

43B-0381-R-2021

September 15, 2021

Montana Water Court

MONTANA WATER COURT, YELLOWSTONE DIVISION
YELLOWSTONE RIVER ABOVE AND INCLUDING BRIDGER CREEK BASIN
BASIN 43B
PRELIMINARY DECREE

* * * * *

CLAIMANTS: Diana D. Venable; Thomas E. Venable

CASE 43B-0381-R-2021

43B 194346-00

43B 194347-00

NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER'S REPORT

This Master's Report was filed with the Clerk of the Montana Water Court. Please review this Report carefully.

You may file a written objection to this Master's Report if you disagree or find errors with the Master's Findings of Fact, Conclusion of Law, or Recommendations. The above stamped date indicates the date this Master's Report was filed and mailed. Rule 23 of the Water Right Adjudication Rules requires written objections to a Master's Report be filed within 10 days of the date of the Master's Report. Because this Master's Report was mailed to you, Rule 6(d) of the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure provides an additional 3 days to the 10-day objection period.

If you file an objection, you must mail a copy of the objection to all parties on the Service List found at the end of this Master's Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the Service List must be filed with the Water Court. *If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master's Report.*

MASTER'S REPORT

Claim 43B 194346-00 appeared in the Preliminary Decree with the following remarks:

STARTING IN 2008, PERIOD OF DIVERSION WAS ADDED TO MOST CLAIM ABSTRACTS, INCLUDING THIS ONE.

THE CLAIMED FLOW RATE EXCEEDS THE 17 GPM PER ACRE GUIDELINE AND CANNOT BE CONFIRMED DUE TO LACK OF DATA. THE FLOW RATE EQUALS 60.00 GPM PER ACRE.

DITCH NAME WAS MODIFIED AS A RESULT OF DNRC REVIEW UNDER MONTANA WATER COURT REEXAMINATION ORDERS. IF NO OBJECTIONS ARE FILED TO THIS CLAIM, THESE ELEMENTS WILL REMAIN AS THEY APPEAR ON THIS ABSTRACT AND THE REMARK WILL BE REMOVED FROM THE CLAIM.

Claim 43B 194347-00 appeared in the Preliminary Decree with the following issue

remark:

STARTING IN 2008, PERIOD OF DIVERSION WAS ADDED TO MOST CLAIM ABSTRACTS, INCLUDING THIS ONE.

THE CLAIMED FLOW RATE EXCEEDS THE 17 GPM PER ACRE GUIDELINE AND CANNOT BE CONFIRMED DUE TO LACK OF DATA. THE FLOW RATE EQUALS 52.00 GPM PER ACRE.

The flow rate issue remarks were not addressed through the objection process. The Water Court is required to resolve the issues raised by each issue remark. Section 85-2-248, MCA.

Under Section 85-2-248(3), MCA, information in the claim file or other information obtained by the Court can be reviewed to determine if it provides a sufficient basis to resolve the issue raised by a remark and the Court can provide the claimant an opportunity to file additional information or evidence. On April 21, 2021 the claimants filed a statement providing additional information about claim 43B 194346-00. On June 17, 2021 the claimants filed a statement providing additional information about claim 43B 194347-00. These filings are viewable in the Court's FullCourt Enterprise case management system.

APPLICABLE LAW

"All issue remarks to claims that are not resolved through the filing of an objection as provided in 85-2-233 must be resolved as provided in this section." Section 85-2-248(2), MCA.

A properly filed Statement of Claim for Existing Water Right is *prima facie* proof of its content pursuant to section 85-2-227, MCA. This *prima facie* proof may be contradicted and

overcome by other evidence that proves, by a preponderance of the evidence, that the elements of the claim do not accurately reflect the beneficial use of the water right as it existed prior to July 1, 1973. This is the burden of proof for every assertion that a claim is incorrect including for claimants objecting to their own claims. Rule 19, W.R.Adj.R.

FINDINGS OF FACT

1. The statements for each claim provide additional information about the flow rates.

From the statement for claim 43B 194347-00:

[B]ased on the type of terrain this water has to cross, a very rocky & gravel type of soil - the length of the ditch through this type of soil causes a loss of a lot of water between the headgate and the irrigated area. Leaving very little water to irrigate with.

The statement for claim 43B 194346-00 provides the same information. The issue remarks concerning the flow rate should be removed as addressed and resolved.

2. The other remarks provide notice of changes made prior to issuance of the Preliminary Decree and do not raise unresolved issues which need to be addressed. These remarks should be removed as having served their notice purposes.

CONCLUSION OF LAW

The information provided by the claimants is sufficient to resolve the issue remarks without evidentiary hearing. Sections 85-2-248(3) and (11), MCA.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Based upon the above Findings of Fact and Conclusion of Law, this Master recommends that the Court make the changes specified in the Findings of Fact to correct the Preliminary Decree for this Basin. A Post Decree Abstract of Water Right Claim for each claim is served with this Report to confirm the recommended changes have been made in the state's centralized record system.

Kathryn L. W. Lambert
Senior Water Master

Service Via USPS Mail:

Diana D. Venable
Thomas E. Venable
PO Box 1117
Livingston, MT 59047

\\JUDGALH2OSRV\\DATAVOL\\SHARE\\WC-BASIN FOLDERS\\43B PD\\CASES\\381R\\381R MR 5-19-21 SJS.DOCX

**POST DECREE
ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM
YELLOWSTONE RIVER, ABOVE & INCLUDING BRIDGER CREEK
BASIN 43B**

Water Right Number: **43B 194346-00** STATEMENT OF CLAIM

Version: 3 -- POST DECREE

Status: ACTIVE

Owners:
DIANA D VENABLE
PO BOX 1117
LIVINGSTON, MT 59047

THOMAS E VENABLE
PO BOX 1117
LIVINGSTON, MT 59047

Priority Date: MAY 1, 1892

Type of Historical Right: DECREED

Purpose (Use): IRRIGATION

Irrigation Type: SPRINKLER/FLOOD

Flow Rate: 1.75 CFS

Volume: THE TOTAL VOLUME OF THIS WATER RIGHT SHALL NOT EXCEED THE AMOUNT PUT TO HISTORICAL AND BENEFICIAL USE.

Climatic Area: 3 - MODERATE

Maximum Acres: 13.00

Source Name: MINER CREEK

Source Type: SURFACE WATER

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

ID	Govt Lot	Qtr Sec	Sec	Twp	Rge	County
1		SESENE	19	2S	9E	PARK

Period of Diversion: APRIL 1 TO NOVEMBER 1

Diversion Means: PUMP/HEADGATE W/DITCH OR PIPELINE

Ditch Name: EGGAR DITCH

Period of Use: APRIL 1 TO NOVEMBER 1

Place of Use:

ID	Acres	Govt Lot	Qtr Sec	Sec	Twp	Rge	County
1	6.00		SENESW	17	2S	9E	PARK
2	7.00		SWNESW	17	2S	9E	PARK
Total:	13.00						

Remarks:

THE WATER RIGHTS FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE SUPPLEMENTAL WHICH MEANS THE RIGHTS HAVE OVERLAPPING PLACES OF USE. THE RIGHTS CAN BE COMBINED TO IRRIGATE ONLY OVERLAPPING PARCELS. EACH RIGHT IS LIMITED TO THE FLOW RATE AND PLACE OF USE OF THAT INDIVIDUAL RIGHT. THE SUM TOTAL VOLUME OF THESE WATER RIGHTS SHALL NOT EXCEED THE AMOUNT PUT TO HISTORICAL AND BENEFICIAL USE.

194345-00

194346-00

194347-00

**POST DECREE
ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM
YELLOWSTONE RIVER, ABOVE & INCLUDING BRIDGER CREEK
BASIN 43B**

Water Right Number: **43B 194347-00** STATEMENT OF CLAIM

Version: 3 -- POST DECREE

Status: ACTIVE

Owners:
DIANA D VENABLE
PO BOX 1117
LIVINGSTON, MT 59047

THOMAS E VENABLE
PO BOX 1117
LIVINGSTON, MT 59047

Priority Date: MAY 1, 1891

Type of Historical Right: DECREED

Purpose (Use): IRRIGATION

Irrigation Type: SPRINKLER/FLOOD

Flow Rate: 1.50 CFS

Volume: THE TOTAL VOLUME OF THIS WATER RIGHT SHALL NOT EXCEED THE AMOUNT PUT TO HISTORICAL AND BENEFICIAL USE.

Climatic Area: 3 - MODERATE

Maximum Acres: 13.00

Source Name: MINER CREEK

Source Type: SURFACE WATER

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

ID	Govt Lot	Qtr Sec	Sec	Twp	Rge	County
1		SESENE	19	2S	9E	PARK

Period of Diversion: APRIL 1 TO NOVEMBER 1

Diversion Means: PUMP

Period of Use: APRIL 1 TO NOVEMBER 1

Place of Use:

ID	Acres	Govt Lot	Qtr Sec	Sec	Twp	Rge	County
1	6.00		SENESW	17	2S	9E	PARK
2	7.00		SWNESW	17	2S	9E	PARK
Total:	13.00						

Remarks:

THE WATER RIGHTS FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE SUPPLEMENTAL WHICH MEANS THE RIGHTS HAVE OVERLAPPING PLACES OF USE. THE RIGHTS CAN BE COMBINED TO IRRIGATE ONLY OVERLAPPING PARCELS. EACH RIGHT IS LIMITED TO THE FLOW RATE AND PLACE OF USE OF THAT INDIVIDUAL RIGHT. THE SUM TOTAL VOLUME OF THESE WATER RIGHTS SHALL NOT EXCEED THE AMOUNT PUT TO HISTORICAL AND BENEFICIAL USE.

August 26, 2021
43B 194347-00

Page 2 of 2
Post Decree Abstract

194345-00 194346-00 194347-00