FILEED 12/06/2024 Sara Calkins CLERK Montana Water Court STATE OF MONTANA By: D'Ann CIGLER 41S-1037-R-2024 Stern, Anika 3.00

Montana Water Court PO Box 1389 Bozeman, MT 59771-1389 1-800-624-3270 (406) 586-4364 watercourt@mt.gov

IN THE WATER COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA LOWER MISSOURI DIVISION JUDITH RIVER BASIN (41S) PRELIMINARY DECREE

CLAIMANTS: Jennilou E. Isackson; Ron Isackson

CASE 41S-1037-R-2024 41S 152150-00 41S 152151-00

NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER'S REPORT

This Master's Report was filed with the Montana Water Court on the above-stamped date. <u>Please review this report carefully.</u>

You may file a written objection to this Master's Report within **10 days** of the stamped date if you disagree or find errors with the Master's findings of fact, conclusions of law, or recommendations. Rule 23, W.R.Adj.R. If the Master's Report was mailed to you, the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure allow an additional 3 days be added to the 10-day objection period. Rule 6(d), M.R.Civ.P. If you file an objection, you must serve a copy of the objection to all parties on the service list found at the end of the Master's Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the service list must be filed with the Water Court.

If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master's Report.

MASTER'S REPORT

FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Jennilou E. Isackson and Ron E. Isackson are the record owners of claims

41S 152150-00 and 41S 152151-00.

2. Claims 41S 152150-00 and 41S 152151-00 were decreed with DNRC issue

remarks:

418 152150-00:

- THE WATER COURT FINDS NO LEGAL BASIS FOR THIS PURPOSE TO BE CONSIDERED A BENEFICIAL USE OR AN APPROPRIATION OF WATER.
- THE CLAIMED FLOW RATE WAS NOT EXAMINED AS NO FLOW RATE GUIDELINES FOR THIS PURPOSE HAVE BEEN ESTABLISHED BY THE CLAIM EXAMINATION RULES.
- THE FLOW RATE IS MISSING.
- THE CLAIMED VOLUME WAS NOT EXAMINED AS NO VOLUME GUIDELINES FOR THIS PURPOSE HAVE BEEN ESTABLISHED BY THE CLAIMS EXAMINATION RULES.

418 152151-00:

- THE CLAIMED POINT OF DIVERSION IS IN QUESTION. THE LOCATION OF THE PUMP CANNOT BE IDENTIFIED FROM AVAILABLE DATA.
- 3. 41S 152150-00: The first-listed issue remark decreed on claim 41S 152150-

00 points to the April 30, 1982 Statement of Claim. Then-Claimants Jenro Ranch Co.,

Inc. and Edna F. Halley filed claim 41S 152150-00 for "aesthetic" purposes:

3.	Use:	(Check O					
	FR 🗌	Fish Raceways	GE 🗌	Geothermal	MN 🗆	Mining	
	FW 🗌	Fish & Wildlife	NV	Navigation	PG 🗌	Power Generation	
,	см 🗌	Commercial	FP 🗌	Fire Protection	RC 🗌	Recreation	5
	IN 🗌	Industrial	AS 🗌	Agricultural Spraying	от 🛛		
	мс	Municipal	OF 🗋	Oil Well Flooding	Expl	ain AFSTHETIC	_

As noted in the DNRC issue remark, "aesthetic" is not considered a beneficial use in Montana.

4. **Claim 41S 152151-00:** No information was provided by DNRC to

substantiate the addition of the point of diversion issue remark to claim 41S 152151-00.

5. An Order was issued, providing Claimants Jennilou E. Isackson and Ron E. Isackson the opportunity to show why "aesthetic" should be considered a beneficial use for claim 41S 152150-00. The Order indicated that if nothing were filed by the December 2, 2024 filing deadline, this Waer Master would conclude that Jennilou E. Isackson and Ron E. Isackson agree that "aesthetic" is not a beneficial use of water and a Master's

Report should be issued recommending dismissal of claim 41S 152150-00. The Order included the following language:

Failure to comply with the terms of this Order may result in sanctions, <u>up to and</u> including entry of default and termination of a water right claim or dismissal of <u>objections</u>. Rule 22, W.R.Adj.R.

6. On December 5, 2024, the Isacksons filed a document indicating agreement with the proposed dismissal of claim 41S 152150-00. Additionally, the Isacksons stated the following regarding claim 41S 152151-00:

Claim 418 152151-00: Telbed but DRNC in Lowinton -Claim 418 152151-00: Telbed but DRNC is and the paint of dwaron Claim 418 152151-00 was decread with the following DNRC issue remark: • THE CLAIMED POINT OF DIVERSION IS IN QUESTION. THE LOCATION OF THE PUMP CANNOT BE IDENTIFIED FROM AVAILABLE DATA. * GON 10t 2 Sec 31 TISN RIGE

The claimed and decreed point of diversion for claim 41S 152151-00 is: 7. Place of Use: Otr Sec ID Acres Govt Lot Twp Rge County Sec NW 31 15N 19E FERGUS 1

The location described in the December 5, 2024 filing is within the point of diversion legal land description.

PRINCIPLES AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Water Court is required to address all issue remarks decreed on a claim as well as any objections the claim receives. Sections 85-2-233, 85-2-247, and 85-2-248, MCA.

2. A properly filed Statement of Claim for an existing water right is prima facie proof of its content. Section 85-2-227, MCA. This prima facie validity may be overcome by evidence showing that one or more elements of the claim are incorrect. This standard of proof applies to objectors or claimants objecting to their own water right claims. Rule 19, W.R.Adj.R., *Nelson v. Brooks*, 2014 MT 120; 375 Mont.86, 95; 329 P.3d 558, 564.

Regarding claim 41S 152151-00, the DNRC point of diversion issue remark alone does not overcome the prima facie Statement of Claim.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Claims 41S 152150-00 should be dismissed as "aesthetic" is not a beneficial use.

2. The issue remarks should be removed from claim 41S 152151-00. Abstracts are attached for review.

ELECTRONICALLY SIGNED AND DATED BELOW.

Service Via Electronic Mail:

Jennilou E. Isackson Ron Isackson 4080 Upper Spring Creek Rd Lewistown, MT 59457-8701

\JUDHLNSRV-DATA\Share\JUDGALH2OSRV (Datavol)\Share\WC-BASIN FOLDERS\\41S PD\Cases\1037\41S-1037-R-2024 MR 12.3.24 rc.docx

POST DECREE ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM JUDITH RIVER

BASIN 41S

Water Right Number:	41S 152150-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM						
	Version: 3 POST DECREE						
	Status: DISMISSED						
Owners:	JENNILOU E ISACKSON 4080 UPPER SPRING CREEK RD LEWISTOWN, MT 59457-8701						
	RON ISACKSON 4080 UPPER SPRING CREEK RD LEWISTOWN, MT 59457-8701						
Priority Date:							
Type of Historical Right:							
Purpose (Use):	UNKNOWN						
Purpose (Use):	UNKNOWN						
Flow Rate:							
Volume:							
Source Name:	BIG SPRING CREEK						
Source Type:	SURFACE WATER						
Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:							
Period of Use:							
Place of Use:							

Remarks:

THIS CLAIM WAS DISMISSED BY ORDER OF THE WATER COURT.

POST DECREE ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

JUDITH RIVER

BASIN 41S

Water Right Number:	41S 15215 Version:		ATEMENT (T DECREE	OF CL/	AIM			
		Status:	ACTIVE					
Owners: JENNILOU E ISACKSON 4080 UPPER SPRING CREEK RD LEWISTOWN, MT 59457-8701								
	RON ISACKSON 4080 UPPER SPRING CREEK RD LEWISTOWN, MT 59457-8701							
Priority Date:	APRIL 25, 1953							
Type of Historical Right:	USE							
Purpose (Use):FIRE PROTECTION								
Flow Rate:	100.00 GPM							
*Volume: THE VOLUME OF THIS WATER RIGHT IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOU NECESSARY FOR FIRE PROTECTION PURPOSES.							THE MINIMUM AMOUNTS	
Source Name:	BIG SPRING CREEK							
Source Type:	SURFACE WATER							
Point of Diversion and Means	Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:							
<u>ID</u> 1	Govt Lot		<u>Qtr Sec</u> NW	<u>Sec</u> 31	<u>Тwp</u> 15N	<u>Rge</u> 19E	<u>County</u> FERGUS	
Period of Diversion:	JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31							
Diversion Means:	PUMP							
Period of Use:	Use: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31							
Place of Use:								
ID Acres	Govt Lot	<u>.</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u> NW	<u>Sec</u> 31	<u>Twp</u> 15N	<u>Rge</u> 19E	<u>County</u> FERGUS	