**Montana Water Court** PO Box 1389 1-800-624-3270 (406) 586-4364

Bozeman, MT 59771-1389

watercourt@mt.gov

**ELECTRONICALLY FILED** 

40K-0046-R-2022

November 4, 2022

Montana Water Court

IN THE WATER COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA LOWER MISSOURI DIVISION WHITEWATER CREEK - BASIN (40K) PRELIMINARY DECREE

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

CLAIMANT: Deborah L. Hammond; Michael D. Hammond; Ben Math

CASE 40K-0046-R-2022 40K 36988-00 40K 36989-00

### NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER'S REPORT

This Master's Report was filed with the Montana Water Court on the above stamped date. Please review this report carefully.

You may file a written objection to this Master's Report within 10 days of the stamped date if you disagree or find errors with the Master's findings of fact, conclusions of law, or recommendations. Rule 23, W.R.Adj.R. If the Master's Report was mailed to you, the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure allow an additional 3 days be added to the 10day objection period. Rule 6(d), M.R.Civ.P. If you file an objection, you must serve a copy of the objection to all parties on the service list found at the end of the Master's Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the service list must be filed with the Water Court.

If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master's Report.

### **MASTER'S REPORT**

Claims 40K 36988-00 and 40K 36989-00 appeared in the Preliminary Decree for the Lower Missouri River Division, Whitewater Creek. The claims are owned by Deborah L. Hammond, Michael D. Hammond, and Ben Math. The claims received issue remarks from the DNRC. The claims were consolidated into Case 40K-0046-R-2022 to resolve the issue remarks.

## FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Claims 40K 36988-00 appeared in the Preliminary Decree as a stock water claim. The claim received the following issue remark:

THE PLACE OF USE APPEARS TO NEED MODIFICATION BASED ON THE DNRC CORRECTION TO THE POINT OF DIVERSION. THE CORRECT PLACE OF USE LEGAL LAND DESCRIPTION APPEARS TO BE THE SENESE SEC 26, TWP 36N, RGE 32E, PHILLIPS COUNTY.

- 2. On May 9, 2022, the Court consolidated the claims into Water Court Case 40K-0046-R-2022 and set a filing deadline for the Claimants to file information or evidence clarifying the place of use for claim 40K 36988-00. Nothing was filed by the ordered deadline.
- 3. On July 25, 2022, the Court set a filing deadline for the Claimants to show cause why the place of use element for claim 40K 36988-00 should not be modified according to the suggestions in the above-listed issue remark. Again, nothing was filed by the ordered deadline.
- 4. Additionally, each of the claims received notice-type issue remarks from the DNRC denoting modifications made by the DNRC during its claims re-examination.

# PRINCIPLES OF LAW

- 1. A properly filed Statement of Claim for an existing water right is prima facie proof of its content. Section 85-2-227, MCA; Rule 10, W.R.Adj.R.
- 2. Prima facie proof may be contradicted and overcome by a preponderance of the evidence. Rule 19, W.R.Adj.R.
- 3. A preponderance of the evidence is evidence that shows a fact is "more probable than not." *Hohenlohe v. State*, 2010 MT 203, ¶ 33, 357 Mont. 438, 240 P.3d 628.

- 4. If prima facie status is overcome, the burden shifts back to the claimant to demonstrate historical use. *79 Ranch v. Pitsch*, 204 Mont. 426, 432-33, 666 P.2d 215, 218 (1983).
- 5. The Water Court may use information submitted by the DNRC, the Statement of Claim, and any other data obtained by the Court to evaluate a water right. Sections 85-2-227, -231(2), MCA.
- 6. If a claimant fails to comply with an order issued by the Water Court, the Court may issue orders of sanction that are just. Rule 22, W.R.Adj.R.
- 7. Sanctions applied against a claimant may include modification of a claim to conform with data provided by the DNRC, information obtained by the Court, or information included in an objection, or the entry of default and termination of a water right claim. Rule 11, W.R.Adj.R.
- 8. If a claimant agrees to reduce or limit a claim, the Water Court may accept the reduction or limitation without reviewing further evidence, unless an unresolved issue remark remains. Rule 17(c), W.R.Adj.R.
- 9. The Water Court is not bound by parties' settlement agreements. Any settlement reached by the parties is subject to review and approval by the Water Court. Rule 17(a), W.R.Adj.R.

# CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. The evidence in the record is sufficient to resolve the issue remarks placed on the above-captioned claims.
- 2. Because the Claimants did not file any information or evidence disputing the proposed modifications to the place of use for either claim, a preponderance of the evidence shows that the place of use element for claim 40K 36988-00 should be modified as described in Finding of Fact No. 1. The remark should be removed from the claim.
- 3. The notice-type issue remarks appearing on each of the claims served their notice purpose and should be removed from the claims.

# RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the foregoing Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, this Master recommends that the Court adopt the changes as outlined above.

A post decree abstract of the water right claims reflecting the recommended changes is attached to this Report.

Eugene C. White Water Master

# Service via USPS Mail

Deborah L. Hammond Michael D. Hammond P.O. Box 1271 Malta, MT 59538

Ben Math HC 60 Box 118 Whitewater, MT 59544 Box 380 Fort Peck, MT 59223

**Notice: Service List Updated 10.20.22** 

#### POST DECREE

#### ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

### WHITEWATER CREEK

#### **BASIN 40K**

Water Right Number: 40K 36988-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

> Version: 3 -- POST DECREE

> > **Status: ACTIVE**

BEN MATH **Owners:** 

**BOX 380** 

FORT PECK, MT 59223

**Priority Date: DECEMBER 31, 1968** 

**Type of Historical Right:** USE

STOCK Purpose (use):

Flow Rate: A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED FOR THIS USE FROM THIS

ONSTREAM RESERVOIR. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT

HISTORICALLY NECESSARY TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.

Volume: THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR

> STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND

HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.

**Source Name:** UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF EAST FORK WHITEWATER CREEK

SURFACE WATER **Source Type:** 

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

ID Govt Lot Otr Sec <u>Sec</u> <u>Twp</u> Rge **County** 1

**SENESE** 26 36N 32E **PHILLIPS** 

**Period of Diversion:** JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

**Diversion Means:** DAM

Reservoir: **ONSTREAM** 

> **Govt Lot** Otr Sec **County Sec** <u>Twp</u> Rge

> > **SENESE** 26 36N 32E **PHILLIPS**

Diversion to Reservoir: DIVERSION # 1

Period of Use: **JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31** 

Place of Use:

ID <u>Acres</u> Govt Lot Otr Sec <u>Sec</u> **Twp** <u>Rge</u> **County SENESE** 32E **PHILLIPS** 1 26 36N

#### POST DECREE

### ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

#### WHITEWATER CREEK

#### **BASIN 40K**

Water Right Number: 40K 36989-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

Version: 3 -- POST DECREE

Status: ACTIVE

Owners: MICHAEL D HAMMOND

PO BOX 1271 MALTA, MT 59538

DEBROAH L HAMMOND

PO BOX 1271 MALTA, MT 59538

**Priority Date:** DECEMBER 31, 1971

Type of Historical Right: USE

Purpose (use): STOCK

Flow Rate: A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED FOR THIS USE FROM THIS

ONSTREAM RESERVOIR. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT

HISTORICALLY NECESSARY TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.

**Volume:** THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR

STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND

HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.

Source Name: INTERIOR DRAINAGE

Source Type: SURFACE WATER

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

IDGovt LotQtr SecSecTwpRgeCounty1SESWSW1337N32EPHILLIPS

Period of Diversion: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

**Diversion Means:** DAM

Reservoir: ONSTREAM

Govt Lot Qtr Sec Sec Twp Rge County

SESWSW 13 37N 32E PHILLIPS

Diversion to Reservoir: DIVERSION # 1

Period of Use: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

Place of Use:

<u>ID</u> <u>Acres Govt Lot Qtr Sec Sec Twp Rge County</u>

1 SESWSW 13 37N 32E PHILLIPS