FILE ED 10/30/2023 Sara Calkins CLERK Montana Water Court STATE OF MONTANA By: <u>D'Ann CIGLER</u> 43BV-0352-R-2023 Stern, Anika 6.00

IN THE WATER COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA YELLOWSTONE DIVISION SWEET GRASS - BASIN (43BV)

CLAIMANT: J Bar L Ranches, LLC

OBJECTOR: J Bar L Ranches, LLC

CASE 43BV-0352-R-2023

43BV 127347-00 43BV 127350-00 43BV 127351-00 43BV 127352-00 43BV 211802-00 43BV 211803-00 43BV 211804-00 43BV 211805-00

NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER'S REPORT

This Master's Report was filed with the Montana Water Court on the above-stamped date. <u>Please review this report carefully.</u>

You may file a written objection to this Master's Report within **10 days** of the stamped date if you disagree or find errors with the Master's findings of fact, conclusions of law, or recommendations. Rule 23, W.R.Adj.R. If the Master's Report was mailed to you, the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure allow an additional 3 days be added to the 10-day objection period. Rule 6(d), M.R.Civ.P. If you file an objection, you must serve a copy of the objection to all parties on the service list found at the end of the Master's Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the service list must be filed with the Water Court.

If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master's Report.

MASTER'S REPORT

FINDINGS OF FACT

1. J Bar L Ranches, LLC (J Bar L) is the record owner of claims 43BV

127347-00, 43BV 127350-00, 43BV 127351-00, 43BV 127352-00, 43BV 211802-00,

43BV 211803-00, 43BV 211804-00, and 43BV 211805-00.

2. Issue remarks were decreed on claims 43BV 127347-00, 43BV 127350-00,

43BV 127351-00, 43BV 127352-00, and 43BV 211802-00:

Claims 43BV 127347-00, 43BV 127350-00, 43BV 127351-00, and 43BV 127352-00:

POINT OF DIVERSION NO. 1 APPEARS TO BE LOCATED IN THE NWSWSW SEC 27, T4N, R15E, SWEET GRASS COUNTY.

ALTHOUGH NOT OBJECTED TO, THE ACRES IRRIGATED HAS BEEN REDUCED TO REFLECT THE CHANGE IN PLACE OF USE. THIS MAY BE HEARD AT THE PRELIMINARY DECREE STAGE.

Claim 43BV 211802-00:

THE CLAIMED FLOW RATE EXCEEDS THE 17 GPM PER ACRE GUIDELINE AND CANNOT BE CONFIRMED DUE TO LACK OF DATA. THE FLOW RATE EQUALS 20.00 GPM PER ACRE.

3. J Bar L objected to claims 43BV 127347-00, 43BV 127350-00, 43BV

127351-00, and 43BV 127352-00.

4. A deadline was set to determine if J Bar L agreed point of diversion No. 1 on claims 43BV 127347-00, 43BV 127350-00, 43BV 127351-00, and 43BV 127352-00 should be modified, resolving the point of diversion issue remark, as follows:

*Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:							
ID	Govt Lot	Qtr Sec	Sec	Twp	Rge	County	
1	NWSWSW	NWSESW	27	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS	
Period of Diversion:	APRIL 15 TO OCT	OBER 15					
Diversion Means:	HEADGATE						
Ditch Name:	LOWERY DITCH						
2		SWNWNE	34	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS	
Period of Diversion:	APRIL 15 TO OCT	OBER 15					
Diversion Means:	HEADGATE						
Ditch Name:	ADAM INTAKE CA	NAL					

The Order Setting Filing Deadline also set a deadline for J Bar L to address its Objections. (Doc.¹ 1.00).

¹ "Doc." numerical references correlate to case file docket numbers in the Water Court's Full Court case management system.

On October 17, 2023, J Bar L filed its Statement and Response to Order
Consolidating Case and Order Setting Filing Deadline and Request for Relief. (Doc. 4.00).

6. In its October 17, 2023 Response, J Bar L confirmed it agrees the point of diversion for claims 43BV 127347-00, 43BV 127350-00, 43BV 127351-00, and 43BV 127352-00 should be modified as shown in Finding of Fact No. 4.²

7. During adjudication of the Temporary Preliminary Decree in Basin 43BV, a Master's Report was issued in Case 43BV-26, implying claims 43BV 211802-00, 43BV 211803-00, 43BV 211804-00, and 43BV 211805-00 from parent claims 43BV 127347-00, 43BV 127350-00, 43BV 127351-00, and 43BV 127352-00, based on *Mont. Dep't of State Lands v. Pettibone*, 216 Mont. 361, 702 P.2d 948 (1985). On June 22, 1988, when the Master's Report was issued in Case 43BV-26, the record owner of claims 43BV 127347-00, 43BV 127350-00, 43BV 127351-00, and 43BV 127352-00 was Norman K. Starr and Divide Ranch Inc. and the record owner of claims 43BV 211802-00, 43BV 211803-00, 43BV 211804-00, and 43BV 211805-00 was the Montana State Board of Land Commissioners.

8. J Bar L is the present record owner of claims 43BV 127347-00, 43BV 127350-00, 43BV 127351-00, 43BV 127352-00, 43BV 211802-00, 43BV 211803-00, 43BV 211804-00, and 43BV 211805-00. The October 17, 2023 Response requests parent claims 43BV 127347-00, 43BV 127350-00, 43BV 127351-00, and 43BV 127352-00 be re-combined with child claims 43BV 211802-00, 43BV 211803-00, 43BV 211804-00, and 43BV 211805-00, restoring the originally claimed place of use, flow rate, and point of diversion. Furthermore, J Bar L requests child claims 43BV 211802-00, 43BV 211803-00, 43BV 211804-00, and 43BV 211805-00 be dismissed.

9. In addition to point of diversion No. 1 (Lowery Ditch) being modified as described in Finding of Fact No. 4, for claims 43BV 127347-00, 43BV 127350-00, 43BV

² Pages 4 through 8 of the October 17, 2023 Response show proposed changes to claims 43BV 127347-00, 43BV 127350-00, 43BV 127351-00, and 43BV 127352-00 and show the point of diversion for Lowery Ditch as the NWNWSW of Section 27, this appears to be a typographical error.

127351-00, and 43BV 127352-00, another point of diversion should be added to the claims in the NWSESW of Section 36, Township 4 North, Range 15 East, Sweet Grass County, for Crum Ditch. Additionally, the places of use for claims 43BV 127347-00, 43BV 127350-00, 43BV 127351-00, and 43BV 127352-00 should be increased from 367.00 acres to 371.00 acres, reflecting an additional 4.00 acre place of use in the E2SWSE of Section 36, Township 4 North, Range 15 East, Sweet Grass County. Finally, the flow rates for claims 43BV 127347-00, 43BV 127350-00, 43BV 127351-00, and 43BV 127350-00, 43BV 127351-00, and

43BV 127347-00: Flow Rate:	16.70 CFS 16.88 CFS
43BV 127350-00:	7.42 CES 7.50 CFS
43BV 127351-00:	
Flow Rate: 43BV 127352-00:	7.42-CFS 7.50 CFS
Flow Rate:	2.47 CFS 2.50 CFS

PRINCIPLES AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Water Court is required to address all issue remarks decreed on claims as well as any objections filed. Sections 85-2-233, 85-2-247, and 85-2-248, MCA.

2. A properly filed Statement of Claim for an existing water right is prima facie proof of its content. Section 85-2-227, MCA. This prima facie validity may be overcome by evidence showing that one or more elements of the claim are incorrect. This standard of proof applies to objectors or claimants objecting to their own water right claims. Rule 19, W.R.Adj.R., *Nelson v. Brooks*, 2014 MT 120; 375 Mont.86, 95; 329 P.3d 558, 564.

3. Claims 43BV 211802-00, 43BV 211803-00, 43BV 211804-00, and 43BV 211805-00 were created as implied claims when the parent claims were split. *See* Master's Report, Case 43BV-26 (June 22, 1988), adopted Aug. 3, 1988 (copy in claim files). Now, there is unity of title and J Bar L seeks to re-combine the claims, requiring modifications to the parent claims and dismissal of the implied claims. J Bar L's proposal will not negatively affect other water users because the modifications do not add more

4

irrigated acres, more flow rate, or an additional point of diversion – they are merely recombined as originally claimed.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. In addition to point of diversion No. 1 (Lowery Ditch) being modified as described in Finding of Fact No. 4, another point of diversion should be added to claims 43BV 127347-00, 43BV 127350-00, 43BV 127351-00, and 43BV 127352-00, in the NWSESW of Section 36, Township 4 North, Range 15 East, Sweet Grass County, for Crum Ditch. Additionally, the places of use for claims 43BV 127347-00, 43BV 127350-00, 43BV 127352-00 should be increased from 367.00 acres to 371.00 acres with an additional 4.00 acre place of use in the E2SWSE of Section 36, Township 4 North, Range 15 East, Sweet Grass County. Finally, the flow rates for claims 43BV 127347-00, 43BV 127350-00, 43BV 127351-00, and 43BV 127351-00, and 43BV 127351-00, and 43BV 127350-00, 43BV 127351-00, and 43BV 127352-00 should be increased from 367.00 acres to 371.00 acres with an additional 4.00 acre place of use in the E2SWSE of Section 36, Township 4 North, Range 15 East, Sweet Grass County. Finally, the flow rates for claims 43BV 127347-00, 43BV 127350-00, 43BV 127351-00, and 43BV 127352-00 should be increased, as follows:

43BV 127347-00: Flow Rate:	16.70 CFS 16.88 CFS
43BV 127350-00:	
Flow Rate:	7.42 CFS 7.50 CFS
43BV 127351-00: Flow Rate:	7.42 CES 7.50 CFS
43BV 127352-00:	1.12 010
Flow Rate:	2.47 CFS 2.50 CFS

2. Claims 43BV 211802-00, 43BV 211803-00, 43BV 211804-00, and 43BV 211805-00 should be dismissed.

3. The issue remarks should be removed from claims for claims 43BV 127347-00, 43BV 127350-00, 43BV 127351-00, and 43BV 127352-00,

Post Decree Abstracts of Water Right Claims are served with the Report for review.

ELECTRONICALLY SIGNED AND DATED BELOW.

Service Via Electronic Mail:

Michael J.L. Cusick, Esq. Cusick, Farve, Mattick & Refling, P.C. P.O. Box 1288 Bozeman, MT 59771-1288 (406) 587-5511 (406) 587-9079 fax office@cmrlawmt.com

\JUDHLNSRV-DATA\Share\JUDGALH2OSRV (Datavol)\Share\WC-BASIN FOLDERS\43BV PD\Cases\43BV-R352\43BV-0352-R-2023 MR 10.24.23 rc.docx

POST DECREE

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

SWEET GRASS CREEK

BASIN 43BV

Water Right Number:	43BV 127347-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM						
	Version: 3 POST DECREE						
	Status: ACTIVE						
Owners:	J BAR L RANCHES LLC PO BOX 11925 BOZEMAN, MT 59719 1925						
Priority Date:	MAY 28, 1902						
Type of Historical Right:	DECREED						
Purpose (use):	IRRIGATION						
Irrigation Type:	FLOOD						
*Flow Rate:	16.88 CFS						
*Volume:	1,454.16 AC-FT						
Climatic Area:	2 - MODERATELY HIGH						
*Maximum Acres:	371.00						
*Source Name:	SWEET GRASS CREEK						
Source Type:	SURFACE WATER						
*Point of Diversion and Means	of Diversion:						
<u>ID</u> 1	Govt LotQtr SecSecTwpRgeCountyNWSWSW274N15ESWEET GRASS						
Period of Diversion:	APRIL 15 TO OCTOBER 15						
Diversion Means:	HEADGATE						
Ditch Name:	LOWERY DITCH						
2	SWNWNE 34 4N 15E SWEET GRASS						
Period of Diversion:	APRIL 15 TO OCTOBER 15						
Diversion Means:	HEADGATE						
Ditch Name:	ADAM INTAKE CANAL						

Ditch Name:	ADAM INTAKE CANAL
3	NWSESW
Period of Diversion:	APRIL 15 TO OCTOBER 15
Diversion Means:	HEADGATE
Ditch Name:	CRUM DITCH

Period of Use: APRIL 15 TO OCTOBER 15

*Place of Use:

ID	<u>Acres</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1	17.00		S2SE	27	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS
2	22.00		N2NE	34	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS
3	142.00		N2	35	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS
4	44.00		SE	35	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS

36

4N

15E SWEET GRASS

5		31.00	SW	36	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS
6		24.00	NW	1	3N	15E	SWEET GRASS
7		70.00	NE	1	3N	15E	SWEET GRASS
8		17.00	SW	1	ЗN	15E	SWEET GRASS
9		4.00	E2SWSE	36	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS
	Total:	371.00					

127346-00	127347-00	127348-00	127349-00	127350-00	127351-00
127352-00	127362-00				

POST DECREE

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

SWEET GRASS CREEK

BASIN 43BV

Water Right Number:	43BV 127350	-00 STATEMEN	IT OF C	LAIM					
	Version: 3	POST DECRE	Ξ						
	S	tatus: ACTIVE							
Owners:	PO BOX 1192	J BAR L RANCHES LLC PO BOX 11925 BOZEMAN, MT 59719 1925							
Priority Date:	SEPTEMBER	1, 1904							
Type of Historical Right	: DECREED								
Purpose (use):	IRRIGATION								
Irrigation Type:	FLOOD								
*Flow Rate:	7.50 CFS								
*Volume:	1,454.16 AC-F	-T							
Climatic Area:	2 - MODERAT	ELY HIGH							
*Maximum Acres:	371.00	371.00							
Source Name:	SWEET GRAS	SWEET GRASS CREEK							
Source Type:	SURFAC	SURFACE WATER							
Point of Diversion and N	leans of Diversion:								
ID	Govt Lot	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>			
1		NWSWSW	27	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS			
Period of Diversion:	APRIL 15 TO	OCTOBER 15							
Diversion Means:	HEADGATE								
Ditch Name:	LOWERY DIT	СН							
2		SWNWNE	34	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS			
Period of Diversion:	APRIL 15 TO	OCTOBER 15							
Diversion Means:	HEADGATE								
Ditch Name:	ADAM INTAK	E CANAL							
3		NWSESW	36	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS			
Period of Diversion:	APRIL 15 TO	OCTOBER 15							
Diversion Means:	HEADGATE								
Ditch Name:	CRUM DITCH	l							
Period of Use:	APRIL 15 TO	OCTOBER 15							
*Place of Use:									
ID									

<u>ID</u>	Acres	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	Sec	Twp	<u>Kge</u>	<u>County</u>
1	17.00		S2SE	27	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS
2	22.00		N2NE	34	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS
3	142.00		N2	35	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS
4	44.00		SE	35	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS

5		31.00	SW	36	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS
6		24.00	NW	1	3N	15E	SWEET GRASS
7		70.00	NE	1	3N	15E	SWEET GRASS
8		17.00	SW	1	ЗN	15E	SWEET GRASS
9		4.00	E2SWSE	36	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS
	Total:	371.00					

127346-00	127347-00	127348-00	127349-00	127350-00	127351-00
127352-00	127362-00				

SWEET GRASS

POST DECREE

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

SWEET GRASS CREEK

BASIN 43BV

Water Right Number:	43BV 127351-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM							
	Version:	3 PO	ST DECRE	E				
		Status:	ACTIVE					
Owners:	J BAR L RANCHES LLC PO BOX 11925 BOZEMAN, MT 59719 1925							
Priority Date:	SEPTEMBE	R 1, 190	04					
Type of Historical Right:	DECREED							
Purpose (use):	IRRIGATIO	N						
Irrigation Type:	FLOOD							
*Flow Rate:	7.50 CFS	7.50 CFS						
*Volume:	1,454.16 AC-FT							
Climatic Area:	2 - MODERATELY HIGH							
*Maximum Acres:	371.00							
*Source Name:	SWEET GR	ASS CR	REEK					
Source Type:	SURFA	CE WA	TER					
*Point of Diversion and Means	of Diversion:							
<u>ID</u> 1	<u>Govt Lot</u>		<u>Qtr Sec</u> IWSWSW	<u>Sec</u> 27	<u>Twp</u> 4N	<u>Rge</u> 15E	<u>County</u> SWEET GRASS	
Period of Diversion:	APRIL 15 TO OCTOBER 15							
Diversion Means:	HEADGATE							
Ditch Name:	LOWERY D	ITCH						
2			SWNWNE	34	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS	
Period of Diversion:	APRIL 15 T	о осто	DBER 15					
Diversion Means:	HEADGATE							

3 Period of Diversion:

Diversion Means:

Ditch Name:

Ditch Name: CRUM DITCH

Period of Use: APRIL 15 TO OCTOBER 15

ADAM INTAKE CANAL

HEADGATE

APRIL 15 TO OCTOBER 15

*Place of Use:

<u>ID</u>	Acres	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1	17.00		S2SE	27	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS
2	22.00		N2NE	34	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS
3	142.00		N2	35	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS
4	44.00		SE	35	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS

NWSESW

36

4N

15E

5		31.00	SW	36	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS
6		24.00	NW	1	3N	15E	SWEET GRASS
7		70.00	NE	1	3N	15E	SWEET GRASS
8		17.00	SW	1	ЗN	15E	SWEET GRASS
9		4.00	E2SWSE	36	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS
	Total:	371.00					

127346-00	127347-00	127348-00	127349-00	127350-00	127351-00
127352-00	127362-00				

POST DECREE

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

SWEET GRASS CREEK

BASIN 43BV

Water Right Number:	43BV 12735	2-00 STAT	EMENT	OF CI	_AIM			
	Version:	3 POST D	ECREE					
		Status: A	CTIVE					
Owners:	J BAR L RAN PO BOX 119 BOZEMAN, N	25	25					
Priority Date:	MAY 20, 189	9						
Type of Historical Right:	DECREED							
Purpose (use):	IRRIGATION							
Irrigation Type:	FLOOD							
*Flow Rate:	2.50 CFS	2.50 CFS						
*Volume:	922.01 AC-FT							
Climatic Area:	2 - MODERATELY HIGH							
*Maximum Acres:	371.00							
*Source Name:	SWEET GRASS CREEK							
Source Type:	SURFA	CE WATER						
*Point of Diversion and Means	of Diversion:							
<u>ID</u> 1	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtı</u> NWSW	<u>r Sec</u> /SW	<u>Sec</u> 27	<u>Twp</u> 4N	<u>Rge</u> 15E	<u>County</u> SWEET GRASS	
Period of Diversion:	APRIL 15 TC	OCTOBER	15					
Diversion Means:	HEADGATE							
Ditch Name:	LOWERY DI	ТСН						
2		SWNV		34	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS	
Period of Diversion:	APRIL 15 TC	OCTOBER	15					
Diversion Means:	HEADGATE							
Ditch Name:	ADAM INTAK	KE CANAL						
3		NWSE	SW	36	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS	

Diversion Means:

Period of Diversion:

Ditch Name: CRUM DITCH

Period of Use: APRIL 15 TO OCTOBER 15

*Place of Use:

<u>ID</u>	Acres	Govt Lot	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	Sec	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1	17.00		S2SE	27	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS
2	22.00		N2NE	34	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS
3	142.00		N2	35	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS
4	44.00		SE	35	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS

APRIL 15 TO OCTOBER 15

HEADGATE

5		31.00	SW	36	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS
6		24.00	NW	1	3N	15E	SWEET GRASS
7		70.00	NE	1	3N	15E	SWEET GRASS
8		17.00	SW	1	ЗN	15E	SWEET GRASS
9		4.00	E2SWSE	36	4N	15E	SWEET GRASS
	Total:	371.00					

127346-00	127347-00	127348-00	127349-00	127350-00	127351-00
127352-00	127362-00				

Water Right Number:	43BV 2118	02-00 S	TATEMENT OF CLAIM
	Version:	3 POS	T DECREE
		Status:	DISMISSED
Owners:	J BAR L RA PO BOX 11 BOZEMAN,	925	
Priority Date:			
Type of Historical Right:			
Purpose (use):	IRRIGATIO	N	
Flow Rate:			
Volume:			
Source Name:	SWEET GR	ASS CRE	EK
Source Type:	SURFA	CE WAT	ER
Point of Diversion and Means	of Diversion:		
Period of Use:			
Place of Use:			
Domarks:			

Remarks:

Water Right Number:	43BV 2118	803-00	ST	ATEMENT OF	CLAIM
	Version:	3 PC	DST	DECREE	
		Status:		DISMISSED	
Owners:	J BAR L RA	NCHES	S LLO	C	
	PO BOX 11	925			
	BOZEMAN,	MT 597	719	1925	
Priority Date:					
Type of Historical Right:					
Purpose (use):	IRRIGATIO	N			
Flow Rate:					
Volume:					
Source Name:	SWEET GR	RASS CF	REE	K	
Source Type:	SURF/	ACE WA	TEF	२	
Point of Diversion and Means	of Diversion:	:			
Period of Use:					
Place of Use:					

Remarks:

Water Right Number:	43BV 211804-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM					
	Version:	3 POS	ST [DECREE		
		Status:	0	DISMISSED		
Owners:	J BAR L RA PO BOX 119 BOZEMAN,	925		-		
Priority Date:						
Type of Historical Right:						
Purpose (use):	IRRIGATION	٧				
Flow Rate:						
Volume:						
Source Name:	SWEET GR	ASS CRI	EEK	K		
Source Type:	SURFA	CE WAT	ΓER	2		
Point of Diversion and Means	of Diversion:					
Period of Use:						
Place of Use:						

Remarks:

Water Right Number:	43BV 211805-00			STATEMENT OF CLAIM				
	Version:	3 PO	ST	DECREE				
		Status:		DISMISSED				
Owners:	J BAR L RA PO BOX 11 BOZEMAN,	925						
Priority Date:								
Type of Historical Right:								
Purpose (use):	IRRIGATIO	N						
Flow Rate:								
Volume:								
Source Name:	SWEET GR	ASS CR	REE	К				
Source Type:	SURFA	ACE WA	TEF	२				
Point of Diversion and Means	of Diversion:							
Period of Use:								
Place of Use:								

Remarks: