Montana Water Court PO Box 1389 Bozeman, MT 59771-1389 1-800-624-3270 (406) 586-4364 watercourt@mt.gov FILED
04/05/2024
Sara Calkins
CLERK
Montana Water Court
STATE OF MONTANA
By: D'Ann CIGLER
41K-0624-R-2024
White, Eugene
3.00

IN THE WATER COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA
UPPER MISSOURI DIVISION
SUN RIVER BASIN (41K)
PRELIMINARY DECREE

CLAIMANT: State of Montana Board of Land Commissioners

CASE 41K-0624-R-2024 41K 34899-00 41K 34934-00

NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER'S REPORT

This Master's Report was filed with the Montana Water Court on the above stamped date. Please review this report carefully.

You may file a written objection to this Master's Report within **10 days** of the stamped date if you disagree or find errors with the Master's findings of fact, conclusion of law, or recommendations. Rule 23, W.R.Adj.R. If the Master's Report was mailed to you, the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure allow an additional 3 days be added to the 10-day objection period. Rule 6(d), M.R.Civ.P. If you file an objection, you must serve a copy of the objection to all parties on the service list found at the end of the Master's Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the service list must be filed with the Water Court.

If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master's Report.

MASTER'S REPORT

All water right claims that appeared in the Preliminary Decree for Sun River (Basin 41K) were subject to "issue remarks" resulting from pre-decree examination by the DNRC, objections, and counterobjections. Claims 41K 34899-00 and 41K 34934-00 each received issue remarks during the DNRC's review of the claims. The claims were

consolidated into Case 41K-0624-R-2024 and an Order Setting Filing Deadline was issued by the Water Court to resolve the issue remarks.

FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Each of the above-captioned claims received the following substantive issue remark:

THE FLOW RATE IS MISSING.

2. On January 10, 2024, the Water Court consolidated the claims and issued an Order Setting Filing Deadline. Nothing was filed at the ordered deadline by the Claimant. The Order Setting Filing Deadline included the following language regarding the above-listed issue remarks:

ORDERED that the Claimant review this order and, *if necessary*, file a statement of why the flow rate for claim 41K 34899-00 and claim 41K 34934-00 should not be modified to their originally claimed flow rate by **Wednesday**, **February 14**, **2024**. *If nothing is filed by the deadline, this Master will conclude that the Claimant agrees to the proposed modifications to the flow rate of claim 41K 33899-00 and claim 41K 34934-00, the flow rate of claim 41K 34899-00 will be modified to 15.00 gpm and the flow rate of claim 41K 34934-00 modified to 3.00 gpm, and the issue remarks will be removed from the claims.*

PRINCIPLES OF LAW

- 1. A properly filed Statement of Claim for an existing water right is prima facie proof of its content. Section 85-2-227, MCA; Rule 10, W.R.Adj.R.
- 2. Prima facie proof may be contradicted and overcome by a preponderance of the evidence. Rule 19, W.R.Adj.R.
- 3. A preponderance of the evidence is evidence that shows a fact is "more probable than not." *Hohenlohe v. State*, 2010 MT 203, ¶ 33, 357 Mont. 438, 240 P.3d 628.
- 4. If prima facie status is overcome, the burden shifts back to the claimant to demonstrate historical use. *79 Ranch v. Pitsch*, 204 Mont. 426, 432-33, 666 P.2d 215, 218 (1983).

5. Section 85-2-248(2), MCA, requires that the Water Court resolve all issue remarks that are not resolved through the objection process. *See also* Rule 7, W.R.Adj.R.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The information in the record resolves the flow rate issue remarks appearing on claims 41K 34899-00 and 41K 34934-00. Because nothing was filed at the filing deadline by the Claimant, a preponderance of the evidence shows that the flow rate of claim 41K 34899-00 should be modified to 15.00 gpm, the flow rate of claim 41K 34934-00 modified to 3.00 gpm, and the issue remarks should be removed from the claims.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the foregoing Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, this Water Master recommends that the Court modify the flow of each claim as described in Conclusion of Law No. 1 and remove the issue remarks from the claims.

Post decree abstracts of the water right claims reflecting the recommended changes are attached to this Report.

ELECTRONICALLY SIGNED AND DATED BELOW.

Service Via Electronic Mail:

Ben Eckstein
Aislinn Brown
Terisa Oomens
Agency Legal Services Bureau
PO Box 201440
Helena MT 59620-1440
(406) 444-5857
blcwatercourt@mt.gov
Aislinn.brown@mt.gov
Terisa.Oomens@mt.gov
Kayla.Churchill@mt.gov

\JUDHLNSRV-DATA\Share\JUDGALH2OSRV (Datavol)\Share\WC-BASIN FOLDERS\41K PD\41K Cases\624\41K-0624-R-2024 MR (multiple claims, no response to FD make changes to flow rate of claims) 3-29-24 jbc.docx

POST DECREE

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

SUN RIVER

BASIN 41K

Water Right Number: 41K 34899-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

Version: 3 -- POST DECREE

Status: ACTIVE

Owners: MONTANA STATE BOARD OF LAND COMMISSIONERS

TRUST LAND MANAGEMENT DIVISION

PO BOX 201601

HELENA, MT 59620-1601

Priority Date: MARCH 4, 1889

Type of Historical Right: FILED

Purpose (Use): DOMESTIC
*Flow Rate: 15.00 GPM

Volume: 5.00 AC-FT

Households: 1

Maximum Acres: 2.00

Source Name: SPRING, UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF DRY CREEK

Source Type: GROUNDWATER

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

<u>ID</u> <u>Govt Lot</u> <u>Qtr Sec</u> <u>Sec</u> <u>Twp</u> <u>Rge</u> <u>County</u>

1 NWNENW 16 19N 5W LEWIS AND CLARK

Period of Diversion: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

Diversion Means: FLOWING

Period of Use: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

Place of Use:

ID Acres Govt Lot Otr Sec Sec Twp Rge County

1 2.00 SWSESW 9 19N 5W LEWIS AND CLARK

Total: 2.00

Remarks:

THE WATER RIGHTS LISTED FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE MULTIPLE USES OF THE SAME RIGHT. THE USE OF THIS RIGHT FOR SEVERAL PURPOSES DOES NOT INCREASE THE EXTENT OF THE WATER RIGHT. RATHER IT DECREES THE RIGHT TO ALTERNATE AND EXCHANGE THE USE (PURPOSE) OF THE WATER IN ACCORD WITH HISTORICAL PRACTICES.

34899-00 34932-00

POST DECREE

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

SUN RIVER

BASIN 41K

Water Right Number: 41K 34934-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

Version: 3 -- POST DECREE

Status: ACTIVE

Owners: MONTANA STATE BOARD OF LAND COMMISSIONERS

TRUST LAND MANAGEMENT DIVISION

PO BOX 201601

HELENA, MT 59620-1601

Priority Date: APRIL 15, 1914

Type of Historical Right: FILED

Purpose (Use): STOCK

*Flow Rate: 3.00 GPM

Volume: THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR

STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND

HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.

Source Name: SPRING, UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF SIMMS CREEK, SOUTH FORK

Source Type: GROUNDWATER

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

ID Govt Lot Qtr Sec Sec Twp Rge County

1 NWNENW 24 19N 4W LEWIS AND CLARK

Period of Diversion: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

Diversion Means: DEVELOPED SPRING

Period of Use: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

Place of Use:

ID Acres Govt Lot Qtr Sec Sec Twp Rge County

1 NWNENW 24 19N 4W LEWIS AND CLARK