Montana Water Court PO Box 1389 Bozeman, MT 59771-1389 1-800-624-3270 (406) 586-4364 watercourt@mt.gov FILED
06/26/2024
Sara Calkins
CLERK
Montana Water Court
STATE OF MONTANA
By: D'Ann CIGLER
41K-0674-R-2024
White, Eugene
3.00

IN THE WATER COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA
UPPER MISSOURI DIVISION
SUN RIVER BASIN (41K)
PRELIMINARY DECREE

\* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \*

CLAIMANT: Clifton Family Trust

CASE 41K-0674-R-2024 41K 104408-00

## NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER'S REPORT

This Master's Report was filed with the Montana Water Court on the above stamped date. Please review this report carefully.

You may file a written objection to this Master's Report within **10 days** of the stamped date if you disagree or find errors with the Master's findings of fact, conclusions of law, or recommendations. Rule 23, W.R.Adj.R. If the Master's Report was mailed to you, the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure allow an additional 3 days be added to the 10-day objection period. Rule 6(d), M.R.Civ.P. If you file an objection, you must serve a copy of the objection to all parties on the service list found at the end of the Master's Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the service list must be filed with the Water Court.

If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master's Report.

# **MASTER'S REPORT**

All water right claims that appeared in the Preliminary Decree for Sun River (Basin 41K) were subject to "issue remarks" resulting from pre-decree examination by the DNRC, objections, and counterobjections. Claim 41K 104408-00 received issue remarks during the DNRC's review of the claims.

The claim was consolidated into Case 41K-0674-R-2024 and an Order Setting Filing Deadline was issued by the Water Court requesting any additional information needed to resolve the issue remarks.

## FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. Claim 41K 104408-00 received the following substantive issue remark: THE CLAIMED FLOW RATE EXCEEDS THE 35 GPM GUIDELINE FOR THIS PURPOSE AND CANNOT BE CONFIRMED DUE TO LACK OF DATA.
- 2. On April 12, 2024, the Water Court issued an Order Setting Filing Deadline with the following language regarding the above-listed issue remark:

ORDERED that the Claimant review this order and, if necessary, file a statement describing why the flow rate should be modified for claim 41K 104408-00 by Wednesday, May 15, 2024. If nothing is filed by the deadline, the Water Master will conclude that the Claimant believes that the flow of claim 41K 104408-00 is already historically accurate, no modification will be made, and the issue remark will be removed from the claim.

- 3. On May 2, 2024, claimant Clifton Family Trust filed a *Response*. The *Response* states that the Claimant agrees that no modification is needed as the flow rate listed for claim 41K 140408-00 is already historically accurate.
- 4. Claim 41K 104408-00 also received a notice-type issue remark from the DNRC during its claims reexamination. No objections were filed.

## PRINCIPLES OF LAW

- 1. Section 85-2-248(2), MCA, requires that the Water Court resolve all issue remarks that are not resolved through the objection process. *See also* Rule 7, W.R.Adj.R.
- 2. A properly filed Statement of Claim for an existing water right is prima facie proof of its content. Section 85-2-227, MCA; Rule 10, W.R.Adj.R.
- 3. A preponderance of the evidence is evidence that shows a fact is "more probable than not." *Hohenlohe v. State*, 2010 MT 203, ¶ 33, 357 Mont. 438, 240 P.3d 628.

4. If prima facie status is overcome, the burden shifts back to the claimant to demonstrate historical use. *79 Ranch v. Pitsch*, 204 Mont. 426, 432-33, 666 P.2d 215, 218 (1983).

## CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. The information in the record resolves the issue remark appearing on claim 41K 104408-00. Based on the *Response* filed by the Claimants, and the fact that the DNRC did not provide sufficient information supporting the issue remark, the issue remark does not overcome the prima facie status afforded to the Statement of Claim for claim 41K 104408-00, the flow rate should remain as it appears on the abstract, and the issue remark should be removed from the claim.
- 2. The notice type issue remark appearing on claim 41K 104408-00 served its notice purpose and should be removed from the claim.

# **RECOMMENDATIONS**

Based on the foregoing Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, this Water Master recommends that the Court remove the issue remarks from claim 41K 104408-00.

A post decree abstract of the water right claim reflecting the removal of the issue remarks is attached to this Report.

**ELECTRONICALLY SIGNED AND DATED BELOW.** 

## Service Via Electronic Mail:

W. John Tietz
Hallee Frandsen
Browning Kaleczyc Berry & Hoven PC
PO Box 1697
Helena, MT 59624-1697
(406) 443-6820
john@bkbh.com
hallee@bkbh.com
megan@bkbh.com

# Service via USPS Mail:

Last Order: Clifton Family Trust 235 Sun River Rd Great Falls, MT 59404

**Note: Service List Updated 6-10-24** 

#### POST DECREE

## ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

### **SUN RIVER**

### **BASIN 41K**

**Water Right Number: 41K 104408-00** STATEMENT OF CLAIM

> Version: 3 -- POST DECREE

> > **Status: ACTIVE**

**Owners: CLIFTON FAMILY TRUST** 

235 SUN RIVER RD

GREAT FALLS, MT 59404-6321

**Priority Date: DECEMBER 31, 1902** 

USE Type of Historical Right:

**STOCK** Purpose (Use):

Flow Rate: 100.00 GPM

Volume: THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR

> STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND

HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.

SUN RIVER **Source Name:** 

**Source Type:** SURFACE WATER

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

ID **Govt Lot Otr Sec County** Sec **Twp** Rge

20N **CASCADE** 1 **NENENW** 8 3E

**Period of Diversion:** JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

**Diversion Means: PUMP** 

Period of Use: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

Place of Use:

<u>ID</u> **Govt Lot Otr Sec County** Acres <u>Sec</u> <u>Twp</u> Rge 1

**SENENW** 8 20N 3E **CASCADE** 

### Remarks:

THE WATER RIGHTS LISTED FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE MULTIPLE USES OF THE SAME RIGHT. THE USE OF THIS RIGHT FOR SEVERAL PURPOSES DOES NOT INCREASE THE EXTENT OF THE WATER RIGHT. RATHER IT DECREES THE RIGHT TO ALTERNATE AND EXCHANGE THE USE (PURPOSE) OF THE WATER IN ACCORD WITH HISTORICAL PRACTICES.

104405-00 104408-00