

39E-0025-R-2021

September 28, 2021

Montana Water Court

IN THE WATER COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA  
YELLOWSTONE DIVISION  
BOX ELDER CREEK BASIN (39E)  
PRELIMINARY DECREE

\* \* \* \* \*

CLAIMANT: Pamela J. Burman; Brian J. Quade; Deanna J. Weyer

CASE 39E-0025-R-2021  
39E 33173-00

OBJECTOR: United States of America (Forest Service)

**NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER'S REPORT**

You may file a written objection to the Report if you disagree with the Master's Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, or Recommendations, or if there are errors in the Report.

The above stamped date indicates the date the Master's Report was filed and mailed. Rule 23 of the Water Right Adjudication Rules requires that written objections to a Master's Report must be filed within 10 days of the date of the Master's Report. If the Report was mailed to you, the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure allow an additional 3 days be added to the 10 day objection period. Rule 6(d), M. R. Civ. P. This means your objection must be received no later than 13 days from the above stamped date.

If you file an objection, you must mail a copy of the objection to all parties on the Service List found at the end of the Master's Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the Service List must be filed with the Water Court. If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master's Report.

**MASTER'S REPORT**  
**FINDINGS OF FACT**

1. The above captioned claim appeared in the Preliminary Decree for Box Elder Creek (Basin 39E). The United States of America (Forest Service) ("USFS") filed an objection to the claim.
2. On March 17, 2021 the above captioned claim was consolidated into Case 39E-0025-R-2021.
3. On June 24, 2021, a Stipulation was filed with the Court. The Stipulation indicated that the claimants and the USFS had agreed to the modification of claim 39E 33173-00.
4. Pursuant to the Stipulation, the parties propose that ownership of the claims be modified as follows:

**Diversion Means:** ~~LIVESTOCK DIRECT FROM SOURCE~~  
**DAM**

The Stipulation also proposes the placement of the following remark on the claim:

**POINT OF DIVERSION AND PLACE OF USE ARE LOCATED  
ENTIRELY ON PRIVATE LAND.**

**PRINCIPLES OF LAW**

1. The Montana Water Court has the authority to determine the extent of all water rights in the state as they existed prior to July 1, 1973. *Fellows v. Saylor*, 2016 MT 45, ¶ 25, 382 Mont. 298, 367 P.3d 732; §§ 85-2-233, -102(12), MCA. The purpose of the Water Court is to adjudicate rights to the use of water as they existed on July 1, 1973. *In re Clark Fork River*, 254 Mont. 11, 17, 833 P.3d 1120 (Mont. 1992).
2. A properly filed Statement of Claim for Existing Water Right is *prima facie* proof of its content. § 85-2-227, MCA. This *prima facie* proof may be contradicted and overcome by other evidence that proves, by a preponderance of the evidence, that the elements of the claim do not accurately reflect the beneficial use of the water right as it

existed prior to July 1, 1973. This is the burden of proof for every assertion that a claim is incorrect. Rule 19, W.R.Adj.R.

3. “The Water Court is not bound by settlement agreements. Any settlement reached by the parties is subject to review and approval by the Water Court.” Rule 17(a), W.R.Adj.R; *In re Argabright*, 2014 Mont. Water LEXIS 9, 41I 265 (December 12, 2014).

## **CONCLUSION OF LAW**

1. The Stipulation conforms to applicable law. The claim should be modified as discussed above.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

1. Upon review of the record in this case, the claim should be modified as discussed above. USFS’s objection should be resolved.

A Post Decree Abstract of Water Right Claim is attached to this Master’s Report for review.

---

Nathan Block  
Water Master

**Service via USPS Mail:**

Pamela Burman  
PO Box 442  
Fairview, MT 59221

Brian Quade  
3229 Stone Valley Road  
Alamo, CA 94507

Deanna Weyer  
377 Rimrock Drive  
Thermopolis, WY 82443

**Service via Electronic Mail:**

Eve McDonald, Attorney  
US Dept of Justice-ENRD  
999 18<sup>th</sup> Street, South Terrace Suite 370  
Denver, CO 80202  
(303) 844-1381  
[evelyn.mcdonald@usdoj.gov](mailto:evelyn.mcdonald@usdoj.gov)  
[Carla.Valentino@usdoj.gov](mailto:Carla.Valentino@usdoj.gov)  
[Amber.Engelkes@usdoj.gov](mailto:Amber.Engelkes@usdoj.gov)  
[MontanaBasins.ENRD@USDOJ.GOV](mailto:MontanaBasins.ENRD@USDOJ.GOV)  
[efile\\_nrs.enrd@usdoj.gov](mailto:efile_nrs.enrd@usdoj.gov)  
[william.bridges@usdoj.gov](mailto:william.bridges@usdoj.gov)

**POST DECREE  
ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM  
BOXELDER CREEK  
BASIN 39E**

**Water Right Number:** **39E 33173-00** STATEMENT OF CLAIM

**Version:** 3 -- POST DECREE

**Status:** ACTIVE

**Owners:**  
PAMELA J BURMAN  
PO BOX 442  
FAIRVIEW, MT 59221

BRIAN J QUADE  
3229 STONE VALLEY RD  
ALAMO, CA 94507

DEANNA J WEYER  
377 RIMROCK DR  
THERMOPOLIS, WY 82443

**Priority Date:** DECEMBER 31, 1916

**Type of Historical Right:** USE

**Purpose (Use):** STOCK

**Flow Rate:** A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED FOR THIS USE FROM THIS ONSTREAM RESERVOIR. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.

**Volume:** THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.

**Source Name:** UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF HARMON CREEK

**Source Type:** SURFACE WATER

RESERVOIR IS ALSO SPRING FED.

**Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:**

<u>ID</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1		SWNESW	19	1N	59E	CARTER

**Period of Diversion:** JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

**Diversion Means:** DAM

**Reservoir:** ONSTREAM

<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
	SWNESW	19	1N	59E	CARTER

**Diversion to Reservoir:** DIVERSION # 1

**Period of Use:** JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

**Place of Use:**

<u>ID</u>	<u>Acres</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1			SWNESW	19	1N	59E	CARTER

**Remarks:**

POINT OF DIVERSION AND PLACE OF USE ARE LOCATED ENTIRELY ON PRIVATE LAND