAIMANT: United States of America (Department of Army Corp of Engineers)

CASE 76D-0590-R-2024 76D 182074-00

#### NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER'S REPORT

This Master's Report was filed with the Montana Water Court on the above stamped date. <u>Please review this report carefully.</u>

You may file a written objection to this Master's Report within **10 days** of the stamped date if you disagree or find errors with the Master's findings of fact, conclusions of law, or recommendations. Rule 23, W.R.Adj.R. If the Master's Report was mailed to you, the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure allow an additional 3 days be added to the 10-day objection period. Rule 6(d), M.R.Civ.P. If you file an objection, you must serve a copy of the objection to all parties on the service list found at the end of the Master's Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the service list must be filed with the Water Court.

If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master's Report.

### **MASTER'S REPORT**

#### **Statement of the case**

Irrigation well claim 76D 182074-00 appeared in the Preliminary Decree with a priority date of June 30, 1980, and the following issue remarks:

THE FLOW RATE IS MISSING.

THE CLAIMED PRIORITY DATE INDICATES AN APPROPRIATION OF WATER AFTER JUNE 30, 1973.

Issue remarks result from Department of Natural Resources and Conservation ("DNRC") claims examination. Claims examination confirms the historical use of water right claims and identifies issues with claims. If claims examination cannot confirm some aspect of a claim, an issue remark is added to the claim. Montana law requires the Water Court to resolve issue remarks.

Pursuant to statute, the court reviewed the claim file in an attempt to resolve the issue remarks appearing on claim 76D 182074-00. Based on that review it appeared the claim did not have a priority date *prior* to July 1, 1973, and therefore was not an existing right that should be included in the Water Court's decree. The court provided the United States of America (Department of Army Corp of Engineers) an opportunity to refute its review of the record and file additional documentation supporting a priority date *prior* to July 1, 1973. The order stated that if the United States of America (Department of Army Corp of Engineers) did not file additional documentation or a response "the Court will conclude that there is no additional documentation to be filed and will proceed with dismissing the claim from the adjudication." The United States of America (Department of Army Corp of Engineers) did not file a response by the deadline.

#### **Issue**

Should irrigation well claim 76D 182074-00 be dismissed?

# Finding of fact

Irrigation well claim 76D 182074-00 should be dismissed.

## Principles of law

- 1. A properly filed Statement of Claim for Existing Water Right is prima facie proof of its content. Section 85-2-227, MCA. Prima facie proof may be overcome by other evidence that proves, by a preponderance of the evidence, that an element of the prima facie claim is incorrect. This is the burden of proof for every assertion that a claim is incorrect. Rule 19, W.R.Adj.R. A preponderance of the evidence is a "modest standard" and is evidence that demonstrates the fact to be proved is "more probable than not." *Hohenlohe v. State*, 2010 MT 203, ¶ 33, 357 Mont. 348, 240 P.3d 628.
- 2. The Montana Water Court is permitted to use information submitted by the Department of Natural Resources and Conservation, the statement of claim, information from approved compacts, and any other data obtained by the Court to evaluate water right claims. Section 85-2-231(2), MCA.
- 3. When resolving issue remarks, the Montana Water Court must weigh the information resulting in the issue remark and the issue remark against the claimed water right. Section 85-2-247(2), MCA.
- 4. The Montana Water Court has the authority to resolve issue remarks when the claim file and information available to the Court provide a sufficient basis to do so. Section 85-2-248(3), MCA.
- 5. "Existing right' or 'existing water right' means a right to the use of water that would be protected under the law as it existed prior to July 1, 1973." Section 85-2-102(13), MCA.

# **Analysis**

The United States of America (Department of Army Corp of Engineers) did not file additional documentation or a response refuting the current record before the court. Irrigation well claim 76D 182074-00 appears to be a post-1973 use of groundwater.

## **Conclusions of law**

Irrigation well claim 76D 182074-00 is not an existing water right pursuant to Section 85-2-102(13), MCA. Irrigation well claim 76D 182074-00 should not be included in the Water Court's decree.

## Recommendation

Irrigation well claim 76D 182074-00 should be dismissed.

A Post Decree Abstract of Water Right Claim accompanies this report to confirm dismissal of the claim in the state's centralized water right record system.

ELECTRONICALLY SIGNED AND DATED BELOW.

# Service via USPS Mail

United States of America (Department of Army Corp of Engineers) 4735 E Marginal Way S Ste 1202 Seattle WA 98134-2329

\UUDHLNSRV-DATA\Share\UUDGALH2OSRV (Datavol)\Share\WC-BASIN FOLDERS\76D PD\76D Cases\76D-0590-R-2024\MR--76D-590R sjs.docx 5/13/24

#### **POST DECREE**

#### ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

## **KOOTENAI RIVER**

# **BASIN 76D**

Water Right Number: 76D 182074-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

**Version:** 3 -- POST DECREE

**Status: DISMISSED** 

Owners: USA (DEPT OF ARMY CORP OF ENGINEERS)

4735 E MARGINAL WAY S STE 1202

SEATTLE, WA 98134-2329

**Priority Date:** 

Type of Historical Right:

Purpose (Use): IRRIGATION

Flow Rate:

Volume:

Source Name: GROUNDWATER

Source Type: GROUNDWATER

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

Period of Use: Place of Use:

#### Remarks:

THIS CLAIM WAS DISMISSED BY ORDER OF THE WATER COURT.