SENATE BILL NO. 190

INTRODUCED BY WEEDING, WHALEN, YELLOWTAIL, DRISCOLL, O'KEEFE, GRADY, MEASURE, BRUSKI, SVRCEK, REA, DOHERTY, HALLIGAN

IN THE SENATE

JANUARY 23, 1991 INTRODUCED AND REFERRED TO COMMITTEE ON JUDICIARY. FIRST READING. FEBRUARY 9, 1991 COMMITTEE RECOMMEND BILL DO PASS AS AMENDED. REPORT ADOPTED. FEBRUARY 11, 1991 PRINTING REPORT. SECOND READING, DO PASS. FEBRUARY 12, 1991 ENGROSSING REPORT. THIRD READING, PASSED. AYES, 41; NOES, 6. TRANSMITTED TO HOUSE. IN THE HOUSE INTRODUCED AND REFERRED TO COMMITTEE FEBRUARY 12, 1991 ON BUSINESS & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT.

FEBRUARY 13, 1991 FIRST READING.

MARCH 11, 1991 COMMITTEE RECOMMEND BILL BE CONCURRED IN. REPORT ADOPTED.

SECOND READING, CONCURRED IN AS MARCH 14, 1991 AMENDED.

THIRD READING, CONCURRED IN. MARCH 15, 1991 AYES, 61; NOES, 38.

RETURNED TO SENATE WITH AMENDMENTS.

IN THE SENATE

MARCH 23, 1991 RECEIVED FROM HOUSE.

> SECOND READING, AMENDMENTS CONCURRED IN.

MARCH 25, 1991

THIRD READING, AMENDMENTS CONCURRED IN.

SENT TO ENROLLING.

REPORTED CORRECTLY ENROLLED.

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19 20

> 21 22

23

24

25

1	Sante BILL NO. 190
2	INFRODUCED BY Clfd , Whalen Gellowtail
3	mail The Grady Mean Bruke Good Real
4	A BILL FOR AN ACT ENTITLED: "AN ACT REVISING THE METHOD OF
5	ENFORCEMENT AND PENALTIES FOR UNFAIR TRADE PRACTICES;
6	REPEALING SECTION 30-14-222, MCA."

BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF MONTANA;

NEW SECTION. Section 1. Injunction -- triple damages -- presumption of injury. (1) Any person, including the state and any political subdivision of the state, who is injured directly or indirectly by a violation of this part shall recover three times the actual damages sustained, together with prejudgment interest, costs, disbursements, and reasonable attorney fees.

- (2) Any person, including the state and any political subdivision of the state, who is injured or threatened with injury directly or indirectly by a violation of this part may bring an action for appropriate injunctive relief, including but not limited to an action for divesture of a portion of a corporation's assets if the court finds that the corporate assets are causing the violation.
- (3) Any person, including the state and any political subdivision of the state, is presumed to be injured by a violation of this part if the person:

- 1 (a) purchases directly or indirectly from the violator;
- 2 (b) sells directly or indirectly to the violator;
- 3 (c) deals in the same commodity or service as the 4 violator: or
- 5 (d) was in competition with the violator to acquire the whole or any part of the stock or other share of capital of another corporation acquired by the violator in violation of this part.
- 9 NEW SECTION. Section 2. Repealer. Section 30-14-222,
- 10 MCA, is repealed.
- 11 NEW SECTION. Section 3. Codification instruction.
- 12 [Section 1] is intended to be codified as an integral part
- of Title 30, chapter 14, part 2, and the provisions of Title 13
- 14 30, chapter 14, part 2, apply to [section 1].

-End-

STATE OF MONTANA - FISCAL NOTE

Form BD-15

In compliance with a written request, there is hereby submitted a Fiscal Note for SB0190, as introduced.

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSED LEGISLATION:

The bill would revise the method of enforcement and penalties for unfair trade practices and repeal 30-14-222, MCA.

ASSUMPTIONS:

1. The state, or a political subdivision of the state, would be able to recover three times the actual damages sustained as well as other costs for unfair trade practices. However, the potential fiscal impact, if any, is not subject to reasonable estimation.

FISCAL IMPACT:

Not subject to estimate.

EFFECT ON COUNTY OR OTHER LOCAL REVENUES OR EXPENDITURES:

Local governments would be able to recover damages and other costs under this bill but the potential fiscal impact, if any, is not subject to reasonable estimation.

ROD SUNDSTED, BUDGET DIRECTOR

DATE

Office of Budget and Program Planning

CECIL F. WEEDING PRIMARY SPONSOR

Fiscal Note for SB0190, as introduced

5B 190

1

2

APPROVED BY COMMITTEE ON JUDICIARY

3	O'KEEFE, GRADY, MEASURE, BRUSKI, SVRCEK, REA,
4	DOHERTY, HALLIGAN
5	
6	A BILL FOR AN ACT ENTITLED: "AN ACT REVISING THE METHOD OF
7	ENFORCEMENT AND PENALTIES FOR UNFAIR TRADE PRACTICES;
8	REPEALING SECTION 30-14-222, MCA."
9	
10	BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF MONTANA:
11	NEW SECTION. Section 1. Injunction triple damages
12	presumptionof-injury STANDING TO BRING ACTION. (1) Any
13	person, including the state and any political subdivision of
14	the state, who-is injured directly or indirectly IN HIS
15	BUSINESS OR PROPERTY by a violation of this part shall
16	recover three times the actual damages sustained, together
17	with prejudgment interest, costs, disbursements, and
18	reasonable attorney fees.
19	(2) Any person, including the state and any political
20	subdivision of the state, who-is injured or threatened with
21	injury directly or indirectly IN HIS BUSINESS OR PROPERTY by
22	a violation of this part, OR THE ATTORNEY GENERAL, may bring
23	an action for appropriate injunctive relief,includingbut
24	nottimitedtoanaction-for-divesture-of-a-portion-of-a
25	corporation's-assets-if-the-court-finds-thatthecorporate

SENATE BILL NO. 190

INTRODUCED BY WEEDING, WHALEN, YELLOWTAIL, DRISCOLL,

1	disects - are - eddsing the violation. In ADDITION TO ANY OTHER
2	RELIEF AWARDED, THE COURT MAY GRANT ANY MANDATORY
3	INJUNCTIONS REASONABLY NECESSARY TO RESTORE AND PRESERVE
4	FAIR COMPETITION IN THE TRADE OR COMMERCE AFFECTED BY THE
5	VIOLATION.
6	(3) Any person, including the state and any political
7	subdivision of the state, is-presumed-tobeinjuredbya
8	violation-of-this-part HAS STANDING TO BRING AN ACTION UNDER
9	SUBSECTION (1) OR (2) if the person:
10	(a) purchases directly or indirectly from the violator;
11	(b) sells directly or indirectly to the violator; OR
12	(c) deals in the same commodity or service as the
13	violator ,-or .
14	(d)was-in-competition-with-the-violator-to-acquire-the
15	whole-or-any-part-of-the-stock-or-other-share-of-capitalof
16	another-corporation-acquired-by-the-violator-in-violation-of
17	this-part-
18	(4) THE ATTORNEY GENERAL MAY BRING AN ACTION UNDER THIS
19	SECTION IN THE NAME OF THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF MONTANA AS
20	PARENS PATRIAE ON BEHALF OF ANY PERSON RESIDING IN THE STATE
21	TO SECURE MONETARY RELIEF AS PROVIDED IN THIS SECTION FOR
22	INJURY SUSTAINED BY THE PERSON BY REASON OF ANY VIOLATION OF
23	THIS PART. THE COURT SHALL EXCLUDE FROM THE AMOUNT OF
24	MONETARY RELIEF AWARDED IN THE ACTION ANY AMOUNT OF MONETARY
25	RELIEF THAT DUPLICATES AMOUNTS THAT HAVE BEEN AWARDED FOR
	SECOND DEADING

SB 0190/02

l the same injury

- 2 (5) IN ANY ACTION BROUGHT UNDER THIS SECTION IN WHICH
- 3 CLAIMS ARE ASSERTED BY BOTH DIRECT PURCHASERS AND INDIRECT
- 4 PURCHASERS, THE COURT IS AUTHORIZED TO EXERCISE ITS
- 5 DISCRETION IN THE APPORTIONMENT OF DAMAGES, IN THE TRANSFER
- 6 AND CONSOLIDATION OF CASES TO AVOID THE DUPLICATION OF THE
- 7 RECOVERY OF DAMAGES AND THE MULTIPLICITY OF SUITS, AND IN
- 8 OTHER RESPECTS TO OBTAIN SUBSTANTIAL FAIRNESS.
- 9 NEW SECTION. Section 2. Repealer. Section 30-14-222,
- 10 MCA, is repealed.
- 11 NEW SECTION. Section 3. Codification instruction.
- 12 [Section 1] is intended to be codified as an integral part
- 13 of Title 30, chapter 14, part 2, and the provisions of Title
- 30, chapter 14, part 2, apply to [section 1].

-End-

52nd Legislature

1

SB 0190/02

2	INTRODUCED BY WEEDING, WHALEN, YELLOWTAIL, DRISCOLL,
3	O'KEEFE, GRADY, MEASURE, BRUSKI, SVRCEK, REA,
4	DOHERTY, HALLIGAN
5	
6	A BILL FOR AN ACT ENTITLED: "AN ACT REVISING THE METHOD OF
7	ENFORCEMENT AND PENALTIES FOR UNFAIR TRADE PRACTICES;
8	REPEALING SECTION 30-14-222, MCA."
9	
10	BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF MONTANA:
11	NEW SECTION. Section 1. Injunction triple damages
12	presumptionof-injury STANDING TO BRING ACTION. (1) Any
13	person, including the state and any political subdivision of
14	the state, who-is injured directly or indirectly IN HIS
15	BUSINESS OR PROPERTY by a violation of this part shall
16	recover three times the actual damages sustained, together
17	with prejudgment interest, costs, disbursements, and
18	reasonable attorney fees.
19	(2) Any person, including the state and any political
20	subdivision of the state, who-is injured or threatened with
21	injury directly or indirectly IN HIS BUSINESS OR PROPERTY by
22	a violation of this part, OR THE ATTORNEY GENERAL, may bring
23	an action for appropriate injunctive relief, including but
24	notlimitedtoanaction-for-divesture-of-a-portion-of-a
25	corporation+s-assets-if-the-court-finds-thatthecorporate

SENATE BILL NO. 190

1	assetsareeausing-the-violation. IN ADDITION TO ANY OTHER
2	RELIEF AWARDED, THE COURT MAY GRANT ANY MANDATORY
3	INJUNCTIONS REASONABLY NECESSARY TO RESTORE AND PRESERVE
4	FAIR COMPETITION IN THE TRADE OR COMMERCE AFFECTED BY THE
5	VIOLATION.
6	(3) Any person, including the state and any political
7	subdivision of the state, is-presumed-to-be-injured-by-a
8	violation-of-this-part HAS STANDING TO BRING AN ACTION UNDER
9	SUBSECTION (1) OR (2) if the person:
10	(a) purchases directly or indirectly from the violator;
11	(b) sells directly or indirectly to the violator; $\overline{\mathtt{OR}}$
12	(c) deals in the same commodity or service as the
13	violator;-or.
14	(d)was-in-competition-with-the-violator-to-acquire-the
15	whole-or-any-part-of-the-steck-or-other-share-of-capitalof
16	another-corporation-acquired-by-the-violator-in-violation-of
17	this-part+
18	(4) THE ATTORNEY GENERAL MAY BRING AN ACTION UNDER THIS
19	SECTION IN THE NAME OF THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF MONTANA AS
20	PARENS PATRIAE ON BEHALF OF ANY PERSON RESIDING IN THE STATE
21	TO SECURE MONETARY RELIEF AS PROVIDED IN THIS SECTION FOR
22	INJURY SUSTAINED BY THE PERSON BY REASON OF ANY VIOLATION OF
23	THIS PART. THE COURT SHALL EXCLUDE FROM THE AMOUNT OF
24	MONETARY RELIEF AWARDED IN THE ACTION ANY AMOUNT OF MONETARY

RELIEF THAT DUPLICATES AMOUNTS THAT HAVE BEEN AWARDED FOR

SB 0190/02

- 1 THE SAME INJURY.
- 2 (5) IN ANY ACTION BROUGHT UNDER THIS SECTION IN WHICH
- 3 CLAIMS ARE ASSERTED BY BOTH DIRECT PURCHASERS AND INDIRECT
- PURCHASERS, THE COURT IS AUTHORIZED TO EXERCISE ITS
- 5 DISCRETION IN THE APPORTIONMENT OF DAMAGES, IN THE TRANSFER
- 6 AND CONSOLIDATION OF CASES TO AVOID THE DUPLICATION OF THE
- 7 RECOVERY OF DAMAGES AND THE MULTIPLICITY OF SUITS, AND IN
- 8 OTHER RESPECTS TO OBTAIN SUBSTANTIAL FAIRNESS.
- 9 NEW SECTION. Section 2. Repealer. Section 30-14-222,
- 10 MCA, is repealed.
- 11 NEW SECTION. Section 3. Codification instruction.
- 12 [Section 1] is intended to be codified as an integral part
- of Title 30, chapter 14, part 2, and the provisions of Title
- 14 30, chapter 14, part 2, apply to [section 1].

-End-

HOUSE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE AMENDMENT Senate Bill 190 Representative D. Brown

March 11, 1991 9:21 am Page 1 of 1

Mr. Chairman: I move to amend Senate Bill 190 (third reading copy -- blue).

And, that such amendments to Senate Bill 190 read as follows:

1. Page 1, line 17. Following: "with" Strike: "prejudgment interest," Following: "costs,"
Insert: "and" Following: "disbursements"
Strike: "and"
Insert: "."

2. Page 1, line 18. Strike: line 18 in its entirety HOUSE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE AMENDMENT Senate Bill 190 Representative Dave Brown

> March 14, 1991 2:10 pm Page 1 of 1

Mr. Chairman: I move to amend Senate Bill 190 (third reading

epresentative Dave Brown

And, that such amendments to Senate Bill 190 read as follows:

 Page 1, line 11.
 Strike: "triple" Insert: "double"

2. Page 1, line 16.
Strike: "three" Insert: "two"

HOUSE

REJECT

HOUSE

SB0190.7 551410CW.HSF

520920CW, HPD

REJECT

ADOPT

24

25

1	SENATE BILL NO. 190
2	INTRODUCED BY WEEDING, WHALEN, YELLOWTAIL, DRISCOLL,
3	O'KEEFE, GRADY, MEASURE, BRUSKI, SVRCEK, REA,
4	DOHERTY, HALLIGAN
5	
6	A BILL FOR AN ACT ENTITLED: "AN ACT REVISING THE METHOD OF
7	ENFORCEMENT AND PENALTIES FOR UNFAIR TRADE PRACTICES;
8	REPEALING SECTION 30-14-222, MCA."
9	
.0	BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF MONTANA:
11	NEW SECTION. Section 1. Injunction TETIPLE DOUBLE
L 2	damages presumption-of-injury STANDING TO BRING ACTION.
L 3	(1) Any person, including the state and any political
14	subdivision of the state, whois injured directly or
15	indirectly IN HIS BUSINESS OR PROPERTY by a violation of
16	this part shall recover three TWO times the actual damages
17	sustained, together with prejudgmentinterest, costs,
18	disbursements, and reasonable attorney fees.
19	(2) Any person, including the state and any political
20	subdivision of the state, who-is injured or threatened with
21	injury directly or indirectly IN HIS BUSINESS OR PROPERTY by
22	a violation of this part, OR THE ATTORNEY GENERAL, may bring
23	an action for appropriate injunctive relief,-including-but
	an account to appropriate milanting the same and the

not-limited-to-an-action-for-divesture-of--a--portion--of--a

corporation's--assets--if-the-court-finds-that-the-corporate

2	RELIEF AWARDED, THE COURT MAY GRANT ANY MANDATORY
3	INJUNCTIONS REASONABLY NECESSARY TO RESTORE AND PRESERVE
4	FAIR COMPETITION IN THE TRADE OR COMMERCE AFFECTED BY THE
5	VIOLATION.
6	(3) Any person, including the state and any political
7	subdivision of the state, is-presumed-to-be-injured-by-
8	violation-of-this-part HAS STANDING TO BRING AN ACTION UNDER
9	SUBSECTION (1) OR (2) if the person:
10	(a) purchases directly or indirectly from the violator;
11	(b) sells directly or indirectly to the violator: \underline{OR}
12	(c) deals in the same commodity or service as the
13	violator;-er_
14	(d)was-in-competition-with-the-violator-to-acquire-the
15	wholeor-any-part-of-the-stock-or-other-share-of-capital-of
16	another-corporation-acquired-by-the-violator-in-violation-of
17	this-part:
18	(4) THE ATTORNEY GENERAL MAY BRING AN ACTION UNDER THIS
19	SECTION IN THE NAME OF THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF MONTANA AS
20	PARENS PATRIAE ON BEHALF OF ANY PERSON RESIDING IN THE STATE
21	TO SECURE MONETARY RELIEF AS PROVIDED IN THIS SECTION FOR
22	INJURY SUSTAINED BY THE PERSON BY REASON OF ANY VIOLATION OF
23	THIS PART, THE COURT SHALL EXCLUDE FROM THE AMOUNT O
2.1	MONETARY RELIEF AWARDED IN THE ACTION ANY AMOUNT OF MONETARY

assets-are-causing-the-violation. IN ADDITION TO ANY OTHER

25

RELIEF THAT DUPLICATES AMOUNTS THAT HAVE BEEN AWARDED FOR

SB 0190/03

1 THE SAME INJURY.

- 2 (5) IN ANY ACTION BROUGHT UNDER THIS SECTION IN WHICH
- 3 CLAIMS ARE ASSERTED BY BOTH DIRECT PURCHASERS AND INDIRECT
- 4 PURCHASERS, THE COURT IS AUTHORIZED TO EXERCISE ITS
- 5 DISCRETION IN THE APPORTIONMENT OF DAMAGES, IN THE TRANSFER
- 6 AND CONSOLIDATION OF CASES TO AVOID THE DUPLICATION OF THE
- 7 RECOVERY OF DAMAGES AND THE MULTIPLICITY OF SUITS, AND IN
- 8 OTHER RESPECTS TO OBTAIN SUBSTANTIAL FAIRNESS.
- 9 NEW SECTION. Section 2. Repealer. Section 30-14-222,
- 10 MCA, is repealed.
- 11 NEW SECTION. Section 3. Codification instruction.
- 12 [Section 1] is intended to be codified as an integral part
- of Title 30, chapter 14, part 2, and the provisions of Title
- 14 30, chapter 14, part 2, apply to [section 1].

-End-

-3- SB 190



AN ACT REVISING THE METHOD OF ENFORCEMENT AND PENALTIES FOR UNFAIR TRADE PRACTICES; REPEALING SECTION 30-14-222, MCA.

BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF MONTANA:

Section 1. Injunction -- double damages -- standing to bring action. (1) Any person, including the state and any political subdivision of the state, injured directly or indirectly in his business or property by a violation of this part shall recover two times the actual damages sustained, together with costs, disbursements, and reasonable attorney fees.

- (2) Any person, including the state and any political subdivision of the state, injured or threatened with injury directly or indirectly in his business or property by a violation of this part, or the attorney general, may bring an action for appropriate injunctive relief. In addition to any other relief awarded, the court may grant any mandatory injunctions reasonably necessary to restore and preserve fair competition in the trade or commerce affected by the violation.
- (3) Any person, including the state and any political subdivision of the state, has standing to bring an action under subsection (1) or (2) if the person:
 - (a) purchases directly or indirectly from the violator;
 - (b) sells directly or indirectly to the violator; or
 - (c) deals in the same commodity or service as the violator.
 - (4) The attorney general may bring an action under this



section in the name of the people of the state of Montana as parens patriae on behalf of any person residing in the state to secure monetary relief as provided in this section for injury sustained by the person by reason of any violation of this part. The court shall exclude from the amount of monetary relief awarded in the action any amount of monetary relief that duplicates amounts that have been awarded for the same injury.

(5) In any action brought under this section in which claims are asserted by both direct purchasers and indirect purchasers, the court is authorized to exercise its discretion in the apportionment of damages, in the transfer and consolidation of cases to avoid the duplication of the recovery of damages and the multiplicity of suits, and in other respects to obtain substantial fairness.

Section 2. Repealer. Section 30-14-222, MCA, is repealed.

Section 3. Codification instruction. [Section 1] is intended to be codified as an integral part of Title 30, chapter 14, part 2, and the provisions of Title 30, chapter 14, part 2, apply to [section 1].



State of Montana Office of the Governor Helena, Montana 59620 406-444-3111

STAN STEPHENS GOVERNOR

April 8, 1991

The Honorable Joseph P. Mazurek President of the Senate State Capitol Helena, Montana 59620

The Honorable Hal Harper Speaker of the House State Capitol Helena, Montana 59620

Dear President Mazurek and Speaker Harper:

In accordance with the power vested in me as Governor by the Constitution and laws of the State of Montana, I hereby veto the adoption of Senate Bill 190, "AN ACT REVISING THE METHOD OF ENFORCEMENT AND PENALTIES FOR UNFAIR TRADE PRACTICES; REPEALING SECTION 30-14-222, MCA."

The intentions of Senate Bill 190's sponsors and proponents are laudable. Businesses of every size must have adequate protection against predatory practices of other businesses. However, Senate Bill 190 is a punitive bill aimed at the very heart of legitimate Montana businesses. By allowing suit by a remotely interested party and the pursuit of "double damages," this bill will spur an endless stream of debilitating lawsuits and create an anti-business climate for our state.

Proponents contend there is no need to fear frivolous law suits because plaintiffs would be facing financial suicide in bringing unsound actions. The provisions of this bill declare vociferously that such fear is justified. The double damages provided for in this legislation will precipitate increased litigation against businesses in Montana. Even if suits are not tried, businesses will be forced to incur additional legal expenses and will be pressured into seeking to settle cases to avoid the risk of trial. The double damage provision will be an incentive to bring suit in very weak cases.

Additionally, Senate Bill 190 allows any person to bring suit against a business if they purchase directly or indirectly, sell directly or indirectly, or deal in the same commodity or

service as the alleged violator. There are six possible groups of plaintiffs. Because the damages are doubled, there is a possibility of a recovery of twelve times the actual damages. This is the kind of potential which creates a paradise for litigation lawyers. Montana businesses cannot afford this phenomenal degree of possible liability.

Montana businesses are not naked prey to the ravages of big business as this bill would imply. Current federal anti-trust law provides more than adequate remedies for aggrieved individuals.

Senate Bill 190 runs contrary to important legal precedence. The U.S. Supreme Court (Illinois Brick Co. v. Illinois, 431 U.S. 720 (1977) prohibited indirectly injured parties from suing. The Court rejected suits by indirectly injured parties because it would expose defendants to multiple liability and would unduly burden the courts and parties with costly and prolonged trials to determine who was injured and by how much.

The one ameliorating factor in the bill is the discretion given the court to mitigate the harsh provisions of this law. However, this discretion applies only to direct purchasers and indirect purchasers but not to the other potential groups of plaintiffs. This is discriminatory and violates equal protection principles of the State and Federal Constitutions.

Numerous Montana organizations that initially supported this legislation have requested a veto. These groups include Montana Certified Public Accounts, Montana Stockgrowers, the Montana Grain Growers, Montana Automobile Dealers' Association, the Montana Wool Growers, Montana Cattlewomen, the Montana Farm Bureau and the Montana Independent Elevator Operators. They speak in a unified voice regarding this legislation.

Senate Bill 190 represents another chilling impact on the course of business in this state. Fair trade practices cases are inherently complex and legally expensive. By stimulating an increased volume of business litigation, not only would Senate Bill 190 drive up the cost of doing business in Montana, it would also represent a significant impediment to our efforts to attract new businesses to the state.

For these reasons, I find it essential to veto Senate Bill 190 and prevent Montana businesses from being litigated into oblivion.

Sincerely,

STAN STEPHENS Governor