FILE D 05/07/2024 Sara Calkins CLERK Montana Water Court STATE OF MONTANA By: D'Ann CIGLER 41K-0066-R-2023 White, Eugene 3.00

#### IN THE WATER COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA UPPER MISSOURI DIVISION SUN RIVER BASIN (41K) PRELIMINARY DECREE

CLAIMANT: United States of America (Bureau of Land Management)

OBJECTOR: United States of America (Bureau of Land Management)

CASE 41K-0066-R-2023 41K 78765-00 41K 78766-00 41K 78767-00 41K 78768-00

## NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER'S REPORT

This Master's Report was filed with the Montana Water Court on the above stamped date. <u>Please review this report carefully.</u>

You may file a written objection to this Master's Report within **10 days** of the stamped date if you disagree or find errors with the Master's findings of fact, conclusions of law, or recommendations. Rule 23, W.R.Adj.R. If the Master's Report was mailed to you, the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure allow an additional 3 days be added to the 10-day objection period. Rule 6(d), M.R.Civ.P. If you file an objection, you must serve a copy of the objection to all parties on the service list found at the end of the Master's Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the service list must be filed with the Water Court.

If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master's Report.

#### **MASTER'S REPORT**

All water right claims that appeared in the Preliminary Decree for Sun River (Basin 41K) were subject to "issue remarks" resulting from pre-decree examination by the DNRC, objections, and counterobjections. Each of the above-captioned claims

received a self-objection from claimant United States Bureau of Land Management ("BLM"), and claims 41K 78765-00, 41K 78766-00, and 41K 78767-00 received issue remarks during the DNRC's review of the claims.

The claims were consolidated into Case 41K-0066-R-2023 and a filing deadline was issued by the Court to resolve the self-objections and issue remarks.

## FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Claims 41K 78765-00 and 41K 78766-00 each received the following issue

remark:

POINT OF DIVERSION AND RESERVOIR RECORD WERE MODIFIED AS A RESULT OF DNRC REVIEW UNDER MONTANA WATER COURT REEXAMINATION ORDERS. IF NO OBJECTIONS ARE FILED TO THIS CLAIM, THESE ELEMENTS WILL REMAIN AS THEY APPEAR ON THIS ABSTRACT AND THE REMARK WILL BE REMOVED FROM THE CLAIM.

Claim 41K 78767-00 received the following issue remarks:

THE CLAIMANT DID NOT IDENTIFY THE PERIOD OF DIVERSION FOR THIS RIGHT. A PERIOD OF DIVERSION HAS BEEN ADDED TO MATCH THE PERIOD OF USE. IF NO OBJECTIONS ARE RECEIVED TO THE PERIOD OF DIVERSION OR PERIOD OF USE, THOSE ELEMENTS WILL BE DECREED AS SHOWN ON THIS ABSTRACT AND THIS ISSUE REMARK WILL BE REMOVED FROM THIS CLAIM.

RESERVOIR RECORD WAS MODIFIED AS A RESULT OF DNRC REVIEW UNDER MONTANA WATER COURT REEXAMINATION ORDERS. IF NO OBJECTIONS ARE FILED TO THIS CLAIM, THESE ELEMENTS WILL REMAIN AS THEY APPEAR ON THIS ABSTRACT AND THE REMARK WILL BE REMOVED FROM THE CLAIM.

2. On March 27, 2024, claimant/objector BLM filed a *Notice of Filing of Norris Declaration and Proposed Abstracts* ("*Notice*"). The *Notice* addresses first the self-objections filed by BLM. The *Notice* contained an attached *Declaration of Melissa Norris,* a Water Rights Specialist, employed by BLM. In her *Declaration,* Ms. Norris goes on to state that claims 41K 78765-00 and 41K 78766-00 are multiple use claims which appear with a multiple use information remark as are claims 41K 78767-00 and 41K 78768-00. Further, Ms. Norris states that BLM objected to the claims because the pairs of claims are multiple uses and are for federally owned stock water and wildlife claims, respectively, each of the claims should display the full volume of the appropriation rather than the standard information remark which appears on stock water rights in place of a quantified volume. Further, the *Notice* states that the remaining issue remarks are all notice-type remarks that should be removed after having served their notice purpose with the exception of the remark denoting modifications to the reservoir record for claim 41K 78767-00. Regarding the aforementioned reservoir remark on claim 41K 78767-00, the *Notice* states that BLM objected to the modification made by the DNRC to the reservoir record of claim 41K 78767-00.

3. Attached to the *Notice* were proposed abstracts denoting modifications proposed by the BLM that would resolve the self-objections and issue remarks. Those modifications include:

<u>41K 78765-00</u> *Volume:	1.00	<del>0.07</del> AC-FT
<u>41K 78766-00</u> Volume: 1.00 AC FT	STOCKWA	T INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR TERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER NIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER
41K 78767-00 *Volume: *Reservoir: ON	<b>16.80</b>	<del>16.18</del> AC-FT
	Govt Lot	Qtr SecSecTwpRgeCountyNWSE821N7WLEWIS AND CLARK
Diversion to R Dam Height: Depth: Surface Area: Capacity:	13.00 43 10.00 46 4.20 5	/ERSION # 1 3.00 FEET 3.48 ACRES 1.92 ACRE-FEET

THE CAPACITY, DAM HEIGHT, MAXIMUM DEPTH AND SURFACE AREA HAVE BEEN ESTIMATED BY DNRC.

#### 41K 78768-00

Volume:

16.80 AC FT

THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCKWATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.

#### PRINCIPLES OF LAW

1. A properly filed Statement of Claim for an existing water right is prima facie proof of its content. Section 85-2-227, MCA; Rule 10, W.R.Adj.R.

2. Prima facie proof may be contradicted and overcome by a preponderance of the evidence. Rule 19, W.R.Adj.R.

3. A preponderance of the evidence is evidence that shows a fact is "more probable than not." *Hohenlohe v. State*, 2010 MT 203, ¶ 33, 357 Mont. 438, 240 P.3d 628.

4. If prima facie status is overcome, the burden shifts back to the claimant to demonstrate historical use. *79 Ranch v. Pitsch*, 204 Mont. 426, 432-33, 666 P.2d 215, 218 (1983).

5. Section 85-2-248(2), MCA, requires that the Water Court resolve all issue remarks that are not resolved through the objection process. *See also* Rule 7, W.R.Adj.R.

6. The Water Court may use information submitted by the DNRC, the Statement of Claim, and any other data obtained by the Court to evaluate a water right. Sections 85-2-227, -231(2), MCA.

7. When resolving issue remarks, the Water Court must weigh the information resulting in the issue remark and the issue remark against the claimed water right. Section 85-2-247(2), MCA. The factual evidence on which an issue remark is based must meet the preponderance of evidence standard before the prima facie status of a claim is overcome. 43Q 200996-00 et al., Order Establishing Volume and Order Closing Case, at 18, June 8, 2015.

#### CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. Each of the findings of fact above are supported by a preponderance of the evidence. The claims should be modified as described above. These modifications resolve the BLM's objections and the issue remarks.

#### **RECOMMENDATIONS**

Based on the foregoing Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, this Water Master recommends that the Court modify the claims as described above and remove all issue remarks from the claims.

4

Post-decree abstracts of each water right claim reflecting the recommended changes is attached to this Report.

## ELECTRONICALLY SIGNED AND DATED BELOW.

#### Service Via Electronic Mail:

Mark J. Widerschein, Eve W. McDonald, Trial Attorney United States Department of Justice ENRD NRS PO Box 7611 Washington, DC 20044-7611 202-532-5803 Mark.Widerschein@Usdoj.Gov Montanabasins.ENRD@USDOJ.GOV Evelyn.mcDonald@usdoj.gov

\JUDHLNSRV-DATA\Share\JUDGALH2OSRV (Datavol)\Share\WC-BASIN FOLDERS\41K PD\41K Cases\66\41K-0066-R-2023 MR (multiple claims, response filed resolves self objections and IRs, quantify both volumes) 5-1-24 jbc.docx

## SUN RIVER BASIN 41K

Water Right Number:	41K 78765	- <b>00</b> STA		OF CLA	IM						
	Version: 4 POST DECREE										
		Status:	ACTIVE								
Owners:	USA (DEP			EAU OI	F LAND	MGMT)					
	5001 SOUTHGATE DR BILLINGS, MT 59101-4669										
Priority Date:											
		JUNE 30, 1953									
Type of Historical Right:	USE	USE									
Purpose (Use):	WILDLIFE	WILDLIFE									
*Flow Rate:		A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED FOR THIS USE FROM THIS ONSTREAM RESERVOIR.									
*Volume:	1.00 AC-FT	1.00 AC-FT									
Source Name:	UNNAMED	UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF WILLOW CREEK									
Source Type:	SURFACE WATER										
Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:											
ID	<u>Govt Lo</u>	<u>t</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>				
1		S	ESWNE	8	21N	7W	LEWIS AND CLARK				
Period of Diversion:	JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31										
<b>Diversion Means:</b>	DAM	DAM									
Reservoir:	ONSTREA	М									
	<u>Govt Lo</u>	<u>t</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>				
		S	ESWNE	8	21N	7W	LEWIS AND CLARK				
<b>Diversion to Reservoir:</b> DIVERSION # 1											
Period of Use:	JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31										
Place of Use:											
<u>ID</u> <u>Acr</u>	<u>es <u>Govt Lo</u></u>	<u>t</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>				
1			SWNE	8	21N	7W	LEWIS AND CLARK				

**Remarks:** 

THE WATER RIGHTS LISTED FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE MULTIPLE USES OF THE SAME RIGHT. THE USE OF THIS RIGHT FOR SEVERAL PURPOSES DOES NOT INCREASE THE EXTENT OF THE WATER RIGHT. RATHER IT DECREES THE RIGHT TO ALTERNATE AND EXCHANGE THE USE (PURPOSE) OF THE WATER IN ACCORD WITH HISTORICAL PRACTICES.

78765-00 78766-00

## SUN RIVER BASIN 41K

Water Right Number:	41K 78766-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM									
	Version: 3 POST DECREE									
		Status:	ACTIVE							
Owners:	USA (DEPT OF INTERIOR BUREAU OF LAND MGMT) 5001 SOUTHGATE DR BILLINGS, MT 59101-4669									
Priority Date:	JUNE 30, 1	JUNE 30, 1953								
Type of Historical Right:	USE	USE								
Purpose (Use):	STOCK									
Flow Rate:	A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED FOR THIS USE FROM THIS ONSTREAM RESERVOIR. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.									
Volume:	1.00 AC-FT									
Source Name:	UNNAMED	UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF WILLOW CREEK								
Source Type:	SURFACE WATER									
Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:										
<u>ID</u> 1	<u>Govt Lo</u>	_	<u>Qtr Sec</u> ESWNE	<u>Sec</u> 8	<u>Twp</u> 21N	<u>Rge</u> 7W	<u>County</u> LEWIS AND CLARK			
Period of Diversion:	JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31									
<b>Diversion Means:</b>	DAM	DAM								
<b>Reservoir:</b>	ONSTREAM									
	<u>Govt Lo</u>		<u>Qtr Sec</u> ESWNE	<u>Sec</u> 8	<u>Twp</u> 21N	<u>Rge</u> 7W	<u>County</u> LEWIS AND CLARK			
Diversion to Reservoir: DIVERSION # 1										
Period of Use:	JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31									
Place of Use:										
<u>ID</u> <u>Acr</u> 1	es <u>Govt Lo</u>	t	<u>Qtr Sec</u> SWNE	<u>Sec</u> 8	<u>Twp</u> 21N	<u>Rge</u> 7W	<u>County</u> LEWIS AND CLARK			

#### **Remarks:**

THE WATER RIGHTS LISTED FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE MULTIPLE USES OF THE SAME RIGHT. THE USE OF THIS RIGHT FOR SEVERAL PURPOSES DOES NOT INCREASE THE EXTENT OF THE WATER RIGHT. RATHER IT DECREES THE RIGHT TO ALTERNATE AND EXCHANGE THE USE (PURPOSE) OF THE WATER IN ACCORD WITH HISTORICAL PRACTICES.

78765-00 78766-00

## SUN RIVER BASIN 41K

Water Right Number:	41K 78767-00	STATEMENT O	F CLA	IM					
	Version: 4 POST DECREE								
	Sta	atus: ACTIVE							
Owners:	USA (DEPT OF INTERIOR BUREAU OF LAND MGMT) 5001 SOUTHGATE DR BILLINGS, MT 59101-4669								
Priority Date:	DECEMBER 31, 1955								
Type of Historical Right:	USE	USE							
Purpose (Use):	WILDLIFE								
*Flow Rate:	A SPECIFIC FL ONSTREAM RI		IOT BE	EEN DEC	CREED	FOR THIS USE FROM THIS			
*Volume:	16.80 AC-FT								
Source Name:	UNNAMED TR	IBUTARY OF WIL	LOW	CREEK					
Source Type:	SURFACE	WATER							
Point of Diversion and Mean	s of Diversion:								
ID	Govt Lot	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>			
1	NWSE 8 21N 7W LEWIS AND CLARK								
Period of Diversion:	JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31								
Diversion Means:	DAM								
Reservoir:	ONSTREAM		a	m					
	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u> NWSE	<u>Sec</u> 8	<u>Twp</u> 21N	<u>Rge</u> 7W	<u>County</u> LEWIS AND CLARK			
Diversion to Rese	rvoir: DIVERSIO		0	2111	7 • •	LEWIG AND GEARK			
Dam Height:	13.00 FEET								
Depth:	10.00 FEET								
Surface Area:	4.20 ACRES								
Capacity:	16.80 ACRE-FEET								
Period of Use:	JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31								
Place of Use:									
ID Acre	es <u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>			
1		W2SE	8	21N	7W	LEWIS AND CLARK			

#### **Remarks:**

THE WATER RIGHTS LISTED FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE MULTIPLE USES OF THE SAME RIGHT. THE USE OF THIS RIGHT FOR SEVERAL PURPOSES DOES NOT INCREASE THE EXTENT OF THE WATER RIGHT. RATHER IT DECREES THE RIGHT TO ALTERNATE AND EXCHANGE THE USE (PURPOSE) OF THE WATER IN ACCORD WITH HISTORICAL PRACTICES.

78767-00 78768-00

## SUN RIVER BASIN 41K

Water Right Number:	41K 78768	41K 78768-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM								
	Version:	Version: 3 POST DECREE								
		Status: A	ACTIVE							
Owners:	5001 SOUT	USA (DEPT OF INTERIOR BUREAU OF LAND MGMT) 5001 SOUTHGATE DR BILLINGS, MT 59101-4669								
Priority Date:	DECEMBEI	DECEMBER 31, 1955								
Type of Historical Right:	USE	USE								
Purpose (Use):	STOCK	STOCK								
Flow Rate:	ONSTREAM	A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED FOR THIS USE FROM THIS ONSTREAM RESERVOIR. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.								
Volume:	16.80 AC-F	16.80 AC-FT								
Source Name:	UNNAMED	UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF WILLOW CREEK								
Source Type:	SURF	SURFACE WATER								
Point of Diversion and Me	ans of Diversion:									
<u>ID</u> 1	Govt Lo	-	<u>tr Sec</u> IWSE	<u>Sec</u> 8	<u>Twp</u> 21N	<u>Rge</u> 7W	<u>County</u> LEWIS AND CLARK			
Period of Diversion:	JANUARY <sup>2</sup>	JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31								
<b>Diversion Means:</b>	DAM									
<b>Reservoir:</b>	ONSTREAM	1								
	<u>Govt Lo</u>		<u>tr Sec</u> IWSE	<u>Sec</u> 8	<u>Twp</u> 21N	<u>Rge</u> 7W	<u>County</u> LEWIS AND CLARK			
Diversion to Reservoir: DIVERSION # 1										
Period of Use:	JANUARY <sup>·</sup>	JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31								
Place of Use:										
<u>ID Ac</u> 1	<u>cres</u> <u>Govt Lo</u>		<u>tr Sec</u> V2SE	<u>Sec</u> 8	<u>Twp</u> 21N	<u>Rge</u> 7W	<u>County</u> LEWIS AND CLARK			

#### **Remarks:**

THE WATER RIGHTS LISTED FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE MULTIPLE USES OF THE SAME RIGHT. THE USE OF THIS RIGHT FOR SEVERAL PURPOSES DOES NOT INCREASE THE EXTENT OF THE WATER RIGHT. RATHER IT DECREES THE RIGHT TO ALTERNATE AND EXCHANGE THE USE (PURPOSE) OF THE WATER IN ACCORD WITH HISTORICAL PRACTICES.

78767-00 78768-00