Montana Water Court PO Box 1389 Bozeman, MT 59771-1389 (406) 586-4364 1-800-624-3270 watercourt@mt.gov FILED
06/20/2024
Sara Calkins
CLERK
Montana Water Court
STATE OF MONTANA
By: Julie Cristiani
41E-0257-R-2024
Lambert, Kathryn
5.00

IN THE WATER COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA UPPER MISSOURI DIVISION BOULDER RIVER—TRIBUTARY OF THE JEFFERSON RIVER (BASIN 41E) PRELIMINARY DECREE

CLAIMANT: McCauley Family Ranch LLC

CASE 41E-0257-R-2024

41E 94144-00

41E 94159-00

41E 94167-00

41E 94172-00

NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER'S REPORT

This Master's Report was filed with the Montana Water Court on the above stamped date. Please review this report carefully.

You may file a written objection to this Master's Report within **10 days** of the stamped date if you disagree or find errors with the Master's findings of fact, conclusion of law, or recommendations. Rule 23, W.R.Adj.R. If the Master's Report was mailed to you, the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure allow an additional 3 days to be added to the 10-day objection period. Rule 6(d), M.R.Civ.P. If you file an objection, you must mail a copy of the objection to all parties on the service list found at the end of the Master's Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the service list must be filed with the Water Court.

If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master's Report.

MASTER'S REPORT

Claims 41E 94144-00 and 41E 94159-00 each appeared in the Preliminary Decree with the following issue remark:

THE POINT OF DIVERSION APPEARS TO BE INCORRECT. THE POINT OF DIVERSION APPEARS TO BE IN THE SWSWNW SEC 13 TWP 5N RGE 4W JEFFERSON COUNTY.

Claim 41E 94167-00 appeared in the Preliminary Decree with the following issue remark:

THE CLAIMED VOLUME APPEARS TO BE EXCESSIVE FOR THE CLAIMED PURPOSE. THE CLAIMED VOLUME EQUALS 19 TIMES THE CAPACITY OF THE RESERVOIR.

Claim 41E 94172-00 appeared in the Preliminary Decree with the following issue remark:

THE CLAIMED VOLUME APPEARS TO BE EXCESSIVE FOR THE CLAIMED PURPOSE. THE CLAIMED VOLUME EQUALS 106 TIMES THE CAPACITY OF THE RESERVOIR.

The issue remarks were not addressed through the objection process. The Water Court is required to resolve the issues raised by each issue remark. Section 85-2-248, MCA. Under Section 85-2-248(3), MCA, information in the claim file or other information obtained by the Court can be reviewed to determine if it provides a sufficient basis to resolve the issue raised by a remark and the Court can provide the claimant an opportunity to file additional information or evidence.

The January 12, 2024 Order Consolidating Case and Order Setting Deadlines Pursuant To Section 85-2-248(5), MCA set filing deadlines for the Montana Department of Natural Resources and Conservation ["DNRC"] and the claimant. On March 12, 2024 the DNRC Memorandum was filed making recommendations to resolve the issue remarks. On May 13, 2024 the claimant's response was filed stating agreement with the DNRC Memorandum. These documents are viewable in the Court's FullCourt Enterprise case management system.

APPLICABLE LAW

"All issue remarks to claims that are not resolved through the filing of an objection as provided in 85-2-233 must be resolved as provided in this section." Section 85-2-248(2), MCA.

A properly filed Statement of Claim for Existing Water Right is prima facie proof of its content pursuant to section 85-2-227, MCA. This prima facie proof may be contradicted and overcome by other evidence that proves, by a preponderance of the evidence, that the elements of the claim do not accurately reflect the beneficial use of the water right as it existed prior to July 1, 1973. This is the burden of proof for every assertion that a claim is incorrect including for claimants objecting to their own claims. Rule 19, W.R.Adj.R.

FINDINGS OF FACT

1. For claim 41E 94144-00, the Preliminary Decree states that the point of diversion legal description is the NWNWSW section 13, T5N, R4W, JEFFERSON. The legal description

should be the NENWSW section 13, T5N, R4W, JEFFERSON. The point of diversion issue remark should be removed as addressed and resolved.

The Preliminary Decree also includes the following notice remark:

DITCH NAME WAS MODIFIED AS A RESULT OF DNRC REVIEW UNDER MONTANA WATER COURT REEXAMINATION ORDERS. IF NO OBJECTIONS ARE FILED TO THIS CLAIM, THESE ELEMENTS WILL REMAIN AS THEY APPEAR ON THIS ABSTRACT AND THE REMARK WILL BE REMOVED FROM THE CLAIM.

The remark does not raise an unresolved issue which needs to be addressed. The remark should be removed as having served its notice purpose.

- 2. For claim 41E 94159-00, the Preliminary Decree states that the point of diversion legal description is the NWNWSW section 13, T5N, R4W, JEFFERSON. The legal description should be the NENWSW section 13, T5N, R4W, JEFFERSON. The point of diversion issue remark should be removed as addressed and resolved.
- 3. For claim 41E 94167-00, the Preliminary Decree includes the standard volume remark for livestock direct from source claims. The volume does not require quantification. The issue remark about the claimed volume should be removed as not relevant.

The Preliminary Decree also includes the following notice remarks:

THE CLAIMANT DID NOT IDENTIFY THE PERIOD OF DIVERSION FOR THIS RIGHT. A PERIOD OF DIVERSION HAS BEEN ADDED TO MATCH THE PERIOD OF USE. IF NO OBJECTIONS ARE RECEIVED TO THE PERIOD OF DIVERSION OR PERIOD OF USE, THOSE ELEMENTS WILL BE DECREED AS SHOWN ON THIS ABSTRACT AND THIS ISSUE REMARK WILL BE REMOVED FROM THIS CLAIM.

MEANS OF DIVERSION, PLACE OF USE, AND SOURCE NAME WERE MODIFIED AS A RESULT OF DNRC REVIEW UNDER MONTANA WATER COURT REEXAMINATION ORDERS. IF NO OBJECTIONS ARE FILED TO THIS CLAIM, THESE ELEMENTS WILL REMAIN AS THEY APPEAR ON THIS ABSTRACT AND THE REMARK WILL BE REMOVED FROM THE CLAIM.

The remarks do not raise unresolved issues which need to be addressed. The remarks should be removed as having served their notice purposes.

4. For claim 41E 94172-00, the Preliminary Decree includes the standard volume remark for a livestock onstream reservoir claim. The volume does not require quantification. The issue remark about the claimed volume should be removed as not relevant.

The Preliminary Decree also includes the following notice remarks:

THE CLAIMANT DID NOT IDENTIFY THE PERIOD OF DIVERSION FOR THIS RIGHT. A PERIOD OF DIVERSION HAS BEEN ADDED TO MATCH THE PERIOD OF USE. IF NO OBJECTIONS ARE RECEIVED TO THE PERIOD OF DIVERSION OR PERIOD OF USE, THOSE ELEMENTS WILL BE DECREED AS SHOWN ON THIS ABSTRACT AND THIS ISSUE REMARK WILL BE REMOVED FROM THIS CLAIM.

SOURCE NAME AND PLACE OF USE WERE MODIFIED AS A RESULT OF DNRC REVIEW UNDER MONTANA WATER COURT REEXAMINATION ORDERS. IF NO OBJECTIONS ARE FILED TO THIS CLAIM, THESE ELEMENTS WILL REMAIN AS THEY APPEAR ON THIS ABSTRACT AND THE REMARK WILL BE REMOVED FROM THE CLAIM.

The remarks do not raise unresolved issues which need to be addressed. The remarks should be removed as having served their notice purposes.

CONCLUSION OF LAW

The information provided by the DNRC and the claimant is sufficient to resolve the issue remarks without evidentiary hearing. Sections 85-2-248(3) and (11), MCA.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Based upon the above Findings of Fact and Conclusion of Law, this Master recommends that the Court grant the Motion and make the changes specified in the Findings of Fact to correct the Preliminary Decree for this Basin. A Post Decree Abstract of Water Right Claim for each claim is served with this Report to confirm the recommended changes have been made in the state's centralized record system.

ELECTRONICALLY SIGNED AND DATED BELOW

Service via USPS Mail:

McCauley Family Ranch LLC PO Box 25 Boulder, MT 59632

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

BOULDER RIVER, TRIBUTARY TO JEFFERSON RIVER

BASIN 41E

Water Right Number: 41E 94144-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

Version: 4 -- POST DECREE

Status: ACTIVE

Owners: MCCAULEY FAMILY RANCH LLC

PO BOX 25

BOULDER, MT 59632-0025

Priority Date: SEPTEMBER 11, 1891

Type of Historical Right: FILED

Purpose (Use): IRRIGATION

Irrigation Type: FLOOD

*Flow Rate: 2.00 CFS

***Volume:** 354.92 AC-FT

THE WATER COURT HAS DETERMINED THAT A VOLUME QUANTIFICATION IS

REQUIRED TO ADEQUATELY ADMINISTER THIS RIGHT.

Climatic Area: 4 - MODERATELY LOW

*Maximum Acres: 37.95

*Source Name: BOULDER RIVER

Source Type: SURFACE WATER

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

<u>ID</u> <u>Govt Lot</u> <u>Qtr Sec</u> <u>Sec</u> <u>Twp</u> <u>Rge</u> <u>County</u> 1 NENWSW 13 5N 4W JEFFERSON

Period of Diversion: MAY 1 TO OCTOBER 1

Diversion Means: HEADGATE

Ditch Name: MCCAULEY-MURPHY DITCH

Period of Use: MAY 1 TO OCTOBER 1

*Place of Use:

<u>ID</u>		<u>Acres</u>	Govt Lot	Qtr Sec	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	County
1		5.10		SESW	13	5N	4W	JEFFERSON
2		27.85		SWSE	13	5N	4W	JEFFERSON
3		5.00		SESE	13	5N	4W	JEFFERSON
	Total·	37.05						

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

BOULDER RIVER, TRIBUTARY TO JEFFERSON RIVER

BASIN 41E

Water Right Number: 41E 94159-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

> Version: 3 -- POST DECREE

> > **Status: ACTIVE**

Owners: MCCAULEY FAMILY RANCH LLC

PO BOX 25

BOULDER, MT 59632-0025

Priority Date: SEPTEMBER 11, 1891

USE Type of Historical Right:

STOCK Purpose (Use):

*Flow Rate: A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED BECAUSE THIS USE CONSISTS

> OF STOCK DRINKING DIRECTLY FROM THE SOURCE, OR FROM A DITCH SYSTEM. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY

TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.

*Volume: THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR

> STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND

HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.

BOULDER RIVER *Source Name:

SURFACE WATER **Source Type:**

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

ID Rge **Govt Lot Qtr Sec Twp County** Sec 1

NENWSW 13 5N 4W **JEFFERSON**

*Period of Diversion: MAY 1 TO DECEMBER 1

Diversion Means: DITCH

Ditch Name: MCCAULEY-MURPHY DITCH

*Period of Use: MAY 1 TO DECEMBER 1

Place of Use:

<u>ID</u>	<u>Acres</u>	Govt Lot	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1			SESW	13	5N	4W	JEFFERSON
2			SWSE	13	5N	4W	JEFFERSON

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

BOULDER RIVER, TRIBUTARY TO JEFFERSON RIVER

BASIN 41E

Water Right Number: 41E 94167-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

Version: 3 -- POST DECREE

Status: ACTIVE

Owners: MCCAULEY FAMILY RANCH LLC

PO BOX 25

BOULDER, MT 59632-0025

Priority Date: APRIL 1, 1900

Type of Historical Right: FILED

Purpose (Use): STOCK

Flow Rate: A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED BECAUSE THIS USE CONSISTS

OF STOCK DRINKING DIRECTLY FROM THE SOURCE, OR FROM A DITCH SYSTEM. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY

TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.

*Volume: THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR

STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND

HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.

*Source Name: UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF BOULDER RIVER

Source Type: GROUNDWATER

ALSO KNOWN AS SPRING CREEK 1

*Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

<u>ID</u>	Govt Lot	Qtr Sec	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	County
1		N2SWNE	6	4N	2W	JEFFERSON
Period of Diversion:	JANUARY 1 TO I	DECEMBER 31				
Diversion Means:	LIVESTOCK DIR	ECT FROM SO	URCE			
2	2		6	4N	2W	JEFFERSON
Period of Diversion:	JANUARY 1 TO I	DECEMBER 31				
Diversion Means:	LIVESTOCK DIR	ECT FROM SO	URCE			
3		SESE	31	5N	2W	JEFFERSON
*Period of Diversion:	JANUARY 1 TO I	DECEMBER 31				
Diversion Means:	DAM					
Reservoir:	ONSTREAM					

Govt Lot Qtr Sec Sec Twp Rge County
SESE 31 5N 2W JEFFERSON

Diversion to Reservoir: DIVERSION #3

Depth: 15.00 FEET Surface Area: 4.00 ACRES

Capacity: 24.00 ACRE-FEET

Period of Use: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

*Place of Use:

$\underline{\mathbf{ID}}$	<u>Acres</u>	Govt Lot	Qtr Sec	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	County
1			N2SWNE	6	4N	2W	JEFFERSON
2		2		6	4N	2W	JEFFERSON
3			SESE	31	5N	2W	JEFFERSON

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

BOULDER RIVER, TRIBUTARY TO JEFFERSON RIVER

BASIN 41E

Water Right Number: 41E 94172-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

Version: 3 -- POST DECREE

Status: ACTIVE

Owners: MCCAULEY FAMILY RANCH LLC

PO BOX 25

BOULDER, MT 59632-0025

Priority Date: DECEMBER 31, 1900

Type of Historical Right: FILED

Purpose (Use): STOCK

Flow Rate: A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED FOR THIS USE FROM THIS

ONSTREAM RESERVOIR.

*Volume: THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR

STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND

HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.

*Source Name: UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF BOULDER RIVER

Source Type: GROUNDWATER

ALSO KNOWN AS SPRING CREEK 2

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

<u>ID</u> <u>Govt Lot</u> <u>Qtr Sec</u> <u>Sec</u> <u>Twp</u> <u>Rge</u> <u>County</u> 1 SENWSE 6 4N 2W JEFFERSON

*Period of Diversion: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

Diversion Means: LIVESTOCK DIRECT FROM SOURCE

2 NESWSE 6 4N 2W JEFFERSON

*Period of Diversion: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

Diversion Means: DAM

Reservoir: ONSTREAM

Govt Lot Qtr Sec Sec Twp Rge County

NESWSE 6 4N 2W JEFFERSON

Diversion to Reservoir: DIVERSION # 2

Depth: 10.00 FEET

Surface Area: 0.65 ACRES

Capacity: 2.60 ACRE-FEET

Period of Use: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

*Place of Use:

<u>ID</u>	<u>Acres</u>	Govt Lot	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1			SENWSE	6	4N	2W	JEFFERSON
2			NESESE	6	4N	2W	JEFFERSON

Remarks:

APPLICATION FOR CHANGE RECEIVED 04/27/1989 FOR CHANGE IN POINT OF DIVERSION AND PLACE OF USE. SEE 41E 94168-00.