

Montana Water Court  
PO Box 1389  
Bozeman, MT 59771-1389  
1-800-624-3270  
(406) 586-4364  
[watercourt@mt.gov](mailto:watercourt@mt.gov)

IN THE WATER COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA  
UPPER MISSOURI DIVISION  
SUN RIVER BASIN (41K)  
PRELIMINARY DECREE

\*\*\*\*\*

CLAIMANT: State of Montana Department of Fish, Wildlife & Parks

**CASE 41K-0625-R-2024**

41K 167416-00

41K 167418-00

41K 167419-00

41K 167423-00

41K 167425-00

**NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER’S REPORT**

This Master’s Report was filed with the Montana Water Court on the above stamped date. Please review this report carefully. *This Master’s Report is being re-issued to ensure the completion of the service list and that proper notice is given to the party.*

You may file a written objection to this Master’s Report within **10 days** of the stamped date if you disagree or find errors with the Master’s findings of fact, conclusions of law, or recommendations. Rule 23, W.R.Adj.R. If the Master’s Report was mailed to you, the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure allow an additional 3 days be added to the 10-day objection period. Rule 6(d), M.R.Civ.P. If you file an objection, you must serve a copy of the objection to all parties on the service list found at the end of the Master’s Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the service list must be filed with the Water Court.

If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master’s Report.

**MASTER’S REPORT**

All water right claims that appeared in the Preliminary Decree for Sun River (Basin 41K) were subject to “issue remarks” resulting from pre-decree examination by the DNRC, objections, and counterobjections. Each of the above-captioned claims received issue remarks during the DNRC’s review of the claims.

The claims were consolidated into Case 41K-0625-R-2024 and a filing deadline was issued by the Court to resolve the issue remarks.

### FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Claim 41K 167416-00 received the following substantive issue remarks:

EXISTENCE OF THE CLAIMED RESERVOIR CANNOT BE CONFIRMED WITH AVAILABLE DATA.

ACCORDING TO A LETTER RECEIVED 08/07/2020 FROM ANDY BRUMMOND, THE POINT OF DIVERSION WAS CLAIMED INCORRECTLY AND CANNOT BE AMENDED DUE TO AN EXISTING COURT CASE (40K-172).

2. On February 5, 2024, claimant State of Montana Fish Wildlife and Parks (“FWP”) filed a *Verified Motion to Amend* claim 41K 167716-00. The *Motion* addressed the above-listed issue remarks and included an *Affidavit* from FWP Water Conservation Specialist Andrew Brummond. The *Affidavit* proposes the following legal land description for the point of diversion, place of use, and reservoir location for claim 41K 167416-00:

5. Based on my review of Claim 41K 167416-00, the correct legal

land description for the point of diversion, place of use, and reservoir is the NE

NW NE Section 25, TWP 21N, RGE 8W, Lewis and Clark County.

3. Claim 41K 167418-00 received the following substantive issue remark:

PURSUANT TO WATER COURT ORDER, IF NO OBJECTIONS TO THIS CLAIM ARE FILED, THE CLAIMED VOLUME OF 3.02 ACRE-FEET WILL BE REINSTATED.

4. Claim 41K 167419-00 received the following substantive issue remark:

PURSUANT TO WATER COURT ORDER, IF NO OBJECTIONS TO THIS CLAIM ARE FILED, THE CLAIMED FLOW RATE OF 5.00 GPM AND VOLUME OF 8.10 ACRE-FEET WILL BE REINSTATED.

5. Claim 41K 167423-00 received the following substantive issue remark:

PURSUANT TO WATER COURT ORDER, IF NO OBJECTIONS TO THIS CLAIM ARE FILED, THE CLAIMED 2.5 ACRE-FEET WILL BE REINSTATED.

6. Claim 41K 167425-00 received the following substantive issue remark:  
PURSUANT TO WATER COURT ORDER, IF NO OBJECTIONS TO THIS CLAIM ARE FILED, THE CLAIMED FLOW RATE OF 5 GPM AND VOLUME OF 8.1 ACRE-FEET WILL BE REINSTATED.

7. No objections were filed to the above-listed claims.

8. Claims 41K 167419-00 received a notice-type issue remark denoting modifications made during the DNRC claims reexamination.

#### PRINCIPLES OF LAW

1. A properly filed Statement of Claim for an existing water right is prima facie proof of its content. Section 85-2-227, MCA; Rule 10, W.R.Adj.R.

2. Prima facie proof may be contradicted and overcome by a preponderance of the evidence. Rule 19, W.R.Adj.R.

3. A preponderance of the evidence is evidence that shows a fact is “more probable than not.” *Hohenlohe v. State*, 2010 MT 203, ¶ 33, 357 Mont. 438, 240 P.3d 628.

4. If prima facie status is overcome, the burden shifts back to the claimant to demonstrate historical use. *79 Ranch v. Pitsch*, 204 Mont. 426, 432-33, 666 P.2d 215, 218 (1983).

5. Section 85-2-248(2), MCA, requires that the Water Court resolve all issue remarks that are not resolved through the objection process. *See also* Rule 7, W.R.Adj.R.

6. The Water Court may use information submitted by the DNRC, the Statement of Claim, and any other data obtained by the Court to evaluate a water right. Sections 85-2-227, -231(2), MCA.

7. When resolving issue remarks, the Water Court must weigh the information resulting in the issue remark and the issue remark against the claimed water right. Section 85-2-247(2), MCA. The factual evidence on which an issue remark is based must meet the preponderance of evidence standard before the prima facie status of a claim is

overcome. 43Q 200996-00 et al., Order Establishing Volume and Order Closing Case, at 18, June 8, 2015.

### CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The proposed modifications contained in FWP's *Motion* resolves the issue remarks appearing on claim 41K 167416-00. Based on the information contained the *Motion*, the point of diversion, place of use, and reservoir location for claim 41K 167416-00 should be modified as described in Finding of Fact No. 2. The modifications resolve the issue remarks appearing on claim 41K 167416-00. The issue remarks should be removed.

2. The requested amendment and modifications do not have the reasonable potential to adversely affect other water rights as they are corrections to the abstract which do not make any change to the actual historical use of the claimed right on the ground. Notice by publication of this amendment is not required.

3. Based on the fact that no objections were filed to claims 41K 167418-00, 41K 167419-00, 41K 167423-00, and 41K 167425-00, the elements denoted in the issue remarks should be modified accordingly, and the issue remarks removed from the claims.

2. The notice-type issue remark appearing on claim 41K 167419-00 served its notice purpose and should be removed from the claim.

### RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the foregoing Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, this Master recommends that the Court modify the claims as described above and remove all issue remarks from the claims.

Post decree abstracts of the water right claims reflecting the recommended changes are attached to this Report.

**ELECTRONICALLY SIGNED AND DATED BELOW.**

**Service Via Electronic Mail:**

**Alexander R. Scolavino III**  
**Agency Legal Counsel**  
**Montana Fish, Wildlife and Parks**  
**PO Box 200701**  
**Helena, MT 59620**  
**(406) 444-3308**  
[Alexander.scolavino@mt.gov](mailto:Alexander.scolavino@mt.gov)  
[cbell@mt.gov](mailto:cbell@mt.gov)

**Service via USPS Mail:**

***Last Order:***

State of Montana Department of Fish, Wildlife & Parks  
PO Box 200701  
Helena, MT 59620

**Note: Service List Updated 4-25-24**

**POST DECREE  
ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM  
SUN RIVER  
BASIN 41K**

**Water Right Number:** 41K 167416-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

**Version:** 3 -- POST DECREE

**Status:** ACTIVE

**Owners:** MONTANA, STATE OF DEPT OF FISH WILDLIFE & PARKS  
PO BOX 200701  
HELENA, MT 59620-0701

**Priority Date:** JANUARY 1, 1948

**Type of Historical Right:** USE

**Purpose (Use):** FISH AND WILDLIFE

**Flow Rate:** A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED FOR THIS USE FROM THIS ONSTREAM RESERVOIR.

**\*Volume:** 3.20 AC-FT

THE USE OF THIS WATER APPEARS TO BE LARGELY NONCONSUMPTIVE.

**Source Name:** UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF WILLOW CREEK, NORTH FORK

**Source Type:** SURFACE WATER

**Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:**

<u>ID</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1		NENWNE	25	21N	8W	LEWIS AND CLARK

**Period of Diversion:** JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

**Diversion Means:** DAM

**Reservoir:** ONSTREAM

<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
	NENWNE	25	21N	8W	LEWIS AND CLARK

**Diversion to Reservoir:** DIVERSION # 1

**Period of Use:** JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

**Place of Use:**

<u>ID</u>	<u>Acres</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1			NENWNE	25	21N	8W	LEWIS AND CLARK

**POST DECREE  
ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM  
SUN RIVER  
BASIN 41K**

**Water Right Number:** 41K 167418-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

**Version:** 3 -- POST DECREE

**Status:** ACTIVE

**Owners:** MONTANA, STATE OF DEPT OF FISH WILDLIFE & PARKS  
PO BOX 200701  
HELENA, MT 59620-0701

**Priority Date:** JANUARY 1, 1948

**Type of Historical Right:** USE

**Purpose (Use):** FISH AND WILDLIFE

**Flow Rate:** A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED FOR THIS USE FROM THIS ONSTREAM RESERVOIR.

**\*Volume:** 3.02 AC-FT

THE USE OF THIS WATER APPEARS TO BE LARGELY NONCONSUMPTIVE.

**Source Name:** UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF SUN RIVER

**Source Type:** SURFACE WATER

**Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:**

<u>ID</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1		SWSW	10	21N	8W	LEWIS AND CLARK

**Period of Diversion:** JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

**Diversion Means:** DAM

**Reservoir:** ONSTREAM

<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
	SWSW	10	21N	8W	LEWIS AND CLARK

**Diversion to Reservoir:** DIVERSION # 1

**Period of Use:** JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

**Place of Use:**

<u>ID</u>	<u>Acres</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1			SWSW	10	21N	8W	LEWIS AND CLARK

**POST DECREE  
ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM  
SUN RIVER  
BASIN 41K**

**Water Right Number:** 41K 167419-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

**Version:** 3 -- POST DECREE

**Status:** ACTIVE

**Owners:** MONTANA, STATE OF DEPT OF FISH WILDLIFE & PARKS  
PO BOX 200701  
HELENA, MT 59620-0701

**Priority Date:** JANUARY 1, 1948

**Type of Historical Right:** USE

**Purpose (Use):** FISH AND WILDLIFE

**\*Flow Rate:** 5.00 GPM

**\*Volume:** 8.10 AC-FT

**Source Name:** SPRING, UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF SUN RIVER

**Source Type:** GROUNDWATER

**Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:**

<u>ID</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1		SENE	5	21N	8W	LEWIS AND CLARK

**Period of Diversion:** JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

**Diversion Means:** SUMP

A PIPELINE IS USED TO CONVEY WATER.

**Period of Use:** JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

**Place of Use:**

<u>ID</u>	<u>Acres</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1			SENE	5	21N	8W	LEWIS AND CLARK



**POST DECREE  
ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM  
SUN RIVER  
BASIN 41K**

**Water Right Number:** 41K 167423-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

**Version:** 3 -- POST DECREE

**Status:** ACTIVE

**Owners:** MONTANA, STATE OF DEPT OF FISH WILDLIFE & PARKS  
PO BOX 200701  
HELENA, MT 59620-0701

**Priority Date:** JANUARY 1, 1948

**Type of Historical Right:** USE

**Purpose (Use):** FISH AND WILDLIFE

**Flow Rate:** A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED FOR THIS USE FROM THIS ONSTREAM RESERVOIR.

**\*Volume:** 2.50 AC-FT

THE USE OF THIS WATER APPEARS TO BE LARGELY NONCONSUMPTIVE.

**Source Name:** UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF SUN RIVER

**Source Type:** SURFACE WATER

**Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:**

<u>ID</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1		NWNWNE	15	21N	8W	LEWIS AND CLARK

**Period of Diversion:** JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

**Diversion Means:** DAM

**Reservoir:** ONSTREAM

<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
	NWNWNE	15	21N	8W	LEWIS AND CLARK

**Diversion to Reservoir:** DIVERSION # 1

**Period of Use:** JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

**Place of Use:**

<u>ID</u>	<u>Acres</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1			NWNWNE	15	21N	8W	LEWIS AND CLARK

**POST DECREE  
ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM  
SUN RIVER  
BASIN 41K**

**Water Right Number:** 41K 167425-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

**Version:** 3 -- POST DECREE

**Status:** ACTIVE

**Owners:** MONTANA, STATE OF DEPT OF FISH WILDLIFE & PARKS  
PO BOX 200701  
HELENA, MT 59620-0701

**Priority Date:** JANUARY 1, 1948

**Type of Historical Right:** USE

**Purpose (Use):** FISH AND WILDLIFE

**\*Flow Rate:** 5.00 GPM

**\*Volume:** 8.10 AC-FT

THE USE OF THIS WATER APPEARS TO BE LARGELY NONCONSUMPTIVE.

**Source Name:** SPRING, UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF SUN RIVER

**Source Type:** GROUNDWATER

**Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:**

<u>ID</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1		SESESW	3	21N	8W	LEWIS AND CLARK

**Period of Diversion:** JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

**Diversion Means:** INSTREAM

**Period of Use:** JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

**Place of Use:**

<u>ID</u>	<u>Acres</u>	<u>Govt Lot</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1			SESESW	3	21N	8W	LEWIS AND CLARK