

40A-0124-R-2020

September 22, 2021

Montana Water Court

IN THE WATER COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA
LOWER MISSOURI DIVISION
MUSSELSHELL RIVER ABOVE ROUNDUP (BASIN 40A)
PRELIMINARY DECREE

CLAIMANTS: Sylvan Anderson; **Quarter Circle Bell Inc.**

40A-0124-R-2020
40A 110151-00
40A 110152-00
40A 110153-00
40A 110154-00
40A 110155-00

NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER'S REPORT

This Master's Report was filed with the Clerk of the Montana Water Court. Please review this Report carefully.

You may file a written objection to this Master's Report if you disagree or find errors with the Master's Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, or Recommendations. The above stamped date indicates the date this Master's Report was filed and mailed. Rule 23 of the Water Right Adjudication Rules requires written objections to a Master's Report be filed within 10 days of the date of the Master's Report. If this Master's Report was mailed to you, Rule 6(d) of the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure provides an additional 3 days to the 10-day objection period.

If you file an objection, you must mail a copy of the objection to all parties on the Service List found at the end of this Master's Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the Service List must be filed with the Water Court.

If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master's Report.

MASTER'S REPORT

The above-captioned claims appeared in the Preliminary Decree for the Musselshell River above Roundup (Basin 40A) issued on June 7, 2017. Claim 40A 110152-00 is owned by Quarter Circle Bell Inc. The remaining claims are owned by Sylvan Anderson. The claims did not receive objections, counterobjections, or notices of intent to appear but did receive issue remarks during the DNRC's claims reexamination.

FINDINGS OF FACT

40A 110152-00

1. Claim 40A 110152-00 was decreed as a stock claim for an onstream reservoir in the NESESW of Section 27, T7N, R23E, Golden Valley.
2. The claim received an issue remark stating that the point of diversion, reservoir record, and place of use may have been claimed with an incorrect legal land description. The DNRC proposed the following corrections:

Point of Diversion/Reservoir Record

<u>ID</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>QtrSec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1		<u>NESESW</u>	27	7N	23E	Golden Valley
		<u>SWSWNW</u>				

Place of Use

<u>ID</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>QtrSec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1		<u>SESW</u>	27	7N	23E	Golden Valley
		<u>SWSWNW</u>				

3. The claim also received an issue remark stating that Quarter Circle Bell Inc. may be the owner of this water right. Quarter Circle Bell Inc. was added as the owner of claim 40A 110152-00 on February 4, 2015.

4. On December 15, 2020, the Court ordered Quarter Circle Bell Inc. and Sylvan Anderson to file evidence if they did not agree with the DNRC's proposed corrections to the point of diversion, reservoir record, and place of use. Nothing was filed by the deadline.

5. On May 26, 2021, the Court ordered the parties to show cause why the point of diversion, reservoir record, and place of use should not be corrected as proposed by the DNRC. The Order stated that if nothing was filed by the deadline, the point of diversion, reservoir record, and place of use would be corrected to the SWSWNW of Section 27, T7N, R23E, Golden Valley. Nothing was filed by the deadline.

Notice-Type Issue Remarks

6. Each of the claims received issue remarks regarding modifications made to claim elements by the DNRC prior to the issuance of the Basin 40A Preliminary Decree. These elements included the point of diversion, means of diversion, reservoir record, and period of diversion. The remarks stated that if no objections were received, the remarks should be removed from the claims. None of the claims in this matter received objections.

PRINCIPLES OF LAW

1. A properly filed Statement of Claim for an existing water right is *prima facie* proof of its content. Section 85-2-227, MCA; Rule 10, W.R.Adj.R.

2. *Prima facie* proof may be contradicted and overcome by a preponderance of the evidence. Rule 19, W.R.Adj.R.

3. A preponderance of the evidence is evidence that shows a fact is “more probable than not.” *Hohenlohe v. State*, 2010 MT 203, ¶ 33, 357 Mont. 438, 240 P.3d 628.

4. If *prima facie* status is overcome, the burden shifts back to the claimant to demonstrate historical use. *79 Ranch v. Pitsch*, 204 Mont. 426, 432-33, 666 P.2d 215, 218 (1983).

5. Section 85-2-248(2), MCA, requires that the Water Court resolve all issue remarks that are not resolved through the objection process. *See also* Rule 7, W.R.Adj.R.

6. The Water Court may use information submitted by the DNRC, the Statement of Claim, and any other data obtained by the Court to evaluate a water right. Sections 85-2-227, -231(2), MCA.

7. When resolving issue remarks, the Water Court must weigh the information resulting in the issue remark and the issue remark against the claimed water right. Section

85-2-247(2), MCA. The factual evidence on which an issue remark is based must meet the preponderance of evidence standard before the *prima facie* status of a claim is overcome. 43Q 200996-00 et al., Order Establishing Volume and Order Closing Case, at 18, June 8, 2015.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

40A 110152-00

1. The reservoir issue remark overcomes the *prima facie* status of the claim. The evidence in the claim file shows the historically accurate location of the claimed reservoir is in the SWSWNW of Section 27, T7N, R23E, Golden Valley. The point of diversion, reservoir record, and place of use legal land descriptions should be corrected accordingly, and the issue remark should be removed from the claim.

2. The ownership of claim 40A 110152-00 has been updated to Quarter Circle Bell Inc. Therefore, the potential ownership issue remark should be removed from the claim.

Notice-Type Issue Remarks

3. The notice-type issue remarks provided notice of changes made after completion of the Temporary Preliminary Decree proceedings. The remarks do not raise unresolved issues that need to be addressed and the remarks should be removed from the abstract of each claim as having served their notice purposes.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the foregoing Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, this Master recommends that the Court adopt the changes as outlined above.

A post decree abstract of each water right claim reflecting the recommended changes is attached to this Report.

Melissa Lockman
Water Master

Service via USPS Mail

Sylvan Anderson
PO Box 5
Lavina, MT 59046

**Quarter Circle Bell Inc.
231 Dean Creek Rd.
Lavina, MT 59046-7227**

Notice: Caption Updated 8.23.21

**POST DECREE
ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM
MUSSELSHELL RIVER, ABOVE ROUNDUP
BASIN 40A**

Water Right Number: 40A 110151-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM
Version: 3 -- POST DECREE
Status: ACTIVE

Owners: SYLVAN ANDERSON
PO BOX 5
LAVINA, MT 59046

Priority Date: APRIL 15, 1892

Type of Historical Right: FILED

Purpose (Use): IRRIGATION

Irrigation Type: FURROW/FLOOD

Flow Rate: 5.00 CFS

Volume: THE TOTAL VOLUME OF THIS WATER RIGHT SHALL NOT EXCEED THE AMOUNT PUT TO HISTORICAL AND BENEFICIAL USE.

Climatic Area: 2 - MODERATELY HIGH

Maximum Acres: 144.30

Source Name: MUSSELSHELL RIVER

Source Type: SURFACE WATER

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

<u>ID</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1		NWNWSE	12	6N	23E	MUSSELSHELL

Period of Diversion: APRIL 15 TO SEPTEMBER 30

Diversion Means: HEADGATE

Ditch Name: UNNAMED DITCH NO. 305

Period of Use: APRIL 15 TO SEPTEMBER 30

Place of Use:

<u>ID</u>	<u>Acres</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1	50.20		NE	12	6N	23E	MUSSELSHELL
2	24.50		SE	12	6N	23E	MUSSELSHELL
3	69.60		W2	6	6N	24E	MUSSELSHELL
Total:	144.30						

Remarks:

THE WATER RIGHTS FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE SUPPLEMENTAL WHICH MEANS THE RIGHTS HAVE OVERLAPPING PLACES OF USE. THE RIGHTS CAN BE COMBINED TO IRRIGATE ONLY OVERLAPPING PARCELS. EACH RIGHT IS LIMITED TO THE FLOW RATE AND PLACE OF USE OF THAT INDIVIDUAL RIGHT. THE SUM TOTAL VOLUME OF THESE WATER RIGHTS SHALL NOT EXCEED THE AMOUNT PUT TO HISTORICAL AND BENEFICIAL USE.

**POST DECREE
ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM
MUSSELSHELL RIVER, ABOVE ROUNDUP
BASIN 40A**

Water Right Number: **40A 110152-00** STATEMENT OF CLAIM
Version: 3 -- POST DECREE
Status: ACTIVE

Owners: QUARTER CIRCLE BELL INC
231 DEAN CREEK RD
LAVINA, MT 59046 7227

Priority Date: OCTOBER 15, 1941

Type of Historical Right: USE

Purpose (Use): STOCK

Flow Rate: A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED FOR THIS USE FROM THIS ONSTREAM RESERVOIR. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.

Volume: THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.

Source Name: UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF MUSSELSHELL RIVER
Source Type: SURFACE WATER

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

<u>ID</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Otr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1	SWSWNW	27	7N	23E	GOLDEN VALLEY	

Period of Diversion: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31
Diversion Means: DAM
Reservoir: ONSTREAM

<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Otr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
SWSWNW	27	7N	23E	GOLDEN VALLEY	

Diversion to Reservoir: DIVERSION # 1

Period of Use: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31
Place of Use:

<u>ID</u>	<u>Acres</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Otr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1		SWSWNW	27	7N	23E	GOLDEN VALLEY	

**POST DECREE
ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM
MUSSELSHELL RIVER, ABOVE ROUNDUP
BASIN 40A**

Water Right Number: **40A 110153-00** STATEMENT OF CLAIM
Version: 3 -- POST DECREE
Status: ACTIVE

Owners: SYLVAN ANDERSON
PO BOX 5
LAVINA, MT 59046

Priority Date: OCTOBER 15, 1943

Type of Historical Right: USE

Purpose (Use): STOCK

Flow Rate: A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED FOR THIS USE FROM THIS ONSTREAM RESERVOIR. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.

Volume: THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.

Source Name: UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF MUSSELSHELL RIVER
Source Type: SURFACE WATER

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

ID	Govt Lot	Otr Sec	Sec	Twp	Rge	County
1	SWSWSW		29	7N	23E	GOLDEN VALLEY

Period of Diversion: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31
Diversion Means: DAM
Reservoir: ONSTREAM

Govt Lot	Otr Sec	Sec	Twp	Rge	County
SWSWSW		29	7N	23E	GOLDEN VALLEY

Diversion to Reservoir: DIVERSION # 1
Dam Height: 13.00 FEET
Depth: 10.00 FEET
Surface Area: 9.30 ACRES
Capacity: 37.20 ACRE-FEET

THE DAM EXTENDS INTO THE SESWSW SEC 29 TWP 7N RGE 23E GOLDEN VALLEY COUNTY.

THE RESEVOIR EXTENDS INTO THE E2SWSW AND THE NWSW SEC 29 TWP 7N RGE 23E GOLDEN VALLEY COUNTY.

Period of Use: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31
Place of Use:

<u>ID</u>	<u>Acres</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1			SWSW	29	7N	23E	GOLDEN VALLEY

**POST DECREE
ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM
MUSSELSHELL RIVER, ABOVE ROUNDUP
BASIN 40A**

Water Right Number: **40A 110154-00** STATEMENT OF CLAIM
Version: 3 -- POST DECREE
Status: ACTIVE

Owners: SYLVAN ANDERSON
PO BOX 5
LAVINA, MT 59046

Priority Date: OCTOBER 1, 1942

Type of Historical Right: USE

Purpose (Use): STOCK

Flow Rate: A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED FOR THIS USE FROM THIS ONSTREAM RESERVOIR. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.

Volume: THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.

Source Name: UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF MUSSELSHELL RIVER
Source Type: SURFACE WATER

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

<u>ID</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Otr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1	SWSWSW	22	7N	23E	GOLDEN VALLEY	

Period of Diversion: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31
Diversion Means: DAM

Reservoir: ONSTREAM **Reservoir Name:** HOME

<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Otr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
SWSWSW	22	7N	23E	GOLDEN VALLEY	

Diversion to Reservoir: DIVERSION # 1
Dam Height: 13.00 FEET
Depth: 10.00 FEET
Surface Area: 5.00 ACRES
Capacity: 20.00 ACRE-FEET

Period of Use: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31
Place of Use:

<u>ID</u>	<u>Acres</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Otr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1			E2SE	21	7N	23E	GOLDEN VALLEY
2			SWSWSW	22	7N	23E	GOLDEN VALLEY

**POST DECREE
ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM
MUSSELSHELL RIVER, ABOVE ROUNDUP
BASIN 40A**

Water Right Number: **40A 110155-00** STATEMENT OF CLAIM
Version: 3 -- POST DECREE
Status: ACTIVE

Owners: SYLVAN ANDERSON
PO BOX 5
LAVINA, MT 59046

Priority Date: DECEMBER 15, 1944

Type of Historical Right: USE

Purpose (Use): STOCK

Flow Rate: A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED FOR THIS USE FROM THIS ONSTREAM RESERVOIR. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.

Volume: THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.

Source Name: UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF COTTONWOOD CREEK
Source Type: SURFACE WATER

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

<u>ID</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Otr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1	SESESE	15	7N	23E	MUSSELSHELL	

Period of Diversion: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31
Diversion Means: DAM
Reservoir: ONSTREAM

<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Otr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
SESESE	15	7N	23E	MUSSELSHELL	

Diversion to Reservoir: DIVERSION # 1
Period of Use: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31
Place of Use:

<u>ID</u>	<u>Acres</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Otr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1		SESESE	15	7N	23E	MUSSELSHELL	